

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location: Le Roy, New York Accident Number: ERA09CA160

Date & Time: February 7, 2009, 11:30 Local Registration: N3554Q

Aircraft: Cessna 172M Aircraft Damage: Substantial

Defining Event: Loss of control on ground **Injuries:** 1 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

Analysis

The pilot stated that a strong gust of wind pushed the airplane off the right side of the runway and into a snow bank during an aborted landing to runway 28. The airplane received damage to both wings and the vertical stabilizer. The pilot had also aborted two previous landing attempts. Winds reported at a nearby airport, about the time of the accident, were from 200 degrees at 14 knots, gusting to 22 knots. According to the airplane's owner's manual, the crosswind limit for pilots with "average" ability was 15 knots. The pilot reported no deficiencies with the performance and handling of the airplane.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's inadequate compensation for a crosswind during an aborted landing. Contributing to the accident was the pilot's decision to land in gusting crosswinds in excess of the manufacturer's recommended crosswind limit.

Findings

Personnel issues Aircraft control - Pilot

Environmental issues Snow removal service/equipment - Contributed to outcome

Environmental issues Crosswind - Response/compensation

Environmental issues Crosswind - Decision related to condition

Aircraft Crosswind correction - Not attained/maintained

Page 2 of 5 ERA09CA160

Factual Information

History of Flight

Takeoff	Loss of control on ground (Defining event)
Takeoff	Runway excursion

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	61,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	August 7, 2007
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	August 30, 2008
Flight Time:	142 hours (Total, all aircraft), 51 hours (Total, this make and model), 83 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Cessna	Registration:	N3554Q
Model/Series:	172M	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	17261672
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	December 12, 2008 100 hour	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2300 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	45 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	4776 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	LYCOMING
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	0-320 SERIES
Registered Owner:	SCHUBERT BROTHERS AVIATION INC	Rated Power:	180 Horsepower
Operator:	Rochester Air Center LLC	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Page 3 of 5 ERA09CA160

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	ROC,559 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	13 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	10:54 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	60°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 4500 ft AGL	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	14 knots / 22 knots	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	200°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29.94 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	9°C / 1°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Rochester, NY (ROC)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	Unknown
Destination:	Le Roy, NY (5G0)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	10:40 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:	Le Roy Airport 5G0	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	780 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	28	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	2540 ft / 60 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Go around

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	42.981388,-77.9375

Page 4 of 5 ERA09CA160

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Rayner, Brian
Additional Participating Persons:	Tom Williams; FAA/FSDO; Rochester, NY
Original Publish Date:	May 6, 2009
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=73337

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 5 of 5 ERA09CA160