



Aviation Investigation Final Report

| | | | |
|--------------------------------|---|-------------------------|-------------|
| Location: | Burnet, Texas | Accident Number: | CEN14LA446 |
| Date & Time: | August 5, 2014, 10:15 Local | Registration: | N44335 |
| Aircraft: | Taylorcraft BC12 - D | Aircraft Damage: | Substantial |
| Defining Event: | Loss of control on ground | Injuries: | 2 None |
| Flight Conducted Under: | Part 91: General aviation - Instructional | | |

Analysis

The student pilot reported that the purpose of the flight was to practice takeoffs and landings. The flight instructor occupied the right seat, and the student occupied the left seat, which was the only position from which the brakes could be controlled. The flight was the sixth instructional flight for the student in the airplane (for a total flight time of 5.7 hours) and the first flight during which he occupied the left seat.

The student reported that he applied engine power to begin a taxi and that the airplane then veered left. As the airplane began to veer, the flight instructor told the student to apply right brake and to retard the engine throttle. The flight instructor turned the magneto switch off, and the airplane's left wing then struck a parked airplane. If the accident airplane had been equipped with dual brakes, it is possible that the flight instructor would have stopped the airplane.

The student stated that he failed to get his right foot from the rudder to the brake in a "timely manner" and that, in his "confusion," he did not retard the engine throttle. The student stated that, during the attempted recovery, it was still hard for him to understand/coordinate the use of the throttle control and control wheel, thinking that the control wheel acted like a car steering wheel in turning the airplane.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The flight instructor's failure to adequately supervise the student pilot and his decision to conduct training in an airplane without dual brakes, which resulted in the student pilot's loss of directional control during initial taxi and subsequent impact with another airplane.

Findings

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Aircraft | Directional control - Not attained/maintained |
| Aircraft | Brake - Not installed/available |
| Personnel issues | Monitoring other person - Instructor/check pilot |
| Personnel issues | Decision making/judgment - Instructor/check pilot |
| Personnel issues | Aircraft control - Student/instructed pilot |

Factual Information

History of Flight

| | |
|------|--|
| Taxi | Loss of control on ground (Defining event) |
| Taxi | Attempted remediation/recovery |
| Taxi | Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT) |

On August 5, 2014, at 1015 central daylight time, a Taylorcraft BC12-D, N44335, impacted a parked airplane after engine start at Burnet Municipal Airport-Kate Craddock Field (BMQ), Burnet, Texas. The airplane engine was being hand-propped by a flight instructor with the student pilot at the cockpit controls. Upon engine start, N44335 veered into a parked Piper Comanche, N7672Y, and both airplanes received substantial damage. The flight instructor and student pilot were uninjured. The airplane was registered to and operated by the flight instructor under the provisions of 14 Code of Federal Regulation Part 91 as in instructional flight that was not operating on a flight plan. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The local flight was originating at the time of the accident.

On August 5, 2014, the registered owner of the N7672Y called the Federal Aviation Administration to report that his airplane had been struck by N44335. The accident had not been reported by the flight instructor.

The required National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) Pilot/Operator Accident/Incident Report, Form 6120.1, was not received following the accident, but on August 26, 2014, the flight instructor sent an email to NTSB's eyewitness report contact email stating the following after the release of the NTSB Preliminary Report of the accident:

"There was at least a minute to two minutes between engine start and the actual taxi incident. I was the instructor hand-propping the aircraft and had time to strap into my seatbelt, un-chock the aircraft, climb in, check over the controls, do a radio check, and briefly discuss the taxi with the student before we moved. The report makes it sound like the hand-propping had more to do with the accident than it did."

On September 3, 2014, the NTSB ICC sent an email to the flight instructor stating that he is to complete and return via email Form 6120.1 within 10 days. Form 6120.1 was not received after the 10 days.

The student pilot stated that he learned of the flight instructor through the flight instructor's internet advertisement for flight instruction. The student pilot stated that he was pursuing a sport pilot certificate and the purpose of the accident flight with the flight instructor was to practice takeoff and landings on a grass runway at Llano, Texas. The student pilot had accumulated a total flight time of 5.7 hours prior to the accident flight which was the student pilot's sixth flight lesson in N44335. The accident flight was the first time in which the student pilot was seated in the left pilot seat, which was the only pilot seat equipped with operable brakes. The student pilot stated that N44335 was parked on a grass surface and next to N7672Y during engine start. Upon engine start, the flight instructor removed the wheel chock and got into the right pilot seat. The student pilot then applied engine throttle for taxi, and when the

airplane began to move, it veered left, towards N7672Y. The flight instructor told him to apply right brake and to retard the engine throttle. The student pilot stated that he failed to get his right foot from the rudder to the brake in a "timely manner" and in his "confusion" did not retard the engine throttle. The student pilot stated that during the attempted recovery, it was still hard for him to understand/coordinate the use of the throttle control and control wheel, thinking that the control wheel acted like a car steering wheel in turning the airplane. The flight instructor turned the magneto switch off before the left wing of the airplane struck the windshield and left wing of N7672Y.

N7672Y sustained substantial damage that included damage to the left wing.

Flight instructor Information

| | | | |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|----------------|
| Certificate: | Commercial | Age: | 32, Male |
| Airplane Rating(s): | Single-engine land | Seat Occupied: | Right |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None | Restraint Used: | |
| Instrument Rating(s): | Airplane | Second Pilot Present: | Yes |
| Instructor Rating(s): | Airplane single-engine | Toxicology Performed: | No |
| Medical Certification: | Class 2 Without waivers/limitations | Last FAA Medical Exam: | August 1, 2014 |
| Occupational Pilot: | Yes | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | |
| Flight Time: | 3022 hours (Total, all aircraft) | | |

Student pilot Information

| | | | |
|----------------------------------|---|--|----------|
| Certificate: | None | Age: | 65, Male |
| Airplane Rating(s): | None | Seat Occupied: | Left |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None | Restraint Used: | |
| Instrument Rating(s): | None | Second Pilot Present: | Yes |
| Instructor Rating(s): | None | Toxicology Performed: | No |
| Medical Certification: | None | Last FAA Medical Exam: | |
| Occupational Pilot: | No | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | |
| Flight Time: | 6 hours (Total, all aircraft), 6 hours (Total, this make and model) | | |

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

| | | | |
|--------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------------------------------|-----------------|
| Aircraft Make: | Taylorcraft | Registration: | N44335 |
| Model/Series: | BC12 - D | Aircraft Category: | Airplane |
| Year of Manufacture: | 1946 | Amateur Built: | |
| Airworthiness Certificate: | | Serial Number: | 10135 |
| Landing Gear Type: | Tailwheel | Seats: | 2 |
| Date/Type of Last Inspection: | Unknown | Certified Max Gross Wt.: | |
| Time Since Last Inspection: | | Engines: | 1 Reciprocating |
| Airframe Total Time: | | Engine Manufacturer: | Continental |
| ELT: | | Engine Model/Series: | A-65-8 |
| Registered Owner: | Flight Instructor | Rated Power: | 65 Horsepower |
| Operator: | Flight Instructor | Operating Certificate(s) Held: | None |

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| | | | |
|---|----------------------------------|---|------------------|
| Conditions at Accident Site: | Visual (VMC) | Condition of Light: | Day |
| Observation Facility, Elevation: | BMQ,1284 ft msl | Distance from Accident Site: | 0 Nautical Miles |
| Observation Time: | 09:53 Local | Direction from Accident Site: | |
| Lowest Cloud Condition: | Clear | Visibility | 10 miles |
| Lowest Ceiling: | None | Visibility (RVR): | |
| Wind Speed/Gusts: | 3 knots / | Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual: | / None |
| Wind Direction: | | Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual: | / N/A |
| Altimeter Setting: | 30.13 inches Hg | Temperature/Dew Point: | 28°C / 19°C |
| Precipitation and Obscuration: | No Obscuration; No Precipitation | | |
| Departure Point: | Burnet, TX (BMQ) | Type of Flight Plan Filed: | None |
| Destination: | Llano, TX | Type of Clearance: | None |
| Departure Time: | 10:15 Local | Type of Airspace: | |

Airport Information

| | | | |
|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------------------------|------|
| Airport: | Burnet Municipal Airport-Kate BMQ | Runway Surface Type: | |
| Airport Elevation: | 1284 ft msl | Runway Surface Condition: | |
| Runway Used: | | IFR Approach: | None |
| Runway Length/Width: | | VFR Approach/Landing: | None |

Wreckage and Impact Information

| | | | |
|----------------------------|--------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|
| Crew Injuries: | 2 None | Aircraft Damage: | Substantial |
| Passenger Injuries: | | Aircraft Fire: | None |
| Ground Injuries: | N/A | Aircraft Explosion: | None |
| Total Injuries: | 2 None | Latitude, Longitude: | 30.738889,-98.238609(est) |

Administrative Information

| | |
|--|---|
| Investigator In Charge (IIC): | Gallo, Mitchell |
| Additional Participating Persons: | Frank Fortmann; Federal Aviation Administration; SAT FSDO; San Antonio, TX |
| Original Publish Date: | April 20, 2016 |
| Last Revision Date: | |
| Investigation Class: | Class |
| Note: | The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident. |
| Investigation Docket: | https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=89927 |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).