

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location: Yellow Pine, Idaho Accident Number: WPR09LA343

Date & Time: July 14, 2009, 10:10 Local Registration: N71BS

Aircraft: Cessna U206G Aircraft Damage: Substantial

Defining Event: Collision during takeoff/land **Injuries:** 1 Serious, 1 Minor

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Instructional

Analysis

During a biennial flight review, at the suggestion of the evaluating instructor pilot, the Pilot-In-Command elected to land at a remote back-country airstrip where he had not made prior plans to land. After landing at the 800- to 900-foot-long strip, the pilot took off in the high-density-altitude environment without having first completed an aircraft performance calculation or checking his airplane's outside air temperature gauge. Although the pilot reported that there did not seem to be any issues with the engine producing full power, soon after liftoff the airplane struck a number of pine trees and descended into the terrain. A postaccident inspection of the airplane did not find any evidence of powerplant anomalies, but did reveal that the elevator trim was set at a five degrees tap up (airplane nose down) position, and that the flaps were extended 25 degrees even though the cockpit indicator indicated that they were at 20 degrees.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's failure to maintain clearance from the trees while taking off in a high-density altitude. Contributing to the accident were the pilot's failure to perform pre-takeoff performance calculations, his positioning of the elevator trim in a nose-down position, and the discrepancy between the airplane's flap positioning lever and the actual position of the flaps.

Findings

Aircraft TE flap position ind system - Malfunction

Aircraft Elevator tab control system - Incorrect use/operation

Environmental issues Tree(s) - Contributed to outcome

Aircraft Altitude - Not attained/maintained

Environmental issues High density altitude - Effect on operation

Personnel issues Aircraft control - Pilot

Page 2 of 7 WPR09LA343

Factual Information

History of Flight

Initial climb	Collision during takeoff/land (Defining event)
Initial climb	Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)

On July 14, 2009, about 1010 mountain daylight time, a Cessna U206G, N71BS, collided with trees just after taking off from a remote airstrip near, Yellow Pine, Idaho. The private pilot received minor injuries; his instructor pilot received serious injuries, and the airplane, which was owned by the private pilot, sustained substantial damage. The Title 14 Code of Federal Regulations, Part 91 Flight Review evaluation flight, was being conducted in visual meteorological conditions. The flight initially departed Hailey, Idaho, at 0750, and had landed at three other back-county airstrips prior to the accident. No flight plan had been filed.

According to the private pilot, who was acting as pilot-in-command (PIC), the purpose of the flight was for him to receive a signoff for a biennial flight review. Prior to landing at the strip where the accident took place, he and his instructor landed at three other "back-county" airstrips. Then as they flew near Yellow Pine, the instructor suggested to the PIC that they land at the Simonds Airstrip. Although the PIC had not planned to go into the 800 to 900 foot-long airstrip, had not been in there before, and had not familiarized himself with it prior to the flight, he elected to make the landing anyway. He said that he made that decision because one of the other airstrips he already landed at that day was about the same length.

The landing, which the PIC described as "routine," was made on the sloping rough surface of the runway, with the airplane coming to a stop near its uphill end. The two occupants then spent about four minutes discussing the landing and the upcoming takeoff and departure. The PIC then turned back onto the runway, adding power during the turn, and headed downhill for the takeoff.

According to the PIC, everything seemed normal until just after the airplane became airborne. At that point the amount of aft pressure he needed to apply to the control yoke to get the airplane to climb seemed to increase substantially. Then, no more than two seconds after passing the end of the runway, at about 50 feet above ground level (AGL), the airplane began to impact the tops of a group of dead standing pines, each of which had diameters of between six to ten inches. Soon thereafter the airplane descended rapidly into the terrain.

During a post-accident phone interview, the pilot said that the temperature at the time of the accident was between 50 and 60 degrees Fahrenheit, and the field elevation was 5,243 feet mean sea level (MSL). These ambient conditions resulted in a density altitude of about 6,300 feet (based upon 55 degrees). When asked if he had done any performance calculations prior to either the landing or takeoff, he stated that he had not. When asked if he had checked his

Page 3 of 7 WPR09LA343

airplane's Outside Air Temperature (OAT) gauge prior to the takeoff, he said that he had not. During the same interview, the pilot said that he had landed at many of the back-country airstrips in the area over a period of many years, but would not have gone into this one except for the fact that the instructor suggested it.

During further discussions the PIC said that from the time he added power for the takeoff, until the plane started impacting the trees, he did not detect anything unusual about the engine, and that there had not been any missing, coughing sputtering, or rpm changes.

A post-accident inspection of the engine found fuel in the fuel pump, fuel distribution valve, and the fuel injector lines. Spark was produced at all spark leads by both of the magnetos. There was no evidence of engine anomalies or malfunctions that would have affected the performance of the airplane.

A post-accident inspection of the airframe found two issues of interest. The first was that the elevator trim had been set at the five degrees tab up (airplane nose down) position. The second was that although the flap position lever in the cockpit was in the 20 degrees extended position, the flap position jackscrew was determined to be extended 4.6 inches, which equates to a flap position of 25 degrees. According to Cessna Aircraft Company, both of these conditions may have contributed to the need for the pilot to apply more backpressure on the yoke just after liftoff than he had expected.

In further discussions with Cessna Aircraft Company it was determined that the discrepancy between the cockpit flap position indicator and the flap jackscrew was most likely from either 30 years of wear in the system since the airplane was manufactured in 1979, or as a result of adjustments made when the Supplemental Type Certificate (STC) which added the Short Takeoff and Landing (STOL) kit onto the airplane was performed.

In the pilot report that he submitted to the NTSB, the PIC stated, "For my airplane, this runway leaves too little margin for the unexpected." In addition, he stated that, "...it would have been helpful if the departure end trees were removed or shortened."

Page 4 of 7 WPR09LA343

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	50,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	June 5, 2009
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	July 17, 2007
Flight Time:	1944 hours (Total, all aircraft), 1400 hours (Total, this make and model), 1944 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 15 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 6 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Cessna	Registration:	N71BS
		5	
Model/Series:	U206G	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	U20605307
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	April 28, 2009 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3600 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2958 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	CONT MOTOR
ELT:	C126 installed, activated, aided in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	IO 520 SERIES
Registered Owner:	SWANSON BLAKE J	Rated Power:	285 Horsepower
Operator:	SWANSON BLAKE J	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Page 5 of 7 WPR09LA343

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:		Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:		Temperature/Dew Point:	13°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipita	ation	
Departure Point:	Yellow Pine, ID	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	McCall, ID (KMYL)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	10:10 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	Simonds Airstrip	Runway Surface Type:	Dirt
Airport Elevation:	5243 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry;Rough
Runway Used:		IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	900 ft / 37 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	None

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 Minor	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 Minor	Latitude, Longitude:	44.979442,-115.460556(est)

Page 6 of 7 WPR09LA343

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC): Anderson, Orrin

Additional Participating Persons:

Original Publish Date: March 3, 2010

Last Revision Date:

Investigation Class: Class

Note:

Investigation Docket: https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=74277

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 7 of 7 WPR09LA343