



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Slaton, Texas	Accident Number:	CEN10LA140
Date & Time:	March 5, 2010, 16:30 Local	Registration:	N2036Y
Aircraft:	Beech A36	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Loss of engine power (total)	Injuries:	1 Minor
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

While at 5,500 feet mean sea level, the pilot heard a loud explosion and the left front engine cowling blew open. Shortly thereafter the engine stopped producing power and the pilot executed a forced landing to a flat plowed field. The No. 2 cylinder was found separated from the engine crankcase. A postaccident engine teardown examination revealed that there had been an insufficient clamping force between the crankcase halves and between each cylinder and the crankcase. In particular, the No. 2 crankcase cylinder deck exhibited signatures consistent with the No. 2 cylinder vibrating back and forth before it exited the engine case. At the time of the accident, the engine had accumulated approximately 1,072 hours since major overhaul and 641 hours since a top overhaul.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The loss of engine power due to the insufficient clamping force between the two crankcase halves and each cylinder to the crankcase.

Findings

Aircraft	Recip eng cyl section - Malfunction
-----------------	-------------------------------------

Factual Information

History of Flight

Enroute-cruise	Loss of engine power (total) (Defining event)
Emergency descent	Loss of engine power (total)
Landing	Off-field or emergency landing
Landing-landing roll	Nose over/nose down

On March 5, 2010, about 1630 central standard time, a single-engine, Beech A36 airplane, N2036Y, was substantially damaged during a forced landing following a total loss of engine power while in cruise flight near Slaton, Texas. The private pilot, the sole occupant, sustained minor injuries. The airplane was registered to and operated by the pilot. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed and a flight plan was filed for the 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91 personal flight. The 256 mile cross-country flight departed the Lubbock Preston Smith International Airport (LBB), Lubbock, Texas, about 1620 with the Dallas Executive Airport (RBD), Dallas, Texas, as the intended destination.

According to the pilot, while at 5,500 feet, he heard a “loud explosion” and the left front engine cowling blew open. Shortly thereafter, oil appeared on the windscreen and the engine stopped producing power. The pilot executed a forced landing to a flat plowed field. The airplane’s left wing separated at impact and the airplane came to rest in a nose down, but upright position. The pilot was able to exit the airplane unassisted.

The Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) inspector who responded to the accident site reported, that the engine’s #2 cylinder was found separated from the engine crankcase.

The engine, a Teledyne Continental Motors (TCM), IO-550-B-12B, serial number 271728-R, was examined at TCM in Mobile, Alabama. Oversight was provided by the NTSB investigator-in-charge (IIC). The examination revealed that all crankcase main bearing surfaces, except for #5, exhibited fretting wear. In addition, the crankcase cylinder decks exhibited wear patterns consistent with movement between all cylinders and the crankcase.

Additionally, the crankcase exhibited signatures consistent with the #2 cylinder rocking back and forth before it exited the engine case. The #2 piston to crankshaft connecting rod cap was found separated from the connecting rod. The #2 piston pin had been pulled through the lower section of piston, suggesting that the connecting rod to crankshaft separation was a secondary failure.

A review of the engine logbook revealed that the engine was overhauled on March 29, 2002. At the time of the accident, the engine had accumulated approximately 1,072 hours since major overhaul and 641 hours since a top overhaul.

On May 29, 1992, TCM issued Service Bulletin (SB) M92-9, which was applicable to all Continental 470's, 520's, and 550's. This SB instructed that "at overhaul or when necessary ... a 12 point nut must be used ... and torqued to 790 – 810 inch lbs." The accident engine was equipped with the earlier 6 point nuts which had a required torque of 690 – 710 in lbs. This nut is used on the crankcase through bolts and to secure the cylinders to the crankcase. It was also noted that the SB was not mandatory since the airplane was being operated under 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	69, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Without waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	April 23, 2009
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	March 28, 2009
Flight Time:	3500 hours (Total, all aircraft), 1800 hours (Total, this make and model), 30 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 11 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N2036Y
Model/Series:	A36	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	E-1366
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	August 1, 2009 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3800 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	77 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	5834 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	CONT MOTOR
ELT:	Installed, activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO 550-B
Registered Owner:	GALE DONALD H	Rated Power:	300 Horsepower
Operator:	GALE DONALD H	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	LBB,3282 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	16 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	15:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	315°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Few / 7000 ft AGL	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	6 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	230°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29.88 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	21°C / 2°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Lubbock, TX (LBB)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Dallas, TX (RBD)	Type of Clearance:	VFR flight following
Departure Time:	16:20 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Minor	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Minor	Latitude, Longitude:	33.490554,-101.587501(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	LeBaron, Timothy
Additional Participating Persons:	Mona Roberts; FAA Lubbock FSDO; Lubbock, TX John Kent ; Teledyne Continental Motors, Inc; Mobile, AL
Original Publish Date:	April 12, 2011
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=75453

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).