



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Tillamook, Oregon	Accident Number:	WPR09CA467
Date & Time:	September 27, 2009, 11:15 Local	Registration:	N90LP
Aircraft:	Beech 35-C33	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Fuel exhaustion	Injuries:	4 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The pilot stated during the preflight, he checked the fuel gages which indicated 12 gallons in the left wing and 18 gallons in the right wing. The right wing tank indicated just below half a tank. The pilot stated that "it is not possible to visually gauge the fuel quantity once the amount is below 30 gallons per tank," and that it is difficult to know exactly how much fuel is in the airplane. About 24 minutes after takeoff the pilot reported that the engine experienced initial indications of low fuel while operating from the left fuel tank. The pilot then switched to the right fuel tank. Instead of proceeding to his destination, 35 miles away, the pilot diverted to a closer airport, 15 miles away. After 5 minutes, the engine again demonstrated conditions consistent with low fuel. Not believing that he could make the runway, the pilot decided to make a precautionary landing in a cattle pasture about 1 mile from the airport. During the landing, the right main landing gear collapsed and the right wing was structurally damaged. Post-accident inspection of the fuel system found that both fuel tanks were nearly empty of fuel. Inspection of the right fuel gage indicated about 1/3, when in fact the fuel tank was empty.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: A loss of engine power due to fuel exhaustion as a result of the pilot's failure to visually verify that sufficient fuel was on board prior to flight. Contributing to the accident was a malfunctioning fuel gage.

Findings

Aircraft	Fuel quantity indicator - Malfunction
Aircraft	Fuel - Fluid level
Personnel issues	Incomplete action - Pilot
Personnel issues	Preflight inspection - Pilot

Factual Information

History of Flight

Landing	Off-field or emergency landing
Emergency descent	Fuel exhaustion (Defining event)

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Airline transport; Flight instructor	Age:	50, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane multi-engine; Airplane single-engine	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 1 Without waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	May 13, 2009
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	July 19, 2009
Flight Time:	18000 hours (Total, all aircraft), 250 hours (Total, this make and model), 11000 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 260 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 80 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N90LP
Model/Series:	35-C33	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	CD-1047
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	August 25, 2009 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3050 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	3108 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	CONT MOTOR
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	IO-470 SERIES
Registered Owner:	ERMAN DAVID G	Rated Power:	260 Horsepower
Operator:	ERMAN DAVID G	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KHIO,36 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	37 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	10:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	90°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:		Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.06 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	17°C / 8°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Gleneden Beach, OR (KS45)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Astoria, OR (KAST)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	10:45 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	Tillamook Airport KTMK	Runway Surface Type:	
Airport Elevation:		Runway Surface Condition:	
Runway Used:		IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	Forced landing

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	3 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	4 None	Latitude, Longitude:	45.420276,-123.814163

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	McKenny, Van
Additional Participating Persons:	Tony Moore; Federal Aviation Administration; Portland, OR
Original Publish Date:	December 29, 2009
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=74810

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).