

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location: Sarasota, Florida **Accident Number:** ERA14LA383

Date & Time: August 12, 2014, 11:52 Local Registration: N50XV

Aircraft: CHRISTEN INDUSTRIES INC PITTS
Aircraft Damage: Substantial

Defining Event: Fuel exhaustion **Injuries:** 2 Minor

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Instructional

Analysis

The flight instructor reported that, during a preflight inspection of the aerobatic airplane, he noted that it had about 15 gallons of fuel on board. After about 45 minutes of instructional aerobatic flight, the engine lost total power. The flight instructor chose to perform a forced landing to a beach, and, during the landing roll, the airplane nosed over and then came to rest inverted, which resulted in substantial damage to the fuselage and empennage.

A postaccident examination of the airframe and engine revealed no evidence of any preimpact mechanical malfunctions or failures that would have precluded normal operation. During the recovery, about 1 gallon of fuel was drained from the fuel tanks. Additionally, the fuel line was found absent of fuel. The two fuel tanks had a total capacity of about 30 gallons, 1 gallon of which was unusable. Although the pilot estimated that the engine typically consumed about 11 gallons of fuel per hour, the engine manufacturer's Airplane Operating Manual indicated that the engine consumed about 15 gallons of fuel per hour when operated at high-power settings. Assuming this consumption rate, the airplane had about 1 hour of fuel available for the flight at the time of departure, not taking into account the fuel required for engine start, taxi, run-up, and takeoff. Given the quantity of fuel the flight instructor estimated was on board before the flight and the quantity of fuel recovered from the airplane, it is likely that the engine lost power due to fuel exhaustion because of the flight instructor's inadequate preflight planning.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

A total loss of engine power due to fuel exhaustion, which resulted from the flight instructor's inadequate preflight fuel planning.

Findings

Personnel issues Fuel planning - Instructor/check pilot

Aircraft Fuel - Fluid level

Environmental issues (general) - Contributed to outcome

Page 2 of 7 ERA14LA383

Factual Information

History of Flight

 Maneuvering
 Fuel exhaustion (Defining event)

 Maneuvering
 Loss of engine power (total)

 Emergency descent
 Off-field or emergency landing

 Landing-landing roll
 Nose over/nose down

On August 12, 2014, at 1152 eastern daylight time, a Christian Industries Pitts S2B, N50XV, was substantially damaged during a forced landing to a beach following a total loss of engine power near Sarasota, Florida. The flight instructor and private pilot under instruction sustained minor injuries. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed, and no flight plan was filed for the instructional flight, that departed Sarasota/Bradenton International Airport (SRQ), Sarasota, Florida, about 1105. The airplane was registered to and operated by an individual under the provisions of Title 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91.

During an interview with a local law enforcement officer, the flight instructor indicated that he performed a preflight inspection of the airplane prior to departing for the aerobatic instructional flight. He stated that he "thought he had about 15 gallons of fuel," and the engine fuel consumption was about 11 gallons per hour. After about 45 minutes of flight time, while returning to their base airport, at an altitude about 5,000 feet above ground level, the engine experienced a total loss of power. The flight instructor elected to land the airplane on a beach. During the landing roll, the airplane nosed over and came to rest inverted in the water, and incurred substantial damage to the fuselage and empennage.

According to FAA records, the airplane was issued a normal and aerobatic airworthiness certificate in 2013. It was powered by a Lycoming AEIO-540-D4A5, 260 hp, engine. According to maintenance logbooks, the most recent annual inspection was completed on August 22, 2013. At the time of the inspection, the airplane had accumulated 905 hours of total time in service.

A postaccident examination of the airplane revealed that the fuel tanks contained a total of one gallon of blue fluid, similar in color and smell as 100LL aviation fuel. In addition, the engine was examined and engine continuity of the powertrain was confirmed from the propeller flange to the accessory section of the engine. Compression was confirmed on all cylinders using the thumb method, and the spark plugs were and exhibited normal wear. During the examination, the fuel line to the engine was removed and was devoid of any fluid.

According to the airplane Pilot's Operating Handbook (POH), the airplane was equipped with a 24 gallon main fuel tank and a 5 gallon auxiliary wing fuel tank. The 5 gallon wing tank was not to be used during aerobatic operations. In addition, the main fuselage tank contained 1 gallon of unusable fuel. Lastly, the POH had a warning that stated, "DO NOT PERFORM LOW ALTITUDE AEROBATICS WITH LESS THAN 1/4 OF FUEL IN FUSELAGE TANK."

Page 3 of 7 ERA14LA383

According to the engine manufacturer's Operator's Manual, the engine had an average fuel consumption of 15 gallons per hour while operating at 75% of rated power.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Airline transport; Commercial; Flight instructor	Age:	75,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Single-engine sea; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Rear
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	5-point
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane multi-engine; Airplane single-engine; Instrument airplane	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Without waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	April 8, 2013
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	March 30, 2013
Flight Time:	21627 hours (Total, all aircraft), 193 hours (Total, this make and model), 21500 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 18 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 10 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

Student pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Front
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	5-point
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3	Last FAA Medical Exam:	April 1, 2015
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	200 hours (Total, all aircraft)		

Page 4 of 7 ERA14LA383

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	CHRISTEN INDUSTRIES INC	Registration:	N50XV
Model/Series:	PITTS S 2B	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	1987	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Aerobatic; Normal	Serial Number:	5109
Landing Gear Type:	Tailwheel	Seats:	
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	August 13, 2013 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	1700 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	13 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	918 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	C91A installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	AEIO-540-D4A5
Registered Owner:	On file	Rated Power:	260 Horsepower
Operator:	On file	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	SRQ,27 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	10 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	15:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	350°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Few / 3300 ft AGL	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:		Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	12 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	240°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.03 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	33°C / 22°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	Sarasota, FL (SRQ)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Sarasota, FL (SRQ)	Type of Clearance:	Unknown
Departure Time:	11:00 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Page 5 of 7 ERA14LA383

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 Minor	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 Minor	Latitude, Longitude:	27.232221,-82.524169(est)

Page 6 of 7 ERA14LA383

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Moats, Heidi	
Additional Participating Persons:	Angel Figueroa; FAA/FSDO; Tampa, FL	
Original Publish Date:	January 21, 2016	
Last Revision Date:		
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>	
Note:		
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=89865	

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 7 of 7 ERA14LA383