



# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

Location:	Bettles Field, Alaska	Accident Number:	ANC10TA080
Date & Time:	August 30, 2010, 21:34 Local	Registration:	N20HY
Aircraft:	AVIAT AIRCRAFT INC A-1B	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)	Injuries:	1 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Public aircraft		

# Analysis

The pilot reported that during the flight he observed smoke in the cockpit and smelled burning oil. He noted a rise in oil temperature, followed by a decrease in oil pressure, and an unusual vibration in the floorboards, control stick, and rudder. He elected to make a precautionary landing on a sandbar. He reported that on short final to the sandbar, he turned the fuel and electrical systems off, and that the propeller was windmilling. While landing, the left wingtip hit brush and the airplane veered to the left, at which point the right wingtip struck the ground. The airplane then nosed down and the propeller struck the sandbar. A postaccident examination revealed that the engine oil was at a normal level and did not smell burned; no evidence of leaks were found. The engine was removed from the airplane and successfully run on an engine test stand with no mechanical anomalies or leaks noted. An examination of the propeller showed aft bending and torsional twisting, with multiple leading edge gouges and chordwise scratching, consistent with the propeller being under power and striking the ground multiple times during the landing.

### **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's selection of an unsuitable off-airport landing site for a precautionary landing.

# Findings

Environmental issues	(general) - Contributed to outcome
Aircraft	(general) - Not specified
Personnel issues	(general) - Pilot

# **Factual Information**

History of Flight	
Enroute-cruise	Miscellaneous/other
Enroute-cruise	Off-field or emergency landing
Landing-flare/touchdown	Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT) (Defining event)
Landing	Nose over/nose down

On August 30, 2010, about 2134 Alaska daylight time, an Aviat A-1B airplane, N20HY, sustained substantial damage during a landing on a sandbar, about 35 miles northwest of Bettles Field, Alaska. The airplane was being operated by the U.S. National Park Service as a law enforcement surveillance public use flight, under Title 14, Code of Federal Regulations Part 91.

During a telephone conversation with the National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) investigator-in-charge (IIC) on September 3, an investigator for the Department of the Interior (DOI) said the pilot related to him that during cruise flight in a remote area, he saw that the engine oil temperature was increasing, and the engine oil pressure was decreasing into the yellow caution area of the pressure gauge. The pilot reported that he selected a sandbar upon which to land. The pilot related that during the landing flare the left wingtip hit some brush causing the airplane to yaw to the left. He reported that the right wing and propeller struck the ground.

In a written report to his employer, the pilot reported that during the flight he saw smoke in the cockpit, and smelled hot/burning oil. He also said he saw a rise in engine oil temperature, and a decrease in oil pressure. Based on those observations he elected to make a precautionary landing on a sandbar. He noted that he also felt an uncharacteristic vibration in the stick, rudder, and floorboards.

The pilot reported that on short final to the sandbar he turned the fuel and electrical systems off, and indicated the propeller was windmilling. During the landing he said the left wingtip got into the brush, and the airplane veered to the left, with the right wingtip striking the ground. The airplane nosed down, and the propeller struck the sandbar.

At the accident site, the DOI investigator said he checked the airplane engine oil level, and the dipstick indicated about 6 quarts. After recovery, sitting on a level ramp, he said the dipstick indicated 6.5 quarts. After removing the cowlings, he said he found a small spot of oil on the exhaust pipe below the engine oil dipstick/filler tube.

The engine was removed from the airplane, and on September 10, under the supervision of the NTSB IIC, the engine was started and run on an engine test stand. No mechanical anomalies or

leaks were noted, and temperatures and pressures were within normal limits during the test run.

An examination of the propeller showed aft bending, torsional twisting, and numerous leading edge gouges and chordwise scratching, consistent with the propeller contacting the ground several times.

In their final report provided to the NTSB, the DOI investigator reported that "from the mishap site to the Bettles airport was actually 30.4 miles, which at a cruise speed of 110 mph would take just over 16 minutes. A direct route to Coldfoot was 28 miles and would have taken approximately 15 minutes. An NPS [National Park Service] mentor pilot who flew the route between the accident site and Bettles stated that since the engine was still operating the pilot could have flown towards Bettles and if the engine failed there were numerous areas of willow and alder trees that could have been used for a forced landing. He also stated there are ample, suitable gravel bars closer to Bettles."

#### **Pilot Information**

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	33,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Single-engine sea	Seat Occupied:	Front
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 Without waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	February 16, 2010
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	March 3, 2010
Flight Time:	1600 hours (Total, all aircraft), 450 hours (Total, this make and model), 1450 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 175 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 50 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

### Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

AVIAT AIRCRAFT INC	Registration:	N20HY
A-1B	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
	Amateur Built:	
Normal	Serial Number:	2001
Tailwheel	Seats:	2
June 21, 2010 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2000 lbs
	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
1903 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	LYCOMING
C126 installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	0-360-A1D
UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF INTERIOR	Rated Power:	180 Horsepower
National Park Service	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Gates of the Arctic National Park	Operator Designator Code:	
	A-1B Normal Tailwheel June 21, 2010 Annual 1903 Hrs at time of accident C126 installed, not activated UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF INTERIOR National Park Service	A-1BAircraft Category:A-1BAmateur Built:NormalSerial Number:TailwheelSeats:June 21, 2010 AnnualCertified Max Gross Wt.:1903 Hrs at time of accidentEngines:1903 Hrs at time of accidentEngine Manufacturer:C126 installed, not activatedEngine Model/Series:UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF INTERIORRated Power:National Park ServiceOperating Certificate(s) Held:Gates of the Arctic NationalOperator Designator Code:

# Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	PABT,647 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	35 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	21:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	210°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 10000 ft AGL	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	2 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	360°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29.77 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	16°C / 2°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	Coldfoot, AK (PACX)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	Company VFR
Destination:	Bettles Field, AK (PABT)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	20:30 Local	Type of Airspace:	

# Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	67.343887,-151.221115

#### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Lewis, Lawrence
Additional Participating Persons:	Brice Banning; FAA FSDO-01; Fairbanks, AK Stephen Rauch; U S Department of the Interior; Boise, ID
Original Publish Date:	May 11, 2011
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=77149

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available <u>here</u>.