

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location: Queens, New York **Accident Number**: DCA18CA165

Date & Time: May 1, 2018, 14:53 Local Registration: N606LR

Aircraft: BOMBARDIER INC CL600 2D24 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

Defining Event: Ground collision **Injuries:** 60 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 121: Air carrier - Scheduled

Analysis

On May 1, 2018, at about 2:53 pm EDT, an Endeavor 3413, CRJ900, N606LR, was struck by Delta 212, B767-300ER, N172DN, while awaiting to be marshalled into the gate at John F. Kennedy International Airport (KJFK), Queens, New York. Both flights were operating under 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 121 as regularly scheduled passenger flights. Day visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident.

According to flight crew statements, both airplanes conducted normal landings and were cleared to taxi to their respective gates. Delta 212 was taxing to gate B30 and following behind Endeavor 3413 as it turned into gate B30. The captain of Endeavor 3413 stated that he had stopped short of the gate to await the ground crew. The captain of Delta 212 indicated that as they approached the airplane, he noticed that the wing walkers had stopped the Endeavor airplane prior to its gate, and so he stopped prior to entering the ramp area. When the Endeavor airplane started to move forward into the gate, he began to slowly taxi behind it, however, the captain indicated that he lost sight of airplane out the right window. He indicated that he turned slight to the left (away from Endeavor 3413) after his first officer advised him to provide additional clearance to ensure adequate separation. After he thought they would be safety clear of the airplane, he then turned back onto the taxiway centerline. As the airplane continued taxiing to the gate, the Delta flight crew heard over ramp control that they had struck Endeavor 3413. After parking, both airplanes were inspected and it was found that Delta 212's right winglet sustained minor damage and Endeavor 3413 sustained substantial damage to its horizontal and vertical stabilizer.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the failure of the captain of Delta 212 to ensure adequate clearance while taxiing behind Endeavor 3413.

Findings

Personnel issues

Decision making/judgment - Pilot of other aircraft

Page 2 of 10 DCA18CA165

Factual Information

History of Flight

Standing Ground collision (Defining event)	Standing	Ground collision (Defining event)	
--	----------	-----------------------------------	--

Information

Certificate:	Age:
Airplane Rating(s):	Seat Occupied:
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	Restraint Used:
Instrument Rating(s):	Second Pilot Present:
Instructor Rating(s):	Toxicology Performed:
Medical Certification:	Last FAA Medical Exam:
Occupational Pilot:	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:
Flight Time:	

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	BOMBARDIER INC	Registration:	N606LR
Model/Series:	CL600 2D24 900	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	2008	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Transport	Serial Number:	15173
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	81
Date/Type of Last Inspection:		Certified Max Gross Wt.:	
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	2 Turbo fan
Airframe Total Time:	24222 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	GE
ELT:	C126 installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	CF34-8C5
Registered Owner:	DELTA AIR LINES INC	Rated Power:	
Operator:	Endeavor Air	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	Flag carrier (121)

Page 3 of 10 DCA18CA165

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KJFK	Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:	18:29 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Few	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:		Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	15 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	200°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.04 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	23°C / 1°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:		Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	Queens, NY (JFK)	Type of Clearance:	IFR
Departure Time:	12:41 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class B

Airport Information

Airport:	John F Kennedy Intl JFK	Runway Surface Type:	
Airport Elevation:	13 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	
Runway Used:		IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	None

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	4 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	56 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	60 None	Latitude, Longitude:	40.64389,-73.781944(est)

Page 4 of 10 DCA18CA165

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Ward, Effie Lorenda
Additional Participating Persons:	Shannon Masters; Delta; Atlanta, GA Todd Tilbury; Endeavor Air
Original Publish Date:	July 8, 2020
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=97158

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 5 of 10 DCA18CA165



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location: Queens, New York Accident Number: DCA18CA165

Date & Time: May 1, 2018, 14:53 Local Registration: N172DN

Aircraft: Boeing 767 332 Aircraft Damage: Minor

Defining Event: Ground collision **Injuries:** 216 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 121: Air carrier - Scheduled

Analysis

On May 1, 2018, at about 2:53 pm EDT, an Endeavor 3413, CRJ900, N606LR, was struck by Delta 212, B767-300ER, N172DN, while awaiting to be marshalled into the gate at John F. Kennedy International Airport (KJFK), Queens, New York. Both flights were operating under 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 121 as regularly scheduled passenger flights. Day visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident.

According to flight crew statements, both airplanes conducted normal landings and were cleared to taxi to their respective gates. Delta 212 was taxing to gate B30 and following behind Endeavor 3413 as it turned into gate B30. The captain of Endeavor 3413 stated that he had stopped short of the gate to await the ground crew. The captain of Delta 212 indicated that as they approached the airplane, he noticed that the wing walkers had stopped the Endeavor airplane prior to its gate, and so he stopped prior to entering the ramp area. When the Endeavor airplane started to move forward into the gate, he began to slowly taxi behind it, however, the captain indicated that he lost sight of airplane out the right window. He indicated that he turned slight to the left (away from Endeavor 3413) after his first officer advised him to provide additional clearance to ensure adequate separation. After he thought they would be safety clear of the airplane, he then turned back onto the taxiway centerline. As the airplane continued taxiing to the gate, the Delta flight crew heard over ramp control that they had struck Endeavor 3413. After parking, both airplanes were inspected and it was found that Delta 212's right winglet sustained minor damage and Endeavor 3413 sustained substantial damage to its horizontal and vertical stabilizer.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

the failure of the captain of Delta 212 to ensure adequate clearance while taxiing behind Endeavor 3413.

Findings

Personnel issues

Decision making/judgment - Pilot

Page 7 of 10 DCA18CA165

Factual Information

History of Flight

Taxi	Ground collision

Information

Certificate:	Age:
Airplane Rating(s):	Seat Occupied:
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	Restraint Used:
Instrument Rating(s):	Second Pilot Present:
Instructor Rating(s):	Toxicology Performed:
Medical Certification:	Last FAA Medical Exam:
Occupational Pilot:	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:
Flight Time:	

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Boeing	Registration:	N172DN
Model/Series:	767 332 332	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	1990	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Transport	Serial Number:	24775
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	224
Date/Type of Last Inspection:		Certified Max Gross Wt.:	348220 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	2 Turbo jet
Airframe Total Time:	123372 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Pratt & Whitney
ELT:	C126 installed	Engine Model/Series:	4060-3
Registered Owner:	DELTA AIR LINES INC	Rated Power:	
Operator:	Delta Air Lines	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	Flag carrier (121)

Page 8 of 10 DCA18CA165

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KJFK	Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:	18:29 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Few	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:		Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	15 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	200°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.04 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	23°C / 1°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	Nice (LFMN)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	New York, NY (KJFK)	Type of Clearance:	IFR
Departure Time:	12:15 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class B

Airport Information

Airport:	John F Kennedy Intl JFK	Runway Surface Type:	
Airport Elevation:	13 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	
Runway Used:		IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	None

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	11 None	Aircraft Damage:	Minor
Passenger Injuries:	205 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	216 None	Latitude, Longitude:	40.64389,-73.781944(est)

Page 9 of 10 DCA18CA165

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Ward, Effie Lorenda
Additional Participating Persons:	Shannon Masters; Delta; Atlanta, GA Todd Tilbury; Endeavor Air
Original Publish Date:	July 8, 2020
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note: This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as descrito the NTSB.	
Investigation Docket: https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=97158	

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 10 of 10 DCA18CA165