



# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

Location:	Siler City, North Carolina	Accident Number:	ERA15LA231
Date & Time:	June 2, 2015, 08:00 Local	<b>Registration:</b>	N985K
Aircraft:	Beech A36	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Aerodynamic stall/spin	Injuries:	1 Fatal, 1 Serious
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

# Analysis

The purpose of the accident flight was to reposition the accident airplane in order to have maintenance performed on its alternator. The accident pilot planned to fly with the airplane's landing gear extended for the duration of the flight and used a handheld radio for communications, presumably because of the intermittent or non-functional state of the alternator. Another pilot, who was flying in his own airplane, accompanied the accident flight, and they arrived in the vicinity of the destination airport about the same time. As the accident pilot maneuvered his airplane to land, the accompanying pilot watched as the accident airplane flew a downwind traffic pattern leg very close to the runway, then entered a "tight" base-to-final turn. The airplane subsequently entered what the accompanying pilot described as an accelerated aerodynamic stall and descended in a nose-down attitude toward the ground. The airplane impacted trees and terrain about 500 ft short of the runway threshold. A postaccident examination of the wreckage revealed no evidence of any preimpact mechanical malfunctions or failures, with the exception of the alternator, which failed a diagnostic test run.

### **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's failure to maintain adequate airspeed and his exceedance of the airplane's critical angle of attack while maneuvering for landing, which resulted in an aerodynamic stall.

### Findings

Personnel issues	Aircraft control - Pilot
Aircraft	Airspeed - Not attained/maintained
Aircraft	Angle of attack - Not attained/maintained

## **Factual Information**

History of Flight	
Approach-VFR pattern final	Loss of control in flight
Approach-VFR pattern final	Aerodynamic stall/spin (Defining event)
Uncontrolled descent	Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)

On June 2, 2015, about 0800 eastern daylight time, a Beech A36, N985K, was substantially damaged when it impacted terrain while attempting to land at Siler City Municipal Airport (SCR), Siler City, North Carolina. The private pilot was seriously injured, and the commercial pilot-rated passenger was fatally injured. The airplane was privately owned and operated under the provisions of 14 *Code of Federal Regulations* Part 91. Instrument meteorological conditions prevailed, and no flight plan was filed for the personal flight, which originated from Moore County Airport (SOP), Pinehurst, North Carolina.

According to a friend of the pilot, the purpose of the accident flight was to reposition the airplane in order to have maintenance performed on the alternator. The accident airplane departed from SOP, and, due to concerns related to the airplane's electrical system, the pilot kept the landing gear extended for the duration of the flight and planned to utilize a handheld communication radio. The friend departed SOP a short time later in his own airplane and arrived in the area of SCR before the accident airplane. The friend reported that a "haze" layer was present near the north side of the airport that was not present toward the south. The friend subsequently maneuvered his airplane so that the accident airplane could enter the traffic pattern and land first.

The accident airplane initially entered the traffic pattern on a downwind leg for landing on runway 22, but upon noting the haze to the north, the pilot announced that they would transition over top of the airport to a left downwind for landing on runway 4. The friend intermittently observed the accident airplane as it maneuvered and noted that, while on the downwind-to-base turn to the runway, the airplane was near the runway in a left bank and nose-high attitude. He further described the turn from base to final as "too tight," and he thought that the airplane had entered an accelerated stall. When he next saw the airplane, it was in a nose-down attitude heading toward a stand of trees that bordered the runway's east side short of the runway threshold. The friend did not observe the impact, but when he did not receive a reply to his inquiries as to their position, he assumed that the airplane had crashed. He subsequently orbited the area where he last observed the airplane and located the accident site. He then landed his own airplane, contacted emergency services, and proceeded to the accident site to render assistance.

The pilot seated in the left seat held a private pilot certificate with a rating for airplane single-engine land. He held a Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) third-class medical certificate, which was issued in June 2014. On the application for that certificate, he reported 1,430 total hours of flight experience. The pilot-rated passenger, who was seated in the right seat, held a commercial pilot certificate with ratings for airplane single- and multi-engine land, and instrument airplane, as well as a flight instructor certificate with ratings for airplane single- and multi-engine land and instrument airplane. The passenger held an FAA second-class medical certificate, which was issued in September 2014, and on the application for that certificate, she reported 4,900 total hours of flight experience. According to the friend, the passenger was not operating in the capacity of a flight instructor on the accident flight.

An FAA inspector examined the airplane at the accident site and identified the initial impact point as a tree located about 500 ft southeast of the runway 4 approach threshold and about 300 ft southeast of the extended runway centerline. The wreckage came to rest about 65 ft from the initial impact point on a 65° magnetic bearing. First responders advised the inspectors of an odor of fuel at the accident site but indicated that there was no postimpact fire.

Detailed examination of the wreckage confirmed flight control continuity from the control column and rudder pedals to each flight control surface. The landing gear selector switch was found in the extended position, and examination of the landing gear actuators revealed positions consistent with the landing gear being extended at impact. The flap actuator was found in the retracted position. One of the three propeller blades was separated from the propeller hub, and all three blades exhibited chordwise scratching. The airplane's alternator was removed and placed on a test bench. The alternator failed the diagnostic test run, with the report noting that the unit produced "low output" and recommending replacement of the stator and/or rotor.

The 0755 weather observation at SCR included calm wind, 7 statute miles visibility, a broken ceiling at 200 ft, and overcast ceiling at 9,000 ft, temperature 19°C, dew point 19°C, and an altimeter setting of 30.04 inches of mercury. At 0815, the weather conditions included 5 statute miles visibility in light rain, scattered clouds at 200 ft, scattered clouds at 6,500 ft, and an overcast ceiling at 8,000 ft.

The North Carolina Department of Health and Human Services, Office of the Chief Medical Examiner, Raleigh, North Carolina, performed an autopsy of the pilot-rated passenger. The reported cause of death was "multiple injuries."

Certificate:	Private	Age:	72,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Unknown
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	June 1, 2014
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	1430 hours (Total, all aircraft)		

### **Pilot Information**

### Pilot-rated passenger Information

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	69,Female
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Unknown
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane multi-engine; Airplane single-engine; Instrument airplane	Toxicology Performed:	Yes
Medical Certification:	Class 2 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	September 1, 2014
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	4900 hours (Total, all aircraft)		

### Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N985K
Model/Series:	A36	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	1981	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Utility	Serial Number:	E-1947
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	June 17, 2013 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3651 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	3501 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental Motors
ELT:	C91A installed	Engine Model/Series:	IO-520-BB
Registered Owner:	BHB OF THE SANDHILLS LLC	Rated Power:	
Operator:	BHB OF THE SANDHILLS LLC	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

### Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Instrument (IMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
<b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b>	KSCR,614 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	11:55 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	73°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	200 ft AGL	Visibility	7 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 200 ft AGL	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:		Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.04 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	19°C / 19°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipita	ation	
Departure Point:	PINEHURST/SOUTHERN PINES, NC (SOP )	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Siler City, NC (SCR)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	07:20 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G
Wind Speed/Gusts: Wind Direction: Altimeter Setting: Precipitation and Obscuration: Departure Point: Destination:	/ 30.04 inches Hg No Obscuration; No Precipita PINEHURST/SOUTHERN PINES, NC (SOP ) Siler City, NC (SCR )	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:Temperature/Dew Point:ationType of Flight Plan Filed:Type of Clearance:	None

### **Airport Information**

Airport:	Siler City Municipal Airport SCR	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	615 ft msl	<b>Runway Surface Condition:</b>	Unknown
Runway Used:	4	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	5000 ft / 75 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Traffic pattern

## Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Serious	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 Fatal	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Fatal, 1 Serious	Latitude, Longitude:	35.697223,-79.508331

#### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Diaz, Dennis
Additional Participating Persons:	Cecil J Land; FAA/FSDO; Greensboro, NC Andrew Hall; Textron Aviation; Wichita, KS Christopher Lang; Continental Motors; Mobile, AL
Original Publish Date:	May 9, 2018
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=91285

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available here.