



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	COTTON, Minnesota	Accident Number:	CHI95LA090
Date & Time:	February 18, 1995, 15:00 Local	Registration:	N52172
Aircraft:	CESSNA 180J	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	1 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

THE PILOT LANDED ON A FROZEN LAKE AND FELT HE WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO STOP THE AIRPLANE IN THE DISTANCE AVAILABLE. HE ABORTED THE LANDING AND WAS UNABLE TO CLEAR THE TREES AT THE EDGE OF THE LAKE. THE AIRPLANE CONTACTED THE TREE TOPS AND DESCENDED TO IMPACT WITH THE TERRAIN.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the pilot's failure to gain sufficient clearance over the trees during the aborted landing.

Findings

Occurrence #1: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT
Phase of Operation: TAKEOFF - INITIAL CLIMB

Findings

1. ABORTED LANDING - PERFORMED - PILOT IN COMMAND
2. OBJECT - TREE(S)
3. (C) CLEARANCE - NOT OBTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #2: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER
Phase of Operation: DESCENT - UNCONTROLLED

Factual Information

On February 18, 1995, at 1500 central standard time, a Cessna 180J, N52172, registered to Flossie Telin and piloted by a private pilot collided with trees during an aborted landing on Upper Bug Lake, Cotton, Minnesota, while on a personal flight. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed and no flight plan was filed. The airplane was substantially damaged and the pilot was not injured. The flight originated from Duluth, Minnesota, on February 18, 1995, at 1430.

The pilot reported that he landed the airplane on a snow covered/frozen lake and felt he would not be able to stop in the available distance. He stated he executed an aborted landing and failed to clear tree tops along the edge of the lake. The airplane contacted the trees and settled through the trees to impact the terrain.

The pilot reported to an Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) Inspector that he avoided the river channel portion of the river which left him with approximately 1,000 feet of lake on which to land. The FAA Inspector stated that the landing area available did not appear to be 1,000 feet.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	68, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Single-engine sea	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medical--w/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	September 1, 1993
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	1136 hours (Total, all aircraft), 260 hours (Total, this make and model), 1068 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	CESSNA	Registration:	N52172
Model/Series:	180J 180J	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	18052535
Landing Gear Type:	Tailwheel	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	August 7, 1994 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3190 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	7 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	4077 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	CONTINENTAL
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	O-470
Registered Owner:	FLOSSIE TELIN	Rated Power:	230 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 3000 ft AGL	Visibility	15 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	0°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:		Temperature/Dew Point:	-2°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	DULUTH , MN (D36)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:		Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	14:30 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:		Runway Surface Type:	Ice
Airport Elevation:		Runway Surface Condition:	Ice
Runway Used:	0	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	Go around

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	47.159549,-92.470947(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Sullivan, Pamela
Additional Participating Persons:	JAMES C FULWOOD; MINNEAPOLIS , MN
Original Publish Date:	September 24, 1995
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=9840

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).