



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Marble Canyon, Arizona	Accident Number:	LAX08CA075
Date & Time:	March 14, 2008, 10:00 Local	Registration:	N9374S
Aircraft:	Beech C23	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	4 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The pilot reported that after overflying the airport, he decided to land on runway 21. He extended the wing flaps to the 25-degree position during the approach to landing. The pilot observed that the wind sock was about halfway extended, and he estimated that the wind was from 270 degrees at 20 knots, with gusts to 25 knots. During the landing flare, the crosswind suddenly decreased in intensity, and the airplane impacted hard onto the runway's surface. Thereafter, the airplane veered right and exited the runway. Inspection of the airframe revealed that the nosewheel and the left main landing gear separated from the airframe, the windshield cracked, and the vertical stabilizer was bent. The pilot did not indicate that he had experienced any mechanical malfunction or abnormality with his airplane prior to the mishap.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's inadequate compensation for the wind conditions and failure to maintain an adequate airspeed during the flare. Contributing to the accident were wind gusts and a crosswind.

Findings

Environmental issues	Gusts - Not specified
Environmental issues	Crosswind - Not specified
Aircraft	Crosswind correction - Not attained/maintained
Aircraft	Airspeed - Not attained/maintained

Factual Information

History of Flight

Landing-flare/touchdown	Hard landing
--------------------------------	--------------

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	50, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	
Instructor Rating(s):		Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3	Last FAA Medical Exam:	May 1, 2006
Occupational Pilot:		Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	241 hours (Total, all aircraft), 154 hours (Total, this make and model), 17 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 16 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N9374S
Model/Series:	C23	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal; Utility	Serial Number:	M-1672
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	
Date/Type of Last Inspection:		Certified Max Gross Wt.:	
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:		Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:		Engine Model/Series:	O-360-A4K
Registered Owner:	Arizona Thunderbolts, LLC	Rated Power:	
Operator:	Russell L. Gardner	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Few	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	20 knots / 25 knots	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	270°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:		Temperature/Dew Point:	
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Deer Valley, AZ (DVT)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Marble Canyon, AZ (L41)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	08:00 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	Marble Canyon L41	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	3603 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	21	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	3715 ft / 35 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop;Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	3 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	
Total Injuries:	4 None	Latitude, Longitude:	36.810832,-111.644447

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Pollack, Wayne
Additional Participating Persons:	Chris Clark; Federal Aviation Administration; Scottsdale, AZ
Original Publish Date:	April 30, 2008
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=67685

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).