



# Aviation Investigation Final Report

---

<b>Location:</b>	Gary, Indiana	<b>Accident Number:</b>	CEN15LA415
<b>Date &amp; Time:</b>	September 10, 2015, 20:35 Local	<b>Registration:</b>	N4199S
<b>Aircraft:</b>	Beech 58	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Defining Event:</b>	Landing gear collapse	<b>Injuries:</b>	1 None
<b>Flight Conducted Under:</b>	Part 135: Air taxi & commuter - Non-scheduled		

---

## Analysis

The pilot reported that he lowered the landing gear about 5 miles from the airport while flying an instrument approach. While on short final and as he was turning off the airplane's positioning lights so that the landing gear indicator lights would brighten, the propellers struck the runway, indicating that he likely loss situational awareness of the airplane's altitude above the runway. The airplane then skidded on its belly on the runway. The examination of the airplane revealed that the wing spar sustained substantial damage. The nose landing gear (NLG) doors sustained scraping damage consistent with the NLG being retracted upon touchdown.

During postaccident examinations, the main landing gear and NLG lowered and raised normally, and the landing gear indicator lights operated normally. The landing checklist should be accomplished after the landing gear is lowered and the airplane is in the landing configuration. While on short final, if there are doubts about the landing gear configuration, a go-around should be accomplished. Given that the pilot had not ensured that the landing gear was down, he should have conducted a go-around.

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The pilot's failure to ensure that the landing gear was down while on short final, his subsequent failure to conduct a go-around, and his loss of situational awareness of the airplane's altitude above the runway while landing.

## Findings

---

<b>Aircraft</b>	(general) - Incorrect use/operation
<b>Personnel issues</b>	Lack of action - Pilot
<b>Personnel issues</b>	Situational awareness - Pilot
<b>Personnel issues</b>	Use of checklist - Pilot

## Factual Information

### History of Flight

<b>Landing</b>	Landing gear collapse (Defining event)
----------------	--

On September 10, 2015, about 2035 central daylight time, a Beech 58 twin-engine airplane, N4199S, sustained substantial damage while landing at Gary/Chicago International Airport (GYG), Gary, Indiana. The pilot, the sole occupant, was not injured. The airplane was registered to Charity Homes, Inc., and operated by Midwest Air Link under the provisions of the 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 135 as a non-scheduled domestic cargo positioning flight. Night visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident, and the flight operated on an activated instrument flight rules flight plan. The flight departed the Columbus Municipal Airport (BAK), Columbus, Indiana, about 2030 eastern daylight time en route to GYG.

The pilot reported that he was flying the runway ILS 30 approach to GYG when he lowered the approach flaps about 5.5 miles from the airport and lowered the landing gear 5 miles from the airport. He reported that as he was turning off the positioning lights, so that the landing gear indicator lights would brighten, the propellers struck the runway and the airplane skidded on its belly on the runway. The pilot closed the throttles and mixture, and turned off the master switch.

The air traffic controller who was in the GYG control tower reported seeing the nose landing light before the airplane touched down.

The examination of the airplane revealed that the airplane's wing spar sustained substantial damage. The belly panels, flaps, and nose landing gear doors sustained scraping damage consistent with contact with the runway. The damage to the nose landing gear doors was consistent with the nose landing gear in the retracted position. There was no damage to the inner or outer landing gear doors.

A Federal Aviation Administration airworthiness inspector provided oversight when the landing gear system was examined. The airplane was put on jacks and the system was checked by lowering and raising the landing gear handle in the cockpit. The main and nose landing gear lowered and raised normally, and the landing gear light indicators operated normally as well.

At 2045, the surface weather observation at GYG was: wind 290 degrees at 5 kts, 20 miles visibility, sky clear, temperature 17 degrees C, dew point 14 degrees C, altimeter 29.92 inches of mercury.

The landing checklist is accomplished after the landing gear is lowered and the airplane is in the landing configuration. While on short final and in the flare, if there are doubts about the landing gear configuration, a go-around should be accomplished.

## Pilot Information

<b>Certificate:</b>	Airline transport; Commercial	<b>Age:</b>	56
<b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	<b>Seat Occupied:</b>	Left
<b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Restraint Used:</b>	4-point
<b>Instrument Rating(s):</b>	Airplane	<b>Second Pilot Present:</b>	No
<b>Instructor Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Toxicology Performed:</b>	No
<b>Medical Certification:</b>	Class 2 With waivers/limitations	<b>Last FAA Medical Exam:</b>	March 2, 2015
<b>Occupational Pilot:</b>	Yes	<b>Last Flight Review or Equivalent:</b>	June 20, 2015
<b>Flight Time:</b>	4650 hours (Total, all aircraft), 2358 hours (Total, this make and model), 84 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 36 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

<b>Aircraft Make:</b>	Beech	<b>Registration:</b>	N4199S
<b>Model/Series:</b>	58	<b>Aircraft Category:</b>	Airplane
<b>Year of Manufacture:</b>	1976	<b>Amateur Built:</b>	
<b>Airworthiness Certificate:</b>	Normal	<b>Serial Number:</b>	TH-736
<b>Landing Gear Type:</b>	Retractable - Tricycle	<b>Seats:</b>	6
<b>Date/Type of Last Inspection:</b>	August 10, 2015 AAIP	<b>Certified Max Gross Wt.:</b>	5503 lbs
<b>Time Since Last Inspection:</b>		<b>Engines:</b>	2 Reciprocating
<b>Airframe Total Time:</b>	3243 Hrs as of last inspection	<b>Engine Manufacturer:</b>	CONT MOTOR
<b>ELT:</b>	Installed	<b>Engine Model/Series:</b>	IO-520-C
<b>Registered Owner:</b>	Charity Homes Inc	<b>Rated Power:</b>	285 Horsepower
<b>Operator:</b>	Midwest Air Link	<b>Operating Certificate(s) Held:</b>	On-demand air taxi (135)
<b>Operator Does Business As:</b>	Midwest Air Link	<b>Operator Designator Code:</b>	M4RA

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

<b>Conditions at Accident Site:</b>	Visual (VMC)	<b>Condition of Light:</b>	Night
<b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b>	GYG, 596 ft msl	<b>Distance from Accident Site:</b>	0 Nautical Miles
<b>Observation Time:</b>	20:45 Local	<b>Direction from Accident Site:</b>	0°
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Clear	<b>Visibility</b>	20 miles
<b>Lowest Ceiling:</b>	None	<b>Visibility (RVR):</b>	
<b>Wind Speed/Gusts:</b>	5 knots /	<b>Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Wind Direction:</b>	290°	<b>Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Altimeter Setting:</b>	29.92 inches Hg	<b>Temperature/Dew Point:</b>	17°C / 14°C
<b>Precipitation and Obscuration:</b>	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
<b>Departure Point:</b>	Columbus, IN (BAK)	<b>Type of Flight Plan Filed:</b>	IFR
<b>Destination:</b>	Gary, IN (GYG)	<b>Type of Clearance:</b>	IFR
<b>Departure Time:</b>	20:30 Local	<b>Type of Airspace:</b>	

## Airport Information

<b>Airport:</b>	Gary/Chicago International Air GYG	<b>Runway Surface Type:</b>	Asphalt
<b>Airport Elevation:</b>	596 ft msl	<b>Runway Surface Condition:</b>	Dry
<b>Runway Used:</b>	30	<b>IFR Approach:</b>	ILS
<b>Runway Length/Width:</b>	8859 ft / 150 ft	<b>VFR Approach/Landing:</b>	Full stop

## Wreckage and Impact Information

<b>Crew Injuries:</b>	1 None	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Passenger Injuries:</b>		<b>Aircraft Fire:</b>	None
<b>Ground Injuries:</b>	N/A	<b>Aircraft Explosion:</b>	None
<b>Total Injuries:</b>	1 None	<b>Latitude, Longitude:</b>	41.617221,-87.414443(est)

## Administrative Information

<b>Investigator In Charge (IIC):</b>	Silliman, James
<b>Additional Participating Persons:</b>	Kris Kortokrax; FAA DuPage FSDO; West Chicago, IL
<b>Original Publish Date:</b>	January 5, 2016
<b>Last Revision Date:</b>	
<b>Investigation Class:</b>	<a href="#">Class</a>
<b>Note:</b>	The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.
<b>Investigation Docket:</b>	<a href="https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=91989">https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=91989</a>

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).