

# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

Location: Twin Sisters Mtn, Washington Accident Number: WPR15FA215

Date & Time: July 11, 2015, 07:45 Local Registration: N9712D

Aircraft: Piper PA 22-160 Aircraft Damage: Destroyed

**Defining Event:** Controlled flight into terr/obj (CFIT) **Injuries:** 2 Fatal

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

# **Analysis**

The noninstrument-rated private pilot was making a cross-country flight over mountainous terrain. Radar data showed the airplane flying in a northwesterly direction and climbing to an altitude of about 10,500 ft mean sea level (msl). About 38 minutes into the flight, the airplane's altitude started to decrease as it continued in a northwesterly direction, and, 6 minutes later, its altitude was 7,500 ft msl. The last radar return occurred 1 minute later at an altitude of 6,000 ft msl. The wreckage was located at the 6,000-ft level of a mountain ridgeline in the vicinity of the final radar return. Photographs of the wreckage revealed that the damage to the airplane was consistent with controlled flight into the terrain. The wreckage was not recovered from the accident site, and no follow-up examination was accomplished.

Weather radar imagery indicated that rain showers moved into the area from the south-southeast as the airplane approached the accident site. These showers extended from about 19,000 ft msl down to ground level. Although no direct weather observations of the accident location were available, the airplane's descent as it approached the site is consistent with an attempt by the pilot to maintain visual meteorological conditions while operating amidst rain and clouds that likely obscured the terrain.

# **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The noninstrument-rated pilot's continued visual flight into instrument meteorological conditions, which resulted in controlled flight into mountainous terrain.

## **Findings**

Personnel issues Decision making/judgment - Pilot

Environmental issues Mountainous/hilly terrain - Contributed to outcome

**Environmental issues** Below VFR minima - Effect on personnel

Page 2 of 7 WPR15FA215

## **Factual Information**

## **History of Flight**

Enroute-cruise	VFR encounter with IMC
Enroute-cruise	Controlled flight into terr/obj (CFIT) (Defining event)

On July 11, 2015, about 0745 Pacific daylight time, a Piper PA-22-160, N9712D, was destroyed when it impacted the ridge of Twin Sisters Mountain, about 12 miles north of Hamilton, Washington. The airplane was registered to the private pilot who was operating the airplane under the provisions of 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91, as a visual flight rules flight. The pilot and single passenger were fatally injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed for the flight, and no flight plan had been filed. The flight originated from Stehekin, Washington, about 0700.

The airplane was subject of an ALNOT (alert notification) missing aircraft issued on July 14. Initial radar data depicts an airplane track starting at 8,300 feet mean sea level (msl) 16 miles northwest of Stehekin, at 0718 on July 11. The track continues in a northwesterly direction at an altitude about 10,500 feet mean sea level (msl). At 0738, the airplane's track altitude starts to decrease; by 0744 the altitude was 7,500 feet, and continued in the northwesterly direction. The last radar return occurred at 0745, at an altitude of 6,000 feet msl.

The wreckage was located on the morning of July 15, at the 6,000-foot level of the Twin Sisters Mountain ridge line in the vicinity of the final radar return data point.

#### **Pilot Information**

Certificate:	Private	Age:	56,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Unknown
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	Yes
Medical Certification:	Class 3 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	February 28, 2014
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	440 hours (Total, all aircraft)		

Page 3 of 7 WPR15FA215

## **Passenger Information**

Certificate:		Age:	58,Female
Airplane Rating(s):		Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):		Restraint Used:	Unknown
Instrument Rating(s):		Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):		Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:		Last FAA Medical Exam:	
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:			

The pilot, age 62, held a private pilot certificate with a single-engine land rating, issued May 26, 2010, and a third-class airman medical certificate issued February 3, 2014, with the limitation that the holder shall possess glasses for near and intermediate vision. The pilot's log book was not recovered for examination. On the pilot's February 3, 2014, application for his medical certificate he reported 440 total flight hours, with 47 hours within the previous six months.

## **Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information**

Aircraft Make:	Piper	Registration:	N9712D
Model/Series:	PA 22-160	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	1959	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	22-6624
Landing Gear Type:	Tailwheel	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	June 16, 2015 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2000 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2400 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	LYCOMING
ELT:		Engine Model/Series:	0-320 SERIES
Registered Owner:	On file	Rated Power:	160 Horsepower
Operator:	On file	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

The four-seat, high-wing, fixed-gear airplane, serial number 22-6624, was manufactured in 1959. It was powered by a Lycoming 0-360 series normally aspirated engine. It was equipped with a fixed pitch propeller. Aircraft records were not located or obtained for examination.

Page 4 of 7 WPR15FA215

#### **Meteorological Information and Flight Plan**

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KBLI,148 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	23 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	07:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	270°
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>		Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 3800 ft AGL	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	5 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/ None
Wind Direction:	135°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/ Unknown
Altimeter Setting:	29.87 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	17°C / 14°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	Moderate - Patches - Squall		
Departure Point:	Stehekin, WA (K6S9)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Eastsound, WA (KORS)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	07:00 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

An Automated Weather Observing System (AWOS) was located at Skagit Regional Airport (BVS) in Burlington/Mount Vernon, Washington, which was located about 22 miles southwest of the accident location at an elevation of approximately 145 feet. At 0735, BVS reported a variable wind at 5 knots, visibility of 9 statute miles, ceiling broken at 4,200 feet above ground level (agl), overcast cloud base at 5,000 feet agl, temperature of 17° Celsius (C), a dew point temperature of 14°C, and an altimeter setting of 29.88 inches of mercury.

WSR-88D Level-II weather radar base reflectivity imagery from Seattle/Tacoma, Washington (KATX), is located approximately 36 miles southwest of the accident site at an elevation of about 500 feet. Assuming standard refraction and considering the 0.95° beam width for the WSR-88D radar beam, the KATX 1.435° tilt would have "seen" altitudes between about 5,000 and 8,650 feet above msl at the accident location, the KATX 2.404° tilt would have "seen" altitudes between about 8,700 and 12,350 feet above msl at the accident location, the KATX 3.364° tilt would have "seen" altitudes between about 12,400 and 16,000 feet above msl at the accident location, and the KATX 4.292° tilt would have "seen" altitudes between about 15,900 and 19,500 feet above msl at the accident location.

The KATX base reflectivity imagery identified light values of reflectivity coincident with the accident location at the accident time, in a pattern consistent with light rain showers being present above/at the accident site. A review of a loop of KATX base reflectivity imagery indicated that these reflectivity features were moving from the south/southeast.

An Area Forecast that included the Cascade Mountains westward within the state of Washington was issued at 0345. The portion of the Area Forecast directed toward the Cascades forecasted for the accident time: broken clouds at 8,000 feet, cloud tops to FL200 (flight level 20,000 feet msl), scattered light rain showers, isolated thunderstorms and light rain, cumulonimbus cloud tops to FL350.

An Airmen's Meteorological Information (AIRMET) advisory for mountain obscuration issued at 0745

Page 5 of 7 WPR15FA215

PDT was active for the accident location. Prior to this AIRMET, an AIRMET for mountain obscuration was issued at 0145 PDT and was active for the accident location.

## **Wreckage and Impact Information**

Crew Injuries:	1 Fatal	Aircraft Damage:	Destroyed
Passenger Injuries:	1 Fatal	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 Fatal	Latitude, Longitude:	48.689445,-121.970275(est)

The Whatcom County Sheriff Search and Rescue team provided photos of the accident site and wreckage. The wreckage consisted of two distinct sections within close proximity of one another on the rock face of steep terrain. The area was void of vegetation. The first section contained the cockpit, fuselage, left wing and tail. The second portion of the wreckage consisted of the right wing. The engine had separated from the engine mount and was located in the debris field. The propeller had separated from the engine crankshaft flange, one blade had about 4 inches of the tip missing and the trailing edge was deformed in an elongated s-shape, the other blade was bent aft. The wreckage was not recovered from the accident site and no follow-up examination was accomplished.

#### MEDICAL & PATHOLOGICAL INFORMATION

An autopsy was performed on the pilot on July 17, 2015, by the Whatcom County Chief Medical Examiner, Bellingham, Washington. The cause of death was listed as multiple blunt trauma injuries.

The FAA's Civil Aerospace Medical Institute (CAMI) Forensic Toxicology Research Team performed forensic toxicology on specimens from the pilot with negative results for ethanol or listed drugs. Tests for carbon monoxide and cyanide were not performed.

Page 6 of 7 WPR15FA215

#### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	McKenny, Van	
Additional Participating Persons:	John Fisher; FAA; Portland, OR	
Original Publish Date:	November 17, 2016	
Last Revision Date:		
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>	
Note:	The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=91567	

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 7 of 7 WPR15FA215