



# Aviation Investigation Final Report

---

<b>Location:</b>	Navada, Texas	<b>Accident Number:</b>	CEN11LA084
<b>Date &amp; Time:</b>	November 27, 2010, 15:50 Local	<b>Registration:</b>	N4541L
<b>Aircraft:</b>	Grumman American AA-5B	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Defining Event:</b>	Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)	<b>Injuries:</b>	1 None
<b>Flight Conducted Under:</b>	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

---

## Analysis

According to the pilot, he was cruising at 3,000 feet when the engine sputtered. He switched from the right fuel tank to the left fuel tank and turned the boost pump on. He said that the engine regained power, but lost power shortly thereafter, so he performed a forced landing to an open plowed field. During the landing, the airplane cleared power lines but stalled and impacted in the field. A postaccident engine examination revealed the fuel filter contained considerable debris that resembled paint chips. The pilot said the airplane had recently been painted. The engine was test run with a clean fuel filter and it operated satisfactorily. The fuel system between the fuel tanks and the electric fuel pump was pressurized and checked for leaks. Two leaks were found, and fuel stains were noted in the area of the leaks. However, it is unlikely that these two leaks could cause a loss of engine power.

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The loss of engine power due to debris obstructing the fuel filter, which resulted in fuel starvation. Contributing to the accident was the pilot's inadequate airspeed during the forced landing, which resulted in an aerodynamic stall.

## Findings

---

<b>Aircraft</b>	(general) - Failure
<b>Aircraft</b>	(general) - Not attained/maintained
<b>Aircraft</b>	Fuel filter-strainer - Damaged/degraded
<b>Personnel issues</b>	Aircraft control - Pilot
<b>Aircraft</b>	Fuel - Not specified

## Factual Information

### History of Flight

<b>Enroute-cruise</b>	Loss of engine power (total)
<b>Emergency descent</b>	Off-field or emergency landing
<b>Landing</b>	Loss of control in flight
<b>Uncontrolled descent</b>	Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT) (Defining event)

On November 27, 2010, approximately 1550 central standard time, a Grumman American AA-5B, N4541L, registered to and operated by the pilot, was substantially damaged when it impacted terrain during a forced landing after the engine lost power during near Navada, Texas. Visual meteorological conditions (VMC) prevailed at the time of the accident. The personal flight was being conducted under the provisions of 14 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) Part 91 without a flight plan. The pilot, the sole occupant on board, was not injured. The cross-country flight originated at Bonham (F00), Texas, and was en route to Rockwall (F46), Texas.

The pilot told FAA inspectors that while in cruise flight, the engine lost power. During the ensuing forced landing, the pilot was able to clear power lines, but the airplane stalled and impacted terrain. The left wing was bent from the wing tip inboard about two ribs, and the spar in that area was broken. The nose and right main landing gears were also torn off.

According to the pilot's accident report, he was cruising at 3,000 feet when "the engine sputtered." The pilot switched from the right to the left fuel tank and turned the boost pump on. The engine "started to regain power, then began to lose RPM again." After clearing powerlines, "the right wing went up in response to a wind gust" and the airplane impacted an open plowed field.

At 1553, the surface wind conditions at Dallas Love Field Airport, approximately 35 miles southeast of the accident site were reported 190 degrees at 7 knots.

On December 7, 2010, the engine was examined and functionally tested at the facilities of Fletchaire, Incorporated, Fleet Support in Fredericksburg, Texas. Prior to the engine run, the carburetor bowl was examined and found to be clean and dry. The fuel filter contained considerable debris that resembled paint chips. The pilot said the airplane had recently been painted. The fuel filter was cleaned and reinstalled. The engine operated satisfactory.

The fuel system between the fuel tanks and the electric fuel pump was pressurized and checked for leaks. Two leaks were found. In a memo from Fletchaire, Inc., they reported finding one leak at the fitting that reduced the 3/8" fuel line to a 1/8" flare fitting. The leak was between the #6 tee (MS20826-6D) fitting and the 5401131-2 reducer. The other leak was a

cracked flare fitting on the copper primer line where it attached to the 5401131-2 reducer. Fuel stains were noted in this area. Fletchaire, Inc., said it was possible that "air may have been sucked into the fuel system, cavitating the fuel line at this point. This may not have caused this plane's demise."

## Pilot Information

<b>Certificate:</b>	Private	<b>Age:</b>	63, Male
<b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>	Single-engine land	<b>Seat Occupied:</b>	Left
<b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Restraint Used:</b>	
<b>Instrument Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Second Pilot Present:</b>	No
<b>Instructor Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Toxicology Performed:</b>	No
<b>Medical Certification:</b>	Class 3 With waivers/limitations	<b>Last FAA Medical Exam:</b>	June 10, 2010
<b>Occupational Pilot:</b>	No	<b>Last Flight Review or Equivalent:</b>	October 16, 2010
<b>Flight Time:</b>	782 hours (Total, all aircraft), 736 hours (Total, this make and model), 782 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 22 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 8 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

<b>Aircraft Make:</b>	Grumman American	<b>Registration:</b>	N4541L
<b>Model/Series:</b>	AA-5B	<b>Aircraft Category:</b>	Airplane
<b>Year of Manufacture:</b>		<b>Amateur Built:</b>	
<b>Airworthiness Certificate:</b>	Normal	<b>Serial Number:</b>	AA5B1319
<b>Landing Gear Type:</b>	Tricycle	<b>Seats:</b>	4
<b>Date/Type of Last Inspection:</b>	June 1, 2010 Annual	<b>Certified Max Gross Wt.:</b>	2400 lbs
<b>Time Since Last Inspection:</b>	31 Hrs	<b>Engines:</b>	1 Reciprocating
<b>Airframe Total Time:</b>	2314 Hrs as of last inspection	<b>Engine Manufacturer:</b>	Lycoming
<b>ELT:</b>	Installed, not activated	<b>Engine Model/Series:</b>	O-360-
<b>Registered Owner:</b>	Joe Allman	<b>Rated Power:</b>	180 Horsepower
<b>Operator:</b>	Joe Allman	<b>Operating Certificate(s) Held:</b>	None

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

<b>Conditions at Accident Site:</b>	Visual (VMC)	<b>Condition of Light:</b>	Day
<b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b>	DAL	<b>Distance from Accident Site:</b>	
<b>Observation Time:</b>	15:53 Local	<b>Direction from Accident Site:</b>	
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Few / 25000 ft AGL	<b>Visibility</b>	10 miles
<b>Lowest Ceiling:</b>	None	<b>Visibility (RVR):</b>	
<b>Wind Speed/Gusts:</b>	7 knots /	<b>Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Wind Direction:</b>	190°	<b>Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Altimeter Setting:</b>	30.13 inches Hg	<b>Temperature/Dew Point:</b>	17°C / -10°C
<b>Precipitation and Obscuration:</b>			
<b>Departure Point:</b>	Bonham, TX (F00 )	<b>Type of Flight Plan Filed:</b>	None
<b>Destination:</b>	Rockwall, TX (F46 )	<b>Type of Clearance:</b>	None
<b>Departure Time:</b>	15:00 Local	<b>Type of Airspace:</b>	Class E

## Wreckage and Impact Information

<b>Crew Injuries:</b>	1 None	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Passenger Injuries:</b>		<b>Aircraft Fire:</b>	None
<b>Ground Injuries:</b>	N/A	<b>Aircraft Explosion:</b>	None
<b>Total Injuries:</b>	1 None	<b>Latitude, Longitude:</b>	33.042778,-96.363891(est)

## Administrative Information

<b>Investigator In Charge (IIC):</b>	Scott, Arnold
<b>Additional Participating Persons:</b>	Tony Baumgard; FAA Flight Standards District Office; Dallas, TX
<b>Original Publish Date:</b>	March 8, 2012
<b>Last Revision Date:</b>	
<b>Investigation Class:</b>	<a href="#">Class</a>
<b>Note:</b>	
<b>Investigation Docket:</b>	<a href="https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=77891">https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=77891</a>

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).