



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Monroe, Louisiana	Accident Number:	CEN14LA273
Date & Time:	June 3, 2014, 10:55 Local	Registration:	N653T
Aircraft:	Beech H35	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Unknown or undetermined	Injuries:	1 Serious
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Flight test		

Analysis

The commercial pilot was conducting a maintenance test flight. According to Federal Aviation Administration audio files, the pilot reported to an air traffic controller that the airplane was experiencing an unspecified fuel problem. The engine then experienced a total loss of power, and the pilot conducted a forced landing, during which the airplane collided with a tree and then impacted a parking lot. A postaccident examination of the airframe, engine, and fuel system did not reveal any preimpact anomalies that would have precluded normal operation. A review of data obtained from the airplane's engine data monitoring system did not reveal any unusual engine readings before the loss of engine power.

At the accident site, fuel was drained from each wing tank and a fuel line leading to the engine; the fuel from the fuel line was orange. Testing of the orange fuel sample revealed the presence of silicon. The tank seals and lines were intact, and the source of the silicon could not be determined. No silicon nor any white powdery deposits (the expected combustion byproducts of silicon) were found on any of the engine components. The reason for the loss of engine power could not be determined.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The loss of engine power for reasons that could not be determined because postaccident examination of the airframe and engine did not reveal any anomalies that would have precluded normal operation.

Findings	
Not determined	(general) - Unknown/Not determined
Environmental issues	Tree(s) - Contributed to outcome

Factual Information

History of Flight	
Approach	Unknown or undetermined (Defining event)
Approach	Loss of engine power (total)
Emergency descent	Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)

On June 3, 2014, about 1055 central daylight time, a Beech H35 airplane, N653T, impacted a parking lot following a total loss of engine power near Monroe, Louisiana. The commercial pilot was seriously injured and the airplane was substantially damaged. The airplane was registered to WFO Flying Services, and operated by a private individual under the provisions of 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91 as a maintenance test flight. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed for the flight, which operated with a flight plan. The local flight originated from Monroe Regional Airport (KMLU), Monroe, Louisiana, about 1020.

The airplane was co-owned by the accident commercial pilot and another pilot. They acquired the airplane in March 2013. Months prior to the accident, the airplane had been mistakenly fueled with Jet-A by the other pilot. Data obtained from the onboard JPI engine data monitoring (EDM) system found that on November 1, 2013, the engines cylinder head temperatures (CHT) increased about 460° F several times during the flight. The airplane landed at KMLU and it was repaired. An invoice from the repair facility stated that the fuel tanks were drained and mechanics "flushed 5 gallons through fuels to clear them of contamination." The engine was removed, repaired, and reinstalled on the airplane. The engine's fuel hoses were also replaced. Work was completed on the airplane on June 2, 2014.

On the day of the accident, the airplane departed KMLU for a maintenance test flight flown by the accident commercial pilot/co-owner. The pilot reported an unspecified fuel malfunction before the engine experienced a total loss of engine power. During the forced landing, the airplane collided with a tree and impacted a parking lot. The cockpit was distorted and crushed aft. The airplane's right wing sustained more damage when compared to the left wing. The outboard portion of the right wing was torn outboard of the landing light. The fuselage was wrinkled and distorted. At the accident site, fuel was drained from each tank and from a fuel line leading to the engine. The fuel pulled from the fuel line leading to the engine was light orange in color. The fuel samples pulled from the fuel tanks appeared in color and clarity with 100 low lead fuel. The orange colored fuel was sent for fuel testing.

Gas chromatograph mass spectrometer testing was conducted on the orange colored fuel sample. The testing's certificate of analysis noted "if heavier compounds or polymers are present these were not seen on the gas chromatograph mass spectrometer. Testing found the presence of silicon in the quantity of 12.9 mg/kg.

An examination of the airframe and engine was conducted at a salvage facility. No preimpact anomalies were detected with the airframe or the fuel tanks. The fuel lines and fuel screens were all found clear and unobstructed. The engine examination did not detect any preimpact anomalies. No silica or white powdery deposits were noted in the fuel divider, cylinders, or spark plugs.

Data obtained from the JPI EDM, found that on the day of the accident, data for the accident flight began at a JPI EDM time of 1437:44. At 1517:20 EDM time, the engine's CHTs averaged 373° F and the exhaust gas temperatures (EGTs) averaged 1412° F. Within 6 seconds the EGTs averaged 780° F and continued to decay. About 2 minutes later, the EDM recorded "NA" values for several values.

Reliable scientific data does not exist to determine a level of silicon contamination prior to obstruction of an airplane's engine performance.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	41
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	March 14, 2014
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:			

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N653T
Model/Series:	H35	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	1957	Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	D-4998
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	July 19, 2013 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2903 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	5475.13 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed	Engine Model/Series:	0-470-G-CI
Registered Owner:	WFO FLYING SERVICE	Rated Power:	240 Horsepower
Operator:	Private individual	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KMLU,81 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	10:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	194°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	2200 ft AGL	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 2200 ft AGL	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	3 knots / None	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:		Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.06 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	28°C / 21°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Monroe, LA (MLU)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Monroe, LA (MLU)	Type of Clearance:	VFR
Departure Time:	10:20 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	MONROE REGIONAL MLU	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	79 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	18	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	5001 ft / 150 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Serious	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Serious	Latitude, Longitude:	32.528331,-92.037223(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Aguilera, Jason
Additional Participating Persons:	Jason Adame; FAA FSDO; Baton Rouge, LA Paul Yoos; Textron Aviation; Wichita, KS Chris Lang; Continental Motors; Mobile, AL
Original Publish Date:	May 16, 2016
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=89337

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available <u>here</u>.