



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Butler, Pennsylvania	Accident Number:	ERA12CA247
Date & Time:	March 23, 2012, 13:30 Local	Registration:	N58135
Aircraft:	Mooney M20J	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Landing gear not configured	Injuries:	1 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The pilot stated that, when he returned to the airport after a local flight, two airplanes were in the traffic pattern and a third airplane was inbound about 10 miles east. To sequence with the two airplanes in the pattern and the third airplane on the extended downwind leg, the pilot did not enter the traffic pattern at the midpoint of the downwind leg, but entered the traffic pattern closer to the approach end of the intended runway. He lowered the flaps, but did not lower the landing gear. He turned onto the base leg, extended full flaps, and then turned onto final approach. While on final approach, the pilot had a sense that the airplane was fast and that the “sight picture” was lower than usual, but he did not detect that the landing gear was retracted or recall hearing the landing gear warning horn. He heard the propeller contact the runway and attempted to lower the landing gear, but it was too late. He heard the landing gear warning horn after the airplane came to rest. Postaccident examination of the airplane revealed that a main stringer and leading edge rib inside the right wing were damaged. The pilot stated that there were no preimpact malfunctions or failures that would have precluded normal operation.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot’s failure to extend the landing gear before landing.

Findings

Personnel issues

Lack of action - Pilot

Aircraft

Gear extension and retract sys - Not used/operated

Factual Information

History of Flight

Landing-flare/touchdown	Landing gear not configured (Defining event)
--------------------------------	--

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	73, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	October 13, 2011
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	November 2, 2011
Flight Time:	1192 hours (Total, all aircraft), 111 hours (Total, this make and model), 1192 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Mooney	Registration:	N58135
Model/Series:	M20J	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	24-1567
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	March 12, 2012 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2740 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	1060 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	LYCOMING
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	IO-360-A3
Registered Owner:	BRUBAKER CLIFFORD E	Rated Power:	200 Horsepower
Operator:	BRUBAKER CLIFFORD E	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	BTP,1248 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:	13:35 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	6 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	90°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.04 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	24°C / 13°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Butler, PA (BTP)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Butler, PA (BTP)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	13:00 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	Butler County Airport BTP	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	1248 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	08	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	4801 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop;Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	40.77639,-79.95111(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Monville, Timothy
Additional Participating Persons:	Raymond J McBride; FAA/FSDO; Pittsburgh, PA
Original Publish Date:	October 15, 2012
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=83200

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).