



# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

Location: Quincy, Illinois Accident Number: CEN15CA033

Date & Time: October 26, 2014, 14:20 Local Registration: N62791

Aircraft: Piper PA-23-250 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

**Defining Event:** Fuel exhaustion **Injuries:** 4 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

### **Analysis**

The pilot reported that the airplane departed with 122 gallons of fuel for the cross-country flight from Destin, Florida, to Quincy, Illinois. The airplane's two inboard wing fuel tanks, each having a 36 gallon capacity, were completely full before departure; however, in order to keep the airplane below its maximum gross weight at departure, the two outboard wing fuel tanks were each partially fueled with 25 gallons. The pilot reported that the inboard fuel tanks were used for engine startup, taxi, takeoff, and climb to the initial cruise altitude assigned by air traffic control. After reaching the initial cruise altitude, he switched to the outboard fuel tanks and leaned the mixture setting for optimal fuel consumption. About 2 hours into the flight, the pilot switched back to the inboard fuel tanks after the engines had consumed the useable fuel in the two outboard fuel tanks. The pilot reported that when the flight was about 7 miles from the destination airport, descending through 3,500 feet mean sea level, the right engine lost total power. The pilot feathered the right propeller, secured the right engine, and continued toward the planned destination. Shortly thereafter, the left engine lost total power and the pilot feathered the propeller and secured the engine. The pilot reported that he delayed extending the landing gear until the airplane cleared a row of trees that bordered the harvested soybean field that he selected for the forced landing. After clearing the trees, the pilot attempted to extend the landing gear by moving the landing gear selector handle to the down position; however, because the left engine was inoperative, a normal landing gear extension with the engine driven hydraulic pump was not possible. The pilot immediately attempted to extend the landing gear using the emergency hand-pump, but the airplane impacted terrain before the landing gear was fully extended. Upon contact with the terrain, the nose and left main landing gear collapsed. The left wing and fuselage sustained substantial damage during the forced landing.

A postaccident examination of the airplane established that the inboard and outboard fuel tanks were void of any useable fuel. The pilot reported that the accident flight was about 4 hours 20 minutes in duration and that fuel exhaustion was the reason that both engines had lost total power. Before departing on the accident flight, he estimated that the flight would require about 118 gallons of fuel, and as such, there would be about 4 gallons of fuel remaining at the completion of the flight. However, after the accident, the pilot acknowledged that he failed to account for the 6.8 gallons of unusable fuel within the

fuel system. Additionally, the airplane was equipped with an emergency carbon-dioxide blowdown system that the pilot could have used to rapidly extend the landing gear instead of the more laborious and time consuming emergency hand-pump. The pilot did not offer an explanation on why he chose to use the emergency hand-pump instead of the carbon-dioxide blowdown system. Had the landing gear been fully extended before landing, it is likely that the landing gear would not have collapsed.

### **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's improper fuel management, which resulted in the total loss of power to both engines due to fuel exhaustion and the subsequent forced landing in a field. Also causal to the accident was the pilot's decision to use the slower emergency hand-pump to extend the landing gear instead of the available carbon-dioxide blowdown system, which resulted in a landing without the landing gear fully extended.

#### **Findings**

Aircraft Fuel - Fluid management

Aircraft Fuel distribution - Capability exceeded

Personnel issues Fuel planning - Pilot

Aircraft Gear extension and retract sys - Incorrect use/operation

Personnel issues Use of equip/system - Pilot

Page 2 of 6 CEN15CA033

## **Factual Information**

### History of Flight

Enroute-descent	Fuel exhaustion (Defining event)	
Enroute-descent	Loss of engine power (total)	
Landing	Off-field or emergency landing	
Landing	Landing gear not configured	
Landing-flare/touchdown	Landing gear collapse	
Landing-landing roll	Dragged wing/rotor/float/other	

#### **Pilot Information**

Certificate:	Commercial; Flight instructor	Age:	47
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	3-point
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane multi-engine; Airplane single-engine; Instrument airplane	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	October 30, 2013
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	October 11, 2014
Flight Time:	1499 hours (Total, all aircraft), 54 hours (Total, this make and model), 1325 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 15 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 13 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Page 3 of 6 CEN15CA033

### **Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information**

Aircraft Make:	Piper	Registration:	N62791
Model/Series:	PA-23-250	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	1976	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	27-7754028
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	June 27, 2014 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	5200 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	2 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	3693.4 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	C91A installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	IO-540-C4B5
Registered Owner:	Great River Aviation, LLC	Rated Power:	250 Horsepower
Operator:	Great River Aviation, LLC	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	UIN,769 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	2 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	14:54 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	140°
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	10 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/ None
Wind Direction:	140°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/ N/A
Altimeter Setting:	29.85 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	22°C / 6°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Destin, FL (DTS)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	Quincy, IL (UIN )	Type of Clearance:	IFR
Departure Time:	10:00 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class E

Page 4 of 6 CEN15CA033

### **Airport Information**

Airport:	Quincy Regional Airport UIN	Runway Surface Type:	
Airport Elevation:	769 ft msl	<b>Runway Surface Condition:</b>	Dry;Rough
Runway Used:		IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	Forced landing

## Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	3 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	4 None	Latitude, Longitude:	39.943054,-91.194442(est)

Page 5 of 6 CEN15CA033

#### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Fox, Andrew
Additional Participating Persons:	Douglas Wilson; Federal Aviation Administration - Springfield FSDO; Springfield, IL
Original Publish Date:	February 11, 2015
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=90330

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 6 of 6 CEN15CA033