

# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

Location:	Athens, Texas	Accident Number:	DEN08LA129
Date & Time:	July 26, 2008, 13:15 Local	<b>Registration:</b>	N6257E
Aircraft:	Cessna 172	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Aerodynamic stall/spin	Injuries:	1 Serious, 2 Minor
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

# Analysis

The pilot stated that prior to the accident flight, he told the fixed based operator that the airplane was "slightly off in performance" and the engine had a "tendency" to "build up carbon." On the day of the accident, the pilot fueled the airplane, and after thorough preflight and engine run-up checks that did not disclose any anomalies, he initiated the accident takeoff. The pilot stated that during the climb, there seemed to be a lack of engine power. A witness stated that the airplane "seemed to accelerate very slowly, however the engine sounded fine." The witness also stated that the airplane "continued to try to climb without much luck." The airplane started to descend, and the pilot stated that he attempted to maintain altitude. The pilot further stated that the engine power continued to decrease, and the stall horn sounded just above the tree tops. He attempted to "get the nose up" to expose the belly of the airplane to the obstacles ahead. The airplane impacted the trees and came to rest upright about one-half mile southwest of the airport. It was substantially damaged during the impact sequence. Postaccident examination of the airplane and engine did not reveal any mechanical malfunctions. The engine was started by investigators without hesitation and ran for several minutes. Maintenance records indicated that a "top overhaul" was conducted on the engine about 2 years prior to the accident, and that the last recorded annual inspection was about 10 years prior to the accident. The pilot did not hold a pilot certificate or current medical certificate.

# **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: A partial loss of engine power during initial climb due to undetermined reasons, which led to an uncontrolled descent and subsequent aerodynamic stall. Contributing to the accident was the pilot's improper preflight decision to attempt the flight with a suspected engine problem.

#### Findings

Aircraft	Angle of attack - Not attained/maintained	
Personnel issues	(general) - Pilot	
Personnel issues	Qualification/certification - Pilot	
Aircraft	(general) - Not specified	

# **Factual Information**

History of Flight	
Initial climb	Aerodynamic stall/spin (Defining event)
Uncontrolled descent	Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)

On July 26, 2008, approximately 1315 central daylight time, a Cessna 172, N6257E, owned and piloted by a non-certificated pilot, was substantially damaged when it impacted trees shortly after departure from Athens Municipal Airport, Athens, Texas. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The personal flight was being conducted under the provisions of Title 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91 without a flight plan. The pilot and front seat passenger sustained minor injuries; the rear seat passenger was seriously injured. The cross country flight was originating at the time of the accident and was en route to Liberty, Texas.

According to a telephone conversation with the pilot, he had flown to Athens to pick up his daughter. After fueling, and a thorough preflight and run-up, the airplane departed runway 17 (3,988 feet by 60 feet, asphalt). The pilot reported no anomalies prior to takeoff. He stated that during the climb, there seemed to be a lack of power. The airplane started to descend and he attempted to maintain altitude. The pilot stated that the rpms continued to decrease and the stall horn sounded just above the tree tops. He tried to "get the nose up" to expose the belly of the airplane to the obstacles ahead. The airplane impacted the trees and came to rest upright, 1/2 mile southwest of the airport.

According to the airport manager who witnessed the accident, just prior to departure, the pilot had the airplane topped off and loaded two large bags into the airplane. He reported that the airplane "seemed to accelerate very slowly, however the engine sounded fine." He stated that at "two thousand feet down the runway" the pilot "pulled the nose of the aircraft up." The airplane "continued to try to climb without much luck", turned to miss the taller trees, and eventually disappeared.

According to the Federal Aviation Administration Airworthiness (FAA) inspector who traveled to the scene, both wings were crushed aft, the landing gear had collapsed, and the firewall was wrinkled. The airplane was recovered and relocated to Lancaster, Texas, for further examination.

In a written statement submitted by the pilot, he had spoken with the "FBO operator" about the airplane being "slightly off in performance" and the FBO operator suggested he "burn off [the] carbon" prior to takeoff. The pilot reported that he ran the engine to 1,800 rpm, leaned the mixture to the point that the engine "quit", then enrichened the mixture and allowed the engine to run an additional five minutes before takeoff. The pilot wrote that he felt the "tendency" of

the airplane engine "to build up carbon" should be considered in this accident.

On August 29, 2008, the maintenance records, airframe, airplane systems, and engine were examined by representatives from Cessna Aircraft, and Teledyne Continental Motors, under the auspices of the FAA. According to the maintenance records, a "top overhaul" was conducted on the engine in Brownsville, Texas, on November 13, 2006. No annual inspection was recorded to coincide with this maintenance. The most recent annual inspection recorded in the records took place on May 22, 1989. The engine started without hesitation or issues and ran for several minutes. An examination of the remaining systems revealed no anomalies.

According to the FAA database the pilot did not hold a pilot certificate or current medical certificate.

The closest weather observation station recorded a temperature of 91 degrees Fahrenheit. Density altitude was calculated to be between 2,509 and 2,804 feet. A weight and balance calculation revealed the airplane was at an estimated gross weight of 2,037 pounds, and within the performance envelope at the time of take-off. According to Cessna Aircraft, the airplane would have required no less than 1,604 feet to clear a 50 foot obstacle with an expected rate of climb of 647 feet per minute.

#### **Pilot Information**

Certificate:	None	Age:	52,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	None	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	None None	Last FAA Medical Exam:	May 1, 2004
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	600 hours (Total, all aircraft), 6 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

### Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Cessna	Registration:	N6257E
Model/Series:	172	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	46357
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	May 1, 1989 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2200 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:		Engine Manufacturer:	Teledyne Continental Motors
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	0-300A
Registered Owner:	On file	Rated Power:	145 Horsepower
Operator:	On file	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

### Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
<b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b>	TYR,544 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	24 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	12:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	45°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	10 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	240°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.11 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	33°C / 20°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Athens, TX (F44)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Liberty, TX (T78)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	13:15 Local	Type of Airspace:	

### **Airport Information**

Airport:	Athens F44	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	444 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	17	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	3988 ft / 60 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	None

# Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Minor	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 Minor	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Serious, 2 Minor	Latitude, Longitude:	32.163612,-95.82833

#### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Rodi, Jennifer
Additional Participating Persons:	Marcus Taite; Flight Standards District Office; Dallas, TX Mike Koontz; Cessna Aircraft Company; Wichita, KS John Kent; Teledyne Continental Motors; Mobile, AL
Original Publish Date:	April 15, 2009
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=68533

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available here.