



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Winsted, Minnesota	Accident Number:	CEN09CA320
Date & Time:	May 21, 2009, 17:00 Local	Registration:	N3214L
Aircraft:	Beech B19	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Loss of control in flight	Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Instructional		

Analysis

During the third practice soft-field landing of the instructional flight, the student pilot flared the airplane and it entered a "full stall" at 5 to 7 feet above the grass runway. The airplane touched down and the flight instructor pulled back on the yoke in an attempt to recover the landing. The nose landing gear then struck the terrain and separated. Examination of the airplane revealed that the firewall and the top of the left wing were wrinkled. The flight instructor and student pilot were not injured. The flight instructor did not report any mechanical problems with the airplane.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The student pilot's improper flare during the soft-field landing. Contributing to the accident was the flight instructor's inadequate supervision during the landing.

Findings

Aircraft	Landing flare - Incorrect use/operation
Personnel issues	Incorrect action performance - Student/instructed pilot
Personnel issues	Monitoring other person - Instructor/check pilot

Factual Information

History of Flight

Landing-flare/touchdown	Loss of control in flight (Defining event)
Landing-flare/touchdown	Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)

Flight instructor Information

Certificate:	Airline transport; Commercial; Flight instructor	Age:	26, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Single-engine sea; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane multi-engine; Airplane single-engine; Instrument airplane	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 1 Without waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	January 26, 2009
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	November 18, 2008
Flight Time:	6900 hours (Total, all aircraft), 2500 hours (Total, this make and model), 6200 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 250 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 85 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 5 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Student pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	40, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Without waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	February 23, 2009
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	May 17, 2000
Flight Time:	110 hours (Total, all aircraft), 5 hours (Total, this make and model), 74 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 5 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 5 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N3214L
Model/Series:	B19	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	MB-829
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	2
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	April 24, 2009 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2150 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	16377 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	O-320-E3D
Registered Owner:	Great Lakes Aircraft, Inc.	Rated Power:	150 Horsepower
Operator:	Great Lakes Aircraft, Inc.	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:	Inflight Pilot Training, LLC	Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	7 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	290°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.06 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	21°C / 8°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	Eden Prairie, MN (FLM)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Winsted, MN (10D)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	16:15 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	Winsted Municipal Airport 10D	Runway Surface Type:	Grass/turf
Airport Elevation:		Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	27	IFR Approach:	Visual
Runway Length/Width:	3200 ft / 200 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop;Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	44.949722,-94.066665(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Sauer, Aaron
Additional Participating Persons:	Thomas F Hager; Federal Aviation Administration; Minneapolis, MN
Original Publish Date:	November 9, 2009
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=73921

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).