



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	San Antonio, Texas	Accident Number:	CEN14LA354
Date & Time:	July 1, 2014, 14:55 Local	Registration:	N136EL
Aircraft:	Beech A36	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Sys/Comp malf/fail (non-power)	Injuries:	4 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The commercial pilot reported that, after conducting a personal flight and during the approach for landing, he attempted to lower the landing gear but that the left main landing gear did not extend. The pilot repeatedly attempted to lower the landing gear without success. He then chose to land the airplane with the landing gear retracted.

Examination of the airplane revealed that the left main landing gear retract rod was fractured and buckled. Examination of the remaining landing gear components revealed no anomalies.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The failure of the landing gear retract rod.

Findings

Aircraft	Landing gear actuator - Failure
-----------------	---------------------------------

Factual Information

History of Flight

Approach	Sys/Comp malf/fail (non-power) (Defining event)
Landing-flare/touchdown	Landing gear not configured

On July 1, 2014, about 1455 central daylight time, a Beech A36 airplane, N136EL, sustained substantial damage during and intentional wheels-up landing to runway 12L at the San Antonio International Airport (SAT). The pilot and 3 passengers were not injured. The airplane sustained substantial damage to the fuselage. The aircraft was registered to Angel Brothers Aviation Ltd., and operated by the pilot under the provisions of 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91 as personal flight. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed for the flight, which operated on a visual flight rules flight plan. The flight originated from Baytown Airport (HPY), Baytown, Texas, at an unconfirmed time.

In a telephone interview with the pilot, he stated that upon extending the landing gear he did not get a gear-down indication for the left main landing gear. He stated that the right and nose landing gear lights indicated extended. The pilot made several unsuccessful attempts to extend the landing gear. He had advised the SAT air traffic controller of the problem and elected to land the airplane with the landing gear in the retracted position.

Examination of the airplane revealed that the left main landing gear retract rod had fractured and buckled near the landing gear extension motor. Examination of the retract rod confirmed that the rod eye at the end that attached to the gear motor had fractured. The bearing remained attached to the gear motor arm. The retract rod was constructed from a steel tube with a link fabricated at the end that attached to the motor. The link was composed of two formed steel plates riveted together and welded to the end of the tube. The fabricated link was bent about 90 degrees in two places. The first bend was through the eye that held the bearing, and the second bend was about five inches farther outboard. The bends were in opposite directions forming a "Z" shape. Two of the three rivets that connected the link plates together were not found. The third rivet, the farthest outboard, was intact. The steel tube was bent about 5 degrees, 20 inches from the inboard end. Examination of the remainder of the landing gear components revealed no anomalies. The only preimpact damage that was evident was the damage to the landing gear retract rod.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial; Flight instructor	Age:	31
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Unknown
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane single-engine; Instrument airplane	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 1 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	January 31, 2014
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:			

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N136EL
Model/Series:	A36	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	1974	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	E-561
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	Unknown	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3651 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	
Airframe Total Time:		Engine Manufacturer:	
ELT:	Installed	Engine Model/Series:	
Registered Owner:	ANGEL BROTHERS AVIATION LTD	Rated Power:	
Operator:	ANGEL BROTHERS AVIATION LTD	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KSAT,809 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	19:51 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	0°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Few / 6000 ft AGL	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	14 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	140°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29.94 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	34°C / 19°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	BAYTOWN, TX (HPY)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	VFR
Destination:	San Antonio, TX (SAT)	Type of Clearance:	VFR
Departure Time:		Type of Airspace:	Class C

Airport Information

Airport:	SAN ANTONIO INTL SAT	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	809 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	12L	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	5519 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	3 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	4 None	Latitude, Longitude:	29.533889,-98.469169

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Brannen, John
Additional Participating Persons:	Victor Lopez; FAA - San Antonio FSDO; San Antonio, TX
Original Publish Date:	April 4, 2016
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=89642

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).