



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Salt Lake City, Utah	Incident Number:	WPR09IA123
Date & Time:	February 21, 2009, 11:12 Local	Registration:	N270YV
Aircraft:	Embraer EMB-120ER	Aircraft Damage:	Minor
Defining Event:	Ground collision	Injuries:	4 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 121: Air carrier - Scheduled		

Analysis

While taxiing on the ramp to their assigned terminal gate, the flight crew observed a stationary fuel truck parked to the right of their position. In order to ensure clearance, the captain positioned the airplane left of the taxiway centerline by 4 feet while the first officer monitored the clearance between the right wingtip and fuel truck. Subsequently, the right wing struck the fuel truck. The first officer stated that due to sun glare on the wing and fuel truck, he had a hard time judging the clearance between the wingtip and fuel truck. The wingtip damage was evaluated as minor.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this incident to be: The flight crew's failure to maintain clearance from the stationary vehicle while taxiing.

Findings

Personnel issues	Monitoring environment - Flight crew
Environmental issues	Ground vehicle - Awareness of condition
Environmental issues	Glare - Effect on operation

Factual Information

History of Flight

Taxi	Ground collision (Defining event)
------	-----------------------------------

On February 21, 2009, about 1112 mountain standard time, an Embraer EMB-120ER, N270YV, sustained minor damage when it struck an occupied stationary fuel truck while taxiing at the Salt Lake City International Airport (SLC), Salt Lake City, Utah. The airplane is registered to Wachovia Financial Services Inc. of Charlotte, North Carolina, and operated by SkyWest Airlines Inc., St. George, Utah, under the provisions of Title 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 121. The airline transport rated captain, commercial rated first officer, flight attendant, and mechanic onboard the airplane were not injured. The occupant in the fuel truck was not injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed and an instrument flight rules flight plan was filed for the maintenance reposition flight. The cross-country flight originated from Elko, Nevada at 0851 Pacific standard time and was destined for SLC.

The captain and first officer reported that after landing on runway 16R, the flight was cleared to taxi to spot 23. The flight crew exited the runway and upon reaching spot 23, contacted ramp control. The ramp controller cleared the flight to taxi to spot 2 (Gate Echo 2 Alpha). While taxiing along the taxiway centerline, the flight crew noticed a parked fuel truck ahead and to the right of the aircraft located within a non-movement area. The captain stated that he then positioned the airplane about four feet to the left of the taxiway centerline in an attempt to avoid the fuel truck. The first officer monitored the clearance between the right wing and fuel truck. Subsequently, the right wingtip of the airplane struck the fuel truck across from gate Echo 32. The flight crew stated that after the collision, they immediately stopped the airplane and shut down both engines. The first officer stated that he had a "hard time" judging the distance between the right wing and fuel truck due to sun glare on the wing and fuel truck.

Examination of the airplane by a Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) inspector revealed that the right wingtip sustained minor damage. The fuel truck exhibited a dent and scuffing along the fuel tank about mid-span.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Airline transport; Commercial	Age:	28, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 1 Without waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	June 1, 2008
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	February 9, 2009
Flight Time:	2711 hours (Total, all aircraft), 2547 hours (Total, this make and model), 917 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 184 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 49 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Co-pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	28, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane multi-engine; Airplane single-engine; Instrument airplane	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 1 Without waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	September 4, 2008
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	January 11, 2008
Flight Time:	1891 hours (Total, all aircraft), 343 hours (Total, this make and model), 92 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 30 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Embraer	Registration:	N270YV
Model/Series:	EMB-120ER	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Transport	Serial Number:	120.270
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	30
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	February 17, 2009 Continuous airworthiness	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	26433 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	2 Turbo prop
Airframe Total Time:	35851 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	P&W Canada
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	PW118
Registered Owner:	WACHOVIA FINANCIAL SERVICES INC	Rated Power:	1800 Horsepower
Operator:	SKYWEST AIRLINES INC	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	Commuter air carrier (135)
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	SWIA

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	SLC,4227 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	10:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	0°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	0°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	6°C / -8°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Elko, NV (EKO)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	Salt Lake City, UT (SLC)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	08:51 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	Salt Lake City Int. Airport SLC	Runway Surface Type:	
Airport Elevation:	4227 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	
Runway Used:		IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	None

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	4 None	Aircraft Damage:	Minor
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	4 None	Latitude, Longitude:	40.788333,-111.9775(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Cawthra, Joshua
Additional Participating Persons:	Scott Rollman; Federal Aviation Administration; Salt Lake City, UT Georgia Struhsaker; National Transportation Safety Board; Kona, HI
Original Publish Date:	August 13, 2009
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=73377

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).