



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Santa Fe, New Mexico	Accident Number:	DEN08LA064
Date & Time:	March 12, 2008, 11:40 Local	Registration:	N17662
Aircraft:	Spartan 7W	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Aircraft structural failure	Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The pilot was practicing full stop landings and he made a "firm" landing. Shortly thereafter, the right main landing gear collapsed and the airplane began veering to the right. The pilot made corrective inputs but could not maintain directional control. The airplane departed the runway. The left main landing gear then collapsed. Both wings were bent and the fuselage sustained bulkhead damage. According to NTSB's Materials Laboratory report, the right main landing gear strut "appeared relatively rough and light gray consistent with overstress fracture of a cast aluminum alloy." Examination of the corner radius where the outboard support flange intersects the vertical tube "showed areas with a smooth faceted appearance with curving boundaries consistent with fatigue." Examination of the fractures faces of the left main landing gear strut "showed features indicative of overstress separation...An area of the fracture surface was smooth and shiny, features consistent with smearing associated with the compression side of an overstress fracture in bending."

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: Fatigue failure of the right main landing gear, rendering directional control impossible and causing an overload failure of the left main landing gear.

Findings

Aircraft	Main gear strut/axle/truck - Failure
Aircraft	Main gear strut/axle/truck - Fatigue/wear/corrosion
Aircraft	Directional control - Attain/maintain not possible
Aircraft	Main gear strut/axle/truck - Capability exceeded

Factual Information

History of Flight

Landing-landing roll

Aircraft structural failure (Defining event)

On March 12, 2008, at 1140 mountain daylight time, a Spartan 7W, N17662, registered to and operated by the pilot, was substantially damaged when the main landing gear collapsed during a stop and go landing on runway 33 at Santa Fe Municipal Airport (SAF), Santa Fe, New Mexico. Visual meteorological conditions (VMC) prevailed at the time of the accident. The personal flight was being conducted under the provisions of Title 14 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) Part 91 without a flight plan. The pilot and a pilot-rated passenger were not injured. The local flight originated at SAF approximately 1030.

According to the pilot's accident report, he was practicing full stop landings on runway 33. The airplane landed "firmly" on the main landing gear and on centerline. Shortly thereafter, the right main landing gear collapsed and the airplane began veering to the right. The pilot made corrective inputs but could not maintain directional control. The airplane departed the runway. The left main landing gear then collapsed. Both wings were bent and the fuselage sustained bulkhead damage.

The airplane was removed from the runway, taken to a hangar, and placed on jacks. Both left and right main trunions were sent to NTSB's Materials Laboratory for examination. According to the metallurgist's factual report, the fracture surfaces of the right main landing gear strut "appeared relatively rough and light gray consistent with overstress fracture of a cast aluminum alloy." Examination of the corner radius where the outboard support flange intersects the vertical tube "showed areas with a smooth faceted appearance with curving boundaries consistent with fatigue." The fracture faces of the left main landing gear strut "showed features indicative of overstress separation...An area of the fracture surface was smooth and shiny, features consistent with smearing associated with the compression side of an overstress fracture in bending."

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	68, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Single-engine sea; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	November 1, 2007
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	December 1, 2007
Flight Time:	5037 hours (Total, all aircraft), 60 hours (Total, this make and model), 4985 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 16 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 5 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Information

Certificate:	Airline transport; Commercial; Flight engineer	Age:	53, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane multi-engine; Airplane single-engine; Instrument airplane	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 1 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	April 1, 2007
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:			

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Spartan	Registration:	N17662
Model/Series:	7W	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	28
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tailwheel	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	March 1, 2008 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	4400 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	2 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	9410 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	Pratt & Whitney
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	R-985AN-14-8
Registered Owner:	Ronald E. Tarrson	Rated Power:	450 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	SAF,6348 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:	11:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	10 knots / 18 knots	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	350°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.05 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	14°C / -8°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Santa Fe, MA (SAF)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	(SAF)	Type of Clearance:	VFR
Departure Time:	10:30 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	Santa Fe Municipal SAF	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	6348 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	33	IFR Approach:	Unknown
Runway Length/Width:	6307 ft / 150 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	35.6175,-106.093612

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Scott, Arnold
Additional Participating Persons:	Richard S Cramer; FAA Flight Standards District Office; Albuquerque, NM
Original Publish Date:	August 28, 2008
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=67688

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).