



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	San Marcos, Texas	Accident Number:	CEN12LA229
Date & Time:	April 3, 2012, 19:30 Local	Registration:	N1162X
Aircraft:	Piper PA-34-200T	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Collision during takeoff/land	Injuries:	1 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Positioning		

Analysis

The pilot called the Flight Service Station (FSS) before departing on a cross-country flight to ask if there were any restrictions along his flight route that he needed to be aware of; none were mentioned. Upon arrival at his destination about dusk, the pilot listened to the Automated Terminal Information Service (ATIS); the control tower was closed at the time. The pilot then landed the airplane on runway 8, and during the landing roll, the airplane struck construction barriers on the runway, which resulted in the main landing gear shearing off and substantial damage to the left wing. The ATIS recording did not include information about runway 8 being closed.

A March 21, 2012, NOTAM was in effect and stated that runway 8/26 was closed due to construction; this information was not provided or requested during the FSS briefing. The Airman's Information Manual states that an FSS is required to advise pilots of pertinent NOTAMs if a standard briefing is requested. It further states that pilot's should remind the briefer to advise of NOTAMs if the information is not received in the brief. It is ultimately the pilot's responsibility to ensure that he is familiar with all relevant NOTAMs. Further, FAA Order JO7210.3X states, in part, that facilities with runway construction must ensure ATIS message content is complete, accurate, and contains the proper information related to runway closures.

The pilot stated postaccident that reflective ribbons and directional flashing lights, could have helped him see the barrier. He also stated that he flew into the same airport about a week after the accident and noted that the runway closure was included on the ATIS recording.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's failure to ensure that he was aware of the NOTAM describing the runway closure, which resulted in a landing on the closed runway and subsequent collision with a barrier. Contributing to the accident was the failure of air traffic control personnel to include the runway closure information on the recorded ATIS information, which the pilot had listened to prior to landing.

Findings

Personnel issues	Forgotten action/omission - Pilot
Organizational issues	(general) - ATC
Personnel issues	Flight planning/navigation - Pilot

Factual Information

History of Flight

Landing

Collision during takeoff/land (Defining event)

On April 3, 2012, approximately 1920 central daylight time, a Piper PA-34-200T, N1162X, registered to Southwest Texas Rain Enhancement Association of Carrizo Springs, Texas, sustained substantial damage when it collided with construction barriers upon landing on closed runway 08 at the San Marcos Municipal Airport (HYI), San Marcos, Texas. The commercial pilot, who was the sole occupant, was not injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed and a flight plan was not filed for the positioning flight being operated under the provision of 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91. The flight originated at 1800 from Carrizo Springs, Texas, and San Marcos was its destination.

According to FAA records, the pilot called Fort Worth Flight Service Station (FSS) at 1700 before departure from Carrizo Springs to ask if any Temporary Flight Restrictions (TFRs) were in effect between Carrizo Springs and San Marcos. After an uneventful flight, he landed the airplane on runway 08 at San Marcos. During the landing roll, the airplane struck construction barriers resulting in sheared main landing gear and substantial damage to the left wing.

The San Marcos control tower had closed at 1900. A Notice to Airman (NOTAM) was published and in effect since March 21, 2012, stipulating that runway 08/26 was closed due to construction.

The pilot reported that he had called the Fort Worth FSS prior to the flight and asked for TFR's along the route and asked the briefer if "there was anything else that [he] needed to be aware of." The briefer did not mention the NOTAM that was in effect for the runway 08 closure, nor did the pilot specifically ask about NOTAMs. He stated that upon arrival to San Marcos, about dusk, he listened to the Automated terminal Information Service (ATIS). He said that the ATIS recording did not include the closure of runway 08. He planned to land the airplane a bit long on the 6,600 foot runway to limit taxi time. During the landing roll, he was not able to avoid the barricade.

Chapter 5, paragraph d., of the Airman's Information Manual, states in part that Flight Service stations are required to advise pilots of pertinent NOTAMs if a standard briefing is requested. It also states that pilot's should remind the briefer to advise of NOTAMs if the information was not received in the brief.

Chapter 10, Section 4, paragraph d., of FAA Order JO7210.3X, dated February 9, 2012, states in part that facilities with runway construction must ensure ATIS message content is complete, accurate, and contains the proper information related to runway closures.

On the submitted NTSB Form 6120, Recommendation Section, the pilot stated that reflective ribbons, directional flashing lights, could have helped him see the barrier. He also stated that the accident would have been avoided if the runway closure information was included in the ATIS. He said that he flew into San Marcos about a week after the accident, April 24, and noted that the runway closure was included on the ATIS recording. The pilot offered that had the FSS briefer mentioned the NOTAM and/or if the NOTAM was included in the ATIS recording, the accident would not have occurred.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	57, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	June 10, 2011
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	October 18, 2010
Flight Time:	2618 hours (Total, all aircraft), 567 hours (Total, this make and model), 2683 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 13 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 8 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Piper	Registration:	N1162X
Model/Series:	PA-34-200T	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal; Restricted (Special)	Serial Number:	34-7570225
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	April 4, 2011 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	2 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2441 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	CONT MOTOR
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	TSIO-360 SER
Registered Owner:	SOUTHWEST TEXAS RAIN ENHANCEMENT ASSOC	Rated Power:	225 Horsepower
Operator:	SOUTHWEST TEXAS RAIN ENHANCEMENT ASSOC	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	HYI,597 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	19:17 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	0°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	4 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	340°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29.72 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	26°C / 17°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	Carrizo Springs, TX (CZT)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	San Marcos, TX (HYI)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	18:30 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class C

Airport Information

Airport:	San Marcos Municipal Airport HYI	Runway Surface Type:	
Airport Elevation:		Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	08	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	Straight-in

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	29.892778,-97.863052(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Lemishko, Alexander
Additional Participating Persons:	Robert J O'Keefe; FAA FSDO San Antonio; San Antonio, TX
Original Publish Date:	August 13, 2013
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=83306

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).