



# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

Location: Port Mansfield, Texas Accident Number: CEN18LA017

Date & Time: October 19, 2017, 13:00 Local Registration: N633CB

Aircraft: Piper PA 32RT-300T Aircraft Damage: Substantial

**Defining Event:** Landing gear collapse **Injuries:** 3 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

## **Analysis**

The private pilot stated that, during landing, he pitched the airplane's nose up "slightly" and reduced engine power before the main landing gear wheels touched down on the runway. The nosewheel landing gear then touched down and collapsed.

Postaccident examination of the nosewheel landing gear revealed that the trunnion casting was fractured. Metallurgical examination of the trunnion casting revealed fractures consistent with overstress. No evidence of preexisting cracks was observed on any of the fracture surfaces. No other mechanical malfunctions or failures that would have precluded normal operation were noted. Therefore, it is likely that the pilot did not properly flare the airplane, which led to a hard landing and the subsequent collapse of the nosewheel landing gear.

## **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The pilot's improper landing flare, which led to a hard landing and the subsequent collapse of the nosewheel landing gear due to the overstress failure of the nosewheel landing gear trunnion casting.

# **Findings**

Aircraft

Nose/tail gear strut/axle - Capability exceeded

Page 2 of 6 CEN18LA017

### **Factual Information**

### **History of Flight**

Landing-flare/touchdown Landing gear collapse (Defining event)

On October 19, 2017, at 1300 central daylight time, a Piper PA-32RT-300T airplane, N633CB, experienced a nose landing gear collapse and an impact with a taxiway surface during an after-landing taxi at Charles R Johnson Airport (T05), Port Mansfield, Texas. The airplane sustained substantial fuselage damage. The private pilot and a commercial pilot were uninjured. The airplane was registered to PKJ Aviation LLC and operated by the pilot under Title 14 Code of Federal Regulations as a part 91 personal flight. The flight was operating on an instrument rules flight plan. Day visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The flight departed from Conroe-North Houston Regional Airport, Houston, Texas, at 1041 and was destined to T05.

The private pilot stated that he had pitched the nose up "slightly" and reduced engine power prior to the main landing gear wheels touching down on the runway. The nose wheel landing gear then touched down and collapsed.

Post-accident examination of the nose landing gear revealed a fractured trunnion casting. Metallurgical examination of the trunnion casting revealed fractures consistent with overstress. No evidence of preexisting cracks was observed on any of the fracture surfaces. No other mechanical anomalies that would have precluded normal airplane operation were noted.

### **Pilot Information**

| Certificate:              | Private  | Age:                              | 56,Male          |
|---------------------------|--|-----------------------------------|------------------|
| Airplane Rating(s):       | Single-engine land   | Seat Occupied:                    | Left             |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None   | Restraint Used:                   | 3-point          |
| Instrument Rating(s):     | None   | Second Pilot Present:             | No               |
| Instructor Rating(s):     | None   | Toxicology Performed:             | No               |
| Medical Certification:    | BasicMed Unknown   | Last FAA Medical Exam:            |                  |
| Occupational Pilot:       | No   | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | January 26, 2017 |
| Flight Time:              | 100 hours (Total, all aircraft), 57 hours (Total, this make and model) |                                   |                  |

Page 3 of 6 CEN18LA017

# **Co-pilot Information**

| Certificate:              | Commercial  | Age:                              | 27,Male           |
|---------------------------|---|-----------------------------------|-------------------|
| Airplane Rating(s):       | Single-engine land; Multi-engine land                                   | Seat Occupied:                    | Right             |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None  | Restraint Used:                   | 3-point           |
| Instrument Rating(s):     | Airplane  | Second Pilot Present:             | No                |
| Instructor Rating(s):     | None  | Toxicology Performed:             | No                |
| Medical Certification:    | Class 1 Without waivers/limitations                                     | Last FAA Medical Exam:            | May 19, 2017      |
| Occupational Pilot:       | Yes   | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | September 8, 2016 |
| Flight Time:              | 796 hours (Total, all aircraft), 234 hours (Total, this make and model) |                                   |                   |

# **Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information**

| Aircraft Make:                   | Piper                           | Registration:                     | N633CB          |
|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Model/Series:                    | PA 32RT-300T 300T               | Aircraft Category:                | Airplane        |
| Year of Manufacture:             | 1978                            | Amateur Built:                    |                 |
| Airworthiness Certificate:       | Normal                          | Serial Number:                    | 32R-7887158     |
| Landing Gear Type:               | Retractable - Tricycle          | Seats:                            | 6               |
| Date/Type of Last<br>Inspection: | April 21, 2017 Annual           | Certified Max Gross Wt.:          | 3600 lbs        |
| Time Since Last Inspection:      |                                 | Engines:                          | 1 Reciprocating |
| Airframe Total Time:             | 4050.31 Hrs at time of accident | Engine Manufacturer:              | Lycoming        |
| ELT:                             | Installed, not activated        | Engine Model/Series:              | TIO-540-S1AD    |
| Registered Owner:                | PKJ AVIATION LLC                | Rated Power:                      | 300 Horsepower  |
| Operator:                        | Pilot                           | Operating Certificate(s)<br>Held: | None            |
|                                  |                                 |                                   |                 |

Page 4 of 6 CEN18LA017

# Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site:     | Visual (VMC)                     | Condition of Light:                  | Day               |
|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------|
| Observation Facility, Elevation: | HRL,36 ft msl                    | Distance from Accident Site:         | 23 Nautical Miles |
| Observation Time:                | 12:30 Local                      | Direction from Accident Site:        | 203°              |
| <b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>   | Scattered / 2900 ft AGL          | Visibility                           | 10 miles          |
| Lowest Ceiling:                  | Overcast / 3000 ft AGL           | Visibility (RVR):                    |                   |
| Wind Speed/Gusts:                | 9 knots /                        | Turbulence Type<br>Forecast/Actual:  | None / None       |
| Wind Direction:                  | 110°                             | Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual: | N/A / N/A         |
| Altimeter Setting:               |                                  | Temperature/Dew Point:               |                   |
| Precipitation and Obscuration:   | No Obscuration; No Precipitation |                                      |                   |
| Departure Point:                 | Houston, TX (CXO)                | Type of Flight Plan Filed:           | IFR               |
| Destination:                     | Port Mansfield, TX (T05)         | Type of Clearance:                   | IFR               |
| Departure Time:                  | 10:41 Local                      | Type of Airspace:                    | Class G           |
|                                  |                                  |                                      |                   |

# **Airport Information**

| Airport:             | Charles R Johnson Airport T05 | Runway Surface Type:             | Asphalt                   |
|----------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------------|---------------------------|
| Airport Elevation:   | 10 ft msl                     | <b>Runway Surface Condition:</b> | Dry                       |
| Runway Used:         | 12                            | IFR Approach:                    | None                      |
| Runway Length/Width: | 3200 ft / 50 ft               | VFR Approach/Landing:            | Full stop;Traffic pattern |

# Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries:         | 2 None | Aircraft Damage:        | Substantial               |
|------------------------|--------|-------------------------|---------------------------|
| Passenger<br>Injuries: | 1 None | Aircraft Fire:          | None                      |
| Ground Injuries:       | N/A    | Aircraft Explosion:     | None                      |
| Total Injuries:        | 3 None | Latitude,<br>Longitude: | 26.560277,-97.439163(est) |

Page 5 of 6 CEN18LA017

#### **Administrative Information**

| Investigator In Charge (IIC):        | Gallo, Mitchell   |
|--------------------------------------|---|
| Additional Participating<br>Persons: | Carl Newton; Federal Aviation Administration; SAT FSDO; San Antonio, TX |
| Original Publish Date:               | November 6, 2019  |
| Last Revision Date:                  |   |
| Investigation Class:                 | <u>Class</u>  |
| Note:                                | The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.                  |
| Investigation Docket:                | https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=96230                            |
|                                      |   |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 6 of 6 CEN18LA017