



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Raeford, North Carolina	Accident Number:	ERA16LA059
Date & Time:	December 3, 2015, 11:20 Local	Registration:	N216PK
Aircraft:	PACIFIC AEROSPACE CORP LTD 750XL	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Landing area overshoot	Injuries:	1 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Skydiving		

Analysis

The commercial pilot of the single-engine turboprop airplane reported that he was preparing to release skydivers when he noticed that the engine torque indication was in the red arc. Specifically, the gauge was indicating a torque of 70 pounds per square inch (psi) when it should have been indicating about 25 psi; the maximum allowed torque indication was 64.5 psi. The skydivers jumped uneventfully. As the pilot was returning to the airport, the torque gauge was indicating 80 psi while the engine was at idle. At that time, the pilot decided to perform a precautionary engine shutdown and land with no engine power. During the landing, the airplane was fast and touched down about halfway down the 3,402-ft-long asphalt runway. The pilot applied heavy braking, but the airplane traveled about 1,000 ft beyond the departure end of the runway before coming to rest upright in a field with a collapsed left main landing gear.

Two examinations of the engine did not reveal any preimpact anomalies or evidence of overtorque. A test of the torque-indicating transducer and gauge also did not reveal any anomalies. The examinations did reveal that an automotive-type wiring bundle was used to wire the torque transducer to the airplane's electrical system. Although it is possible that the wiring bundle could have caused an intermittent faulty torque indication, subsequent testing was unable to duplicate the problem. The airplane was manufactured about 10 years before the accident, and the torque meter manufacturer upgraded the wiring connectors about 4 years before the accident.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The pilot's failure to obtain the proper touchdown point and speed during a precautionary landing with the engine shut down. Contributing to the accident was an erroneous engine torque indication, which led the pilot to shut the engine down, for reasons that could not be determined during postaccident testing.

Findings	
Aircraft	Descent/approach/glide path - Not attained/maintained
Personnel issues	Decision making/judgment - Pilot
Personnel issues	Aircraft control - Pilot
Not determined	(general) - Unknown/Not determined

Factual Information

History of Flight

Enroute-cruise	Miscellaneous/other	
Enroute-cruise	Engine shutdown	
Emergency descent	Landing area overshoot (Defining event)	
Landing	Runway excursion	
Landing	Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)	

On December 3, 2015, about 1120 eastern standard time, a Pacific Aerospace 750XL, N216PK, registered to and operated by Paraclete Aviation LLC., was substantially damaged during a precautionary landing at P K Airpark (5W4), Raeford, North Carolina. The commercial pilot was not injured. The commercial skydiving flight was conducted under the provisions of 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed and no flight plan was filed for the local flight, which departed 5W4 about 1100.

The pilot reported that the airplane was at 13,000 feet mean sea level (msl) as he was preparing to release the skydivers. He then noticed that the torque gauge was in the red arc and indicated a torque of 70 psi when it should have indicated about 25 psi; the maximum allowed torque indication was 64.5 psi. The pilot notified the skydivers of the anomaly and told them to jump, which they did uneventfully. As the pilot was approaching 5W4 for a normal landing, the airplane was at 9,000 feet msl and the torque gauge indicated 80 psi while the engine was at idle. At that time he decided to perform a precautionary engine shutdown to prevent catastrophic engine failure. The pilot further stated that during the landing with no engine power, the airplane was fast and touched down about halfway down runway 4, a 3,402-foot-long asphalt runway. The pilot applied heavy braking, but the airplane traveled about 1,000 feet beyond the departure end of the runway, before coming to rest upright in a field with a collapsed left main landing gear.

Examination of the wreckage by a Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) inspector revealed substantial damage to both wings. The airplane was manufactured in 2005 and equipped with a Pratt and Whitney PT6A-34 turboprop engine. Subsequent examination of the engine by the FAA inspector and a representative from the engine manufacturer did not reveal any preimpact anomalies or evidence of overtorque. A "dead weight" test was then performed, to simulate pressure from the engine and test the torque indicating transducer and gauge. The test was performed satisfactorily and no anomalies were noted with the transducer or gauge.

The operator subsequently performed a second examination of the engine due to a propeller strike during the precautionary landing. That examination also did not reveal any evidence of overtorque or anything that would have caused a faulty torque indication. The examinations did note that an automotive-type wiring bundle was used to wire the torque transducer to the airplane's electrical system. Although the results of the "dead weight" were satisfactory, the test may not have been able to detect an intermittent wiring anomaly. Additionally, the airplane manufacturer reported that the torque meter

manufacturer upgraded the wiring about 4 years prior to the accident, from spade connectors to overlap connectors.

Pope Army Airfield (POB), Fayetteville, North Carolina, was located about 12 miles northeast of the accident site. The recorded weather at POB, at 1118, included wind from 360 degrees at 10 knots, clear sky, and visibility 10 miles.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	25,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	4-point
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 Without waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	August 26, 2015
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	September 1, 2015
Flight Time:	379 hours (Total, all aircraft), 42 hours (Total, this make and model), 309 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 63 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 27 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 0 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	PACIFIC AEROSPACE CORP LTD	Registration:	N216PK
Model/Series:	750XL NO SERIES	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	2005	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	114
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	18
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	September 5, 2015 Continuous airworthiness	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	7500 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	107 Hrs	Engines:	1 Turbo prop
Airframe Total Time:	4213 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Pratt & Whitney
ELT:	C126 installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	PT6A-34
Registered Owner:	PARACLETE AVIATION LLC	Rated Power:	750 Horsepower
Operator:	PARACLETE AVIATION LLC	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	POB,218 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	12 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	11:18 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	40°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	10 knots / None	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/ None
Wind Direction:	360°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/ N/A
Altimeter Setting:	30.17 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	10°C / -2°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Raeford, NC (5W4)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Raeford, NC (5W4)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	11:00 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	P K Airport 5W4	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	304 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	4	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	3402 ft / 60 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop;Precautionary landing;Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	35.019721,-79.191108(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Gretz, Robert
Additional Participating Persons:	John Combrinck-Graham; FAA/FSDO; Greensboro, NC
Original Publish Date:	January 18, 2017
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=92398

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available <u>here</u>.