



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Gulf Shores, Alabama	Accident Number:	ERA14LA324
Date & Time:	June 26, 2014, 16:45 Local	Registration:	N9411Y
Aircraft:	Beech 95 55	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Abnormal runway contact	Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The pilot stated that there were no problems with the airplane's performance and handling throughout the flight. He further stated that, after the airplane had touched down for the second time (witnesses reported that the airplane bounced after landing) and had slowed to about 30 knots during the landing roll, he felt a "shimmy" coming from the airplane's nose area. The nose landing gear then collapsed, and the airplane slid on its nose until it stopped partially off the side of the runway. The airframe sustained substantial damage. According to one witness, the airplane's approach speed was "excessive," and the airplane landed in a flat attitude and then bounced. Another witness stated that the airplane touched down on all three landing gear, bounced, and then touched down a second time on the nose landing gear. Examination of the wreckage revealed overstress damage consistent with a hard landing.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The pilot's improper landing flare, which resulted in a hard landing.

Findings

Aircraft	Landing flare - Not attained/maintained
Personnel issues	Incorrect action performance - Pilot
Personnel issues	Decision making/judgment - Pilot
Personnel issues	Aircraft control - Pilot

Factual Information

History of Flight

Landing-flare/touchdown	Abnormal runway contact (Defining event)
Landing-flare/touchdown	Hard landing
Landing-landing roll	Runway excursion

On June 26, 2014, about 1645 central daylight time, a Beech BE-95, N9411Y, was substantially damaged during a hard landing at Jack Edwards Airport (JKA), Gulf Shores, Alabama. The private pilot and a passenger were not injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed, and no flight plan was filed for the local personal flight, which was conducted under the provisions of Title 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91.

In a telephone interview, the pilot stated that there were no problems with the performance and handling of the airplane throughout the flight. He said that after the airplane had touched down for the second time, and had slowed to approximately 30 knots during the landing roll, he observed a "shimmy" coming from the nose area of the airplane. The nose landing gear then collapsed and the airplane slid on its nose until it stopped partially off to the side of the runway.

A witness located at the airport's fixed base operator (FBO) provided a written statement. He said the airplane touched down on all three landing gear simultaneously, bounced, then landed hard on the nose landing gear, collapsing it. The airplane then skidded approximately 400 feet before it exited the side of the runway.

Another witness stated the speed of the airplane was "excessive" and that it landed in a flat, "neutral" attitude, and bounced back into the air. At that point, the witness lost sight of the airplane and did not see it touch down the second time.

The pilot held a private pilot certificate with ratings for airplane multiengine and single engine land. His most recent FAA third class medical certificate was issued on June 13, 2014. He reported 4,000 total hours of flight experience, of which 500 hours were in the accident airplane make and model.

At 1655, the weather conditions reported at JKA included scattered clouds at 3,200 feet, visibility 10 miles, temperature 30 degrees C, dewpoint 23 degrees C, and an altimeter setting of 30.02 inches of mercury. The wind was from 230 degrees at 3 knots.

The wreckage was recovered from the accident site and moved to the FBO. Examination of photographs revealed a separated nose landing gear, cut and torn front tire, crushed nose cone, and substantial damage to the fuselage and cabin areas.

Examination of the wreckage by an FAA inspector revealed no preimpact mechanical anomalies. He stated that his review of the airplane revealed damage due to overstress that was consistent with a hard landing.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	62
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Lap only
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 None	Last FAA Medical Exam:	June 13, 2014
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	4000 hours (Total, all aircraft), 800 hours (Total, this make and model), 23 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 14 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N9411Y
Model/Series:	95 55	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	1960	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	TC-23
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	May 11, 2014 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	4883 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	2 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	4526 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	CONT MOTOR
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-470 SERIES
Registered Owner:	TACKETT JOHN Z	Rated Power:	300 Horsepower
Operator:	TACKETT JOHN Z	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	JKA, 17 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	16:55 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	0°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 3200 ft AGL	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	3 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/ None
Wind Direction:	230°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/ N/A
Altimeter Setting:	30.02 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	30°C / 23°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:		Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Gulf Shores, AL (JKA)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:		Type of Airspace:	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:	JACK EDWARDS JKA	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	17 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	09	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	6962 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	30.289722,-87.671669

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Rayner, Brian
Additional Participating Persons:	Joel Clark; FAA; Birmingham, AL
Original Publish Date:	June 1, 2015
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=89592

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).