



# Aviation Investigation Final Report

|                                |                                      |                         |             |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------|-------------|
| <b>Location:</b>               | Clayton, New York                    | <b>Accident Number:</b> | ERA11CA294  |
| <b>Date &amp; Time:</b>        | May 11, 2011, 11:45 Local            | <b>Registration:</b>    | N4760P      |
| <b>Aircraft:</b>               | Piper PA-23-250                      | <b>Aircraft Damage:</b> | Substantial |
| <b>Defining Event:</b>         | Landing area undershoot              | <b>Injuries:</b>        | 1 Minor     |
| <b>Flight Conducted Under:</b> | Part 91: General aviation - Personal |                         |             |

## Analysis

According to the pilot, the airplane was about to touch down when a gust of wind caused the left wing to drop toward the ground. The wing impacted the ground and skidded on the turf runway. Subsequently, the airplane came to rest and was engulfed in flames, which resulted in substantial damage. The airplane landed approximately 150 feet prior to the turf runway's threshold. The wind, recorded at an airport 12 miles to the south about the time of the accident, was from 030 degrees at 10 knots with gusts to 19 knots. The pilot reported that there were no mechanical malfunctions of the airplane at the time of the accident.

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's failure to obtain a proper touchdown point while landing with a gusting tailwind.

## Findings

|                             |   |
|-----------------------------|---|
| <b>Personnel issues</b>     | Aircraft control - Pilot                              |
| <b>Aircraft</b>             | Descent/approach/glide path - Not attained/maintained |
| <b>Environmental issues</b> | Gusts - Contributed to outcome                        |

## Factual Information

### History of Flight

|                    |  |
|--------------------|--|
| <b>Landing</b>     | Landing area undershoot (Defining event) |
| <b>Post-impact</b> | Fire/smoke (post-impact)                 |

### Pilot Information

|                                  |  |  |                  |
|----------------------------------|--|--|------------------|
| <b>Certificate:</b>              | Private  | <b>Age:</b>                              | 52, Male         |
| <b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>       | Single-engine land; Multi-engine land  | <b>Seat Occupied:</b>                    | Left             |
| <b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b> | None   | <b>Restraint Used:</b>                   |                  |
| <b>Instrument Rating(s):</b>     | None   | <b>Second Pilot Present:</b>             | No               |
| <b>Instructor Rating(s):</b>     | None   | <b>Toxicology Performed:</b>             | No               |
| <b>Medical Certification:</b>    | Class 2 Without waivers/limitations  | <b>Last FAA Medical Exam:</b>            | January 28, 2011 |
| <b>Occupational Pilot:</b>       | No   | <b>Last Flight Review or Equivalent:</b> | April 14, 2010   |
| <b>Flight Time:</b>              | (Estimated) 750 hours (Total, all aircraft), 230 hours (Total, this make and model), 700 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 17 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 7 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft) |  |                  |

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

|                                      |                                |                                       |                 |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------|-----------------|
| <b>Aircraft Make:</b>                | Piper                          | <b>Registration:</b>                  | N4760P          |
| <b>Model/Series:</b>                 | PA-23-250                      | <b>Aircraft Category:</b>             | Airplane        |
| <b>Year of Manufacture:</b>          |                                | <b>Amateur Built:</b>                 |                 |
| <b>Airworthiness Certificate:</b>    | Normal                         | <b>Serial Number:</b>                 | 27-301          |
| <b>Landing Gear Type:</b>            | Retractable - Tricycle         | <b>Seats:</b>                         | 6               |
| <b>Date/Type of Last Inspection:</b> | March 11, 2011 Annual          | <b>Certified Max Gross Wt.:</b>       | 5200 lbs        |
| <b>Time Since Last Inspection:</b>   | 45 Hrs                         | <b>Engines:</b>                       | 2 Reciprocating |
| <b>Airframe Total Time:</b>          | 4174 Hrs as of last inspection | <b>Engine Manufacturer:</b>           | LYCOMING        |
| <b>ELT:</b>                          | C91 installed                  | <b>Engine Model/Series:</b>           | O-540 SERIES    |
| <b>Registered Owner:</b>             | On file                        | <b>Rated Power:</b>                   | 250 Horsepower  |
| <b>Operator:</b>                     | On file                        | <b>Operating Certificate(s) Held:</b> | None            |

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

|   |                                  |   |                   |
|---|----------------------------------|---|-------------------|
| <b>Conditions at Accident Site:</b>     | Visual (VMC)                     | <b>Condition of Light:</b>                  | Day               |
| <b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b> | ART,328 ft msl                   | <b>Distance from Accident Site:</b>         | 12 Nautical Miles |
| <b>Observation Time:</b>                | 11:56 Local                      | <b>Direction from Accident Site:</b>        | 190°              |
| <b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>          | Clear                            | <b>Visibility</b>                           | 10 miles          |
| <b>Lowest Ceiling:</b>                  | None                             | <b>Visibility (RVR):</b>                    |                   |
| <b>Wind Speed/Gusts:</b>                | 10 knots / 19 knots              | <b>Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:</b>     | /                 |
| <b>Wind Direction:</b>                  | 30°                              | <b>Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:</b> | /                 |
| <b>Altimeter Setting:</b>               | 30.12 inches Hg                  | <b>Temperature/Dew Point:</b>               | 18°C / 8°C        |
| <b>Precipitation and Obscuration:</b>   | No Obscuration; No Precipitation |   |                   |
| <b>Departure Point:</b>                 | Brookhaven, NY (HWV )            | <b>Type of Flight Plan Filed:</b>           | Unknown           |
| <b>Destination:</b>                     | Clayton, NY (28NK)               | <b>Type of Clearance:</b>                   | None              |
| <b>Departure Time:</b>                  | 09:50 Local                      | <b>Type of Airspace:</b>                    |                   |

## Airport Information

|                             |                       |                                  |                |
|-----------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------------|----------------|
| <b>Airport:</b>             | Ritchie Airfield 28NK | <b>Runway Surface Type:</b>      | Grass/turf     |
| <b>Airport Elevation:</b>   | 385 ft msl            | <b>Runway Surface Condition:</b> | Dry;Vegetation |
| <b>Runway Used:</b>         | 25                    | <b>IFR Approach:</b>             | None           |
| <b>Runway Length/Width:</b> | 2000 ft / 100 ft      | <b>VFR Approach/Landing:</b>     | Full stop      |

## Wreckage and Impact Information

|                            |         |                             |                           |
|----------------------------|---------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|
| <b>Crew Injuries:</b>      | 1 Minor | <b>Aircraft Damage:</b>     | Substantial               |
| <b>Passenger Injuries:</b> |         | <b>Aircraft Fire:</b>       | On-ground                 |
| <b>Ground Injuries:</b>    | N/A     | <b>Aircraft Explosion:</b>  | None                      |
| <b>Total Injuries:</b>     | 1 Minor | <b>Latitude, Longitude:</b> | 44.186943,-76.076385(est) |

## Administrative Information

|  |   |
|--|---|
| <b>Investigator In Charge (IIC):</b>     | Etcher, Shawn   |
| <b>Additional Participating Persons:</b> | Mark Denny; FAA/FSDO; Albany, NY  |
| <b>Original Publish Date:</b>            | October 3, 2011   |
| <b>Last Revision Date:</b>               |   |
| <b>Investigation Class:</b>              | <a href="#">Class</a>   |
| <b>Note:</b>                             | This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.   |
| <b>Investigation Docket:</b>             | <a href="https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=79083">https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=79083</a> |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).