



# Aviation Investigation Final Report

---

<b>Location:</b>	Benson, Arizona	<b>Accident Number:</b>	SEA08LA066
<b>Date &amp; Time:</b>	November 11, 2007, 12:30 Local	<b>Registration:</b>	N9592U
<b>Aircraft:</b>	Grumman American AA-5A	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Defining Event:</b>		<b>Injuries:</b>	4 None
<b>Flight Conducted Under:</b>	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

---

## Analysis

The pilot flew over the airport to check the wind, and determined the wind was out of the west. He flew a traffic pattern for runway 28. On final approach, he extended full flaps, and said he established an airspeed of 75 mph. Approximately 20 feet above the runway, the stall horn came on, and the airspeed had dropped to 60 mph. He added power, but the airplane drifted to the left, and landed off the runway in rough terrain. The pilot said the landing was hard, and the airplane bounced and skidded to a stop. The airplane's nose and left main landing gear were separated from the fuselage, and the surfaces of both wings were wrinkled. A witness at the airport said that the airplane's final approach to runway 28 was unusually low, flat and very fast. Additionally, he said the wind appeared to be from 140 to 150 degrees at approximately 8 knots and gusting to 13 knots. The pilot said that after he got out of the airplane he noticed that the wind was from the east, and a short time later the windsock had shifted back to a westerly direction again.

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's inadequate compensation for wind conditions, and his failure to maintain sufficient airspeed to avoid a stall. Contributing to the accident was a variable tailwind.

## Findings

---

## Factual Information

### History of Flight

---

On November 11, 2007, approximately 1230 mountain standard time, a Grumman American AA-5A, N9592U, was substantially damaged when it landed hard and impacted irregular terrain at Benson Municipal Airport (E95), Benson, Arizona. The private pilot and his three passengers were not injured. Valley Aircraft Restoration Society was operating the airplane under Title 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed for the personal, cross-country flight, which originated from Chandler, Arizona, about 1 hour 20 minutes before the accident. No flight plan had been filed.

The pilot said that he flew over the runway to check the wind conditions by looking at the windsock. It appeared to him that the wind was out of the west, and he decided to land on runway 28. On final approach, he extended full flaps and noted that the airspeed was at 75 miles per hour. Approximately 20 feet above the runway, the stall horn came on and the airspeed had dropped to 60 miles per hour. He added power, but the airplane drifted to the left and landed off the runway in rough terrain. The pilot said the landing was hard, and the airplane bounced and skidded to a stop. The airplane's nose and left main landing gear were separated from the fuselage and the surfaces of both wings were wrinkled.

A witness at the airport said that the airplane's final approach to runway 28 was unusually low, flat and very fast. Additionally, he said the wind appeared to be from 140 to 150 degrees at approximately 8 knots and gusting to 13 knots. The pilot said that after he got out of the airplane he noticed that the wind was from the east and a short time later the windsock had shifted back to a westerly direction again.

## Pilot Information

<b>Certificate:</b>	Private	<b>Age:</b>	44, Male
<b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>	Single-engine land	<b>Seat Occupied:</b>	Left
<b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Restraint Used:</b>	
<b>Instrument Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Second Pilot Present:</b>	No
<b>Instructor Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Toxicology Performed:</b>	No
<b>Medical Certification:</b>	Class 3 With waivers/limitations	<b>Last FAA Medical Exam:</b>	June 1, 2006
<b>Occupational Pilot:</b>	No	<b>Last Flight Review or Equivalent:</b>	December 1, 2005
<b>Flight Time:</b>	127 hours (Total, all aircraft), 35 hours (Total, this make and model), 53 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

<b>Aircraft Make:</b>	Grumman American	<b>Registration:</b>	N9592U
<b>Model/Series:</b>	AA-5A	<b>Aircraft Category:</b>	Airplane
<b>Year of Manufacture:</b>		<b>Amateur Built:</b>	
<b>Airworthiness Certificate:</b>	Normal	<b>Serial Number:</b>	AA5A-0092
<b>Landing Gear Type:</b>	Tricycle	<b>Seats:</b>	4
<b>Date/Type of Last Inspection:</b>	November 1, 2007 Annual	<b>Certified Max Gross Wt.:</b>	2200 lbs
<b>Time Since Last Inspection:</b>	2 Hrs	<b>Engines:</b>	1 Reciprocating
<b>Airframe Total Time:</b>	1737 Hrs as of last inspection	<b>Engine Manufacturer:</b>	Lycoming
<b>ELT:</b>	Installed, not activated	<b>Engine Model/Series:</b>	O-320-E2G
<b>Registered Owner:</b>	Valley Aircraft Restoration Society	<b>Rated Power:</b>	150 Horsepower
<b>Operator:</b>		<b>Operating Certificate(s) Held:</b>	None

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

<b>Conditions at Accident Site:</b>	Visual (VMC)	<b>Condition of Light:</b>	Day
<b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b>	FHU,4719 ft msl	<b>Distance from Accident Site:</b>	24 Nautical Miles
<b>Observation Time:</b>	12:56 Local	<b>Direction from Accident Site:</b>	165°
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Clear	<b>Visibility</b>	10 miles
<b>Lowest Ceiling:</b>	None	<b>Visibility (RVR):</b>	
<b>Wind Speed/Gusts:</b>	6 knots /	<b>Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Wind Direction:</b>	240°	<b>Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Altimeter Setting:</b>	29.79 inches Hg	<b>Temperature/Dew Point:</b>	22°C / 0°C
<b>Precipitation and Obscuration:</b>	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
<b>Departure Point:</b>	Mesa, AZ (FFZ )	<b>Type of Flight Plan Filed:</b>	None
<b>Destination:</b>	Benson, AZ (E95 )	<b>Type of Clearance:</b>	None
<b>Departure Time:</b>	11:20 Local	<b>Type of Airspace:</b>	

## Airport Information

<b>Airport:</b>	Benson Municipal Airport E95	<b>Runway Surface Type:</b>	Asphalt
<b>Airport Elevation:</b>	3829 ft msl	<b>Runway Surface Condition:</b>	Dry
<b>Runway Used:</b>	28	<b>IFR Approach:</b>	None
<b>Runway Length/Width:</b>	4000 ft / 75 ft	<b>VFR Approach/Landing:</b>	Full stop

## Wreckage and Impact Information

<b>Crew Injuries:</b>	1 None	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Passenger Injuries:</b>	3 None	<b>Aircraft Fire:</b>	None
<b>Ground Injuries:</b>	N/A	<b>Aircraft Explosion:</b>	None
<b>Total Injuries:</b>	4 None	<b>Latitude, Longitude:</b>	31.999721,-110.35778

## Administrative Information

<b>Investigator In Charge (IIC):</b>	Struhsaker, James
<b>Additional Participating Persons:</b>	Craig Roberts; Federal Aviation Administration; Scottsdale, AZ
<b>Original Publish Date:</b>	August 28, 2008
<b>Last Revision Date:</b>	
<b>Investigation Class:</b>	<a href="#">Class</a>
<b>Note:</b>	
<b>Investigation Docket:</b>	<a href="https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=67421">https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=67421</a>

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).