

# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

| Location:               | Laurel, Montana                           | Accident Number: | LAX07CA288  |
|-------------------------|---|------------------|-------------|
| Date & Time:            | September 30, 2007, 15:05 Local           | Registration:    | N41695      |
| Aircraft:               | Bellanca 7GCBC                            | Aircraft Damage: | Substantial |
| Defining Event:         |   | Injuries:        | 2 None      |
| Flight Conducted Under: | Part 91: General aviation - Instructional |                  |             |

## Analysis

During an instructional flight, the left main landing gear assembly broke during rollout following a normal landing. An examination of the gear assembly revealed evidence that a step had been spot welded onto the gear. Over time, corrosion developed in the vicinity of the weld, and the gear fractured due to corrosion induced fatigue and separated. No evidence of gear maintenance specific to the welding of the step to the gear assembly was documented in the airplane's maintenance records.

## **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: Corrosion and fatigue-induced failure of the landing gear structure.

## Findings

Occurrence #1: AIRFRAME/COMPONENT/SYSTEM FAILURE/MALFUNCTION Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings 1. (C) LANDING GEAR, MAIN GEAR - CORRODED 2. (C) LANDING GEAR,MAIN GEAR - FATIGUE 3. (C) LANDING GEAR,MAIN GEAR - SEPARATION

## **Factual Information**

On September 30, 2007, about 1505 mountain daylight time, a Bellanca 7GCBC, N41695, experienced the breakage and separation of its left main landing gear during landing rollout at the Laurel Municipal Airport, Laurel, Montana. The airplane was owned and operated by the private pilot, who was receiving flight instruction from his airline transport certificated flight instructor (CFI). The airplane was substantially damaged. Neither pilot was injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time, and no flight plan had been filed. The flight was performed under the provisions of 14 CFR Part 91, and it originated from Billings, Montana, about 1400.

The CFI reported to the National Transportation Safety Board investigator that he was providing transition flight training to the student, and they had performed a series of uneventful takeoffs and landings. During the accident landing down the center of runway 22, the left main gear separated at the point where a step had been attached, and as the airplane rolled to a stop, the left wing's lift strut buckled.

The Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) coordinator reported that his examination of the airframe revealed evidence that the step had been spot welded onto the spring steel gear assembly. The assembly fatigued and broke in the vicinity of the spot weld. The FAA coordinator stated that evidence of corrosion was observed in the area where the gear assembly fractured. No evidence of gear maintenance, including the welding of the step to the gear assembly, was documented in the airplane's maintenance records.

| Certificate:              | Airline transport; Flight instructor  | Age:                              | 77,Male          |
|---------------------------|---|-----------------------------------|------------------|
| Airplane Rating(s):       | Single-engine land; Multi-engine<br>land  | Seat Occupied:                    |                  |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None  | Restraint Used:                   |                  |
| Instrument Rating(s):     | Airplane  | Second Pilot Present:             | Yes              |
| Instructor Rating(s):     | Airplane multi-engine; Airplane<br>single-engine; Instrument airplane   | Toxicology Performed:             | No               |
| Medical Certification:    | Class 3   | Last FAA Medical Exam:            | February 1, 2007 |
| Occupational Pilot:       |   | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: |                  |
| Flight Time:              | 17415 hours (Total, all aircraft), 9 hours (Total, this make and model), 52 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 15 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft) |                                   |                  |

## **Flight instructor Information**

## **Student pilot Information**

| Certificate:              | Private   | Age:   | 53,Male              |
|---------------------------|---|--|----------------------|
| Airplane Rating(s):       | Single-engine land  | Seat Occupied:                                     |                      |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None  | Restraint Used:                                    |                      |
| Instrument Rating(s):     | None  | Second Pilot Present:                              | Yes                  |
| Instructor Rating(s):     |   | Toxicology Performed:                              | No                   |
| Medical Certification:    | Class 3   | Last FAA Medical Exam:                             | June 1, 2006         |
| Occupational Pilot:       |   | Last Flight Review or Equivalent:                  |                      |
| Flight Time:              | 154 hours (Total, all aircraft), 5 hours<br>aircraft), 5 hours (Last 30 days, all air | s (Total, this make and model), 5 hours<br>rcraft) | s (Last 90 days, all |

# Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

| Aircraft Make:                   | Bellanca             | Registration:                     | N41695          |
|----------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Model/Series:                    | 7GCBC                | Aircraft Category:                | Airplane        |
| Year of Manufacture:             |                      | Amateur Built:                    |                 |
| Airworthiness Certificate:       | Restricted (Special) | Serial Number:                    | 593-73          |
| Landing Gear Type:               | Tailwheel            | Seats:                            |                 |
| Date/Type of Last<br>Inspection: |                      | Certified Max Gross Wt.:          |                 |
| Time Since Last Inspection:      |                      | Engines:                          | 1 Reciprocating |
| Airframe Total Time:             |                      | Engine Manufacturer:              | Lycoming        |
| ELT:                             |                      | Engine Model/Series:              | 0-320-A2B       |
| Registered Owner:                | Robert J. Guilfoyle  | Rated Power:                      |                 |
| Operator:                        |                      | Operating Certificate(s)<br>Held: | None            |

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site:            | Visual (VMC)                 | Condition of Light:                     | Day      |
|---|------------------------------|---|----------|
| <b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b> |                              | Distance from Accident Site:            |          |
| Observation Time:                       |                              | Direction from Accident Site:           |          |
| Lowest Cloud Condition:                 | Clear                        | Visibility                              | 10 miles |
| Lowest Ceiling:                         | None                         | Visibility (RVR):                       |          |
| Wind Speed/Gusts:                       | /                            | Turbulence Type<br>Forecast/Actual:     | /        |
| Wind Direction:                         |                              | Turbulence Severity<br>Forecast/Actual: | /        |
| Altimeter Setting:                      |                              | Temperature/Dew Point:                  |          |
| Precipitation and Obscuration:          | No Obscuration; No Precipita | tion                                    |          |
| Departure Point:                        | Laurel, MT (S68 )            | Type of Flight Plan Filed:              | None     |
| Destination:                            | Laurel, MT (S68 )            | Type of Clearance:                      | None     |
| Departure Time:                         |                              | Type of Airspace:                       |          |

# **Airport Information**

| Airport:             | Laurel Municipal 6S8 | Runway Surface Type:             | Asphalt |
|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------------------|---------|
| Airport Elevation:   | 3517 ft msl          | <b>Runway Surface Condition:</b> | Dry     |
| Runway Used:         | 22                   | IFR Approach:                    | None    |
| Runway Length/Width: | 5200 ft / 75 ft      | VFR Approach/Landing:            |         |

# Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries:         | 2 None | Aircraft Damage:        | Substantial |
|------------------------|--------|-------------------------|-------------|
| Passenger<br>Injuries: |        | Aircraft Fire:          | None        |
| Ground Injuries:       | N/A    | Aircraft Explosion:     |             |
| Total Injuries:        | 2 None | Latitude,<br>Longitude: |             |

#### **Administrative Information**

| Investigator In Charge (IIC):        | Pollack, Wayne  |
|--------------------------------------|---|
| Additional Participating<br>Persons: | Will Willbanks; Federal Aviation Administration; Helena, MT   |
| Original Publish Date:               | November 29, 2007   |
| Last Revision Date:                  |   |
| Investigation Class:                 | <u>Class</u>  |
| Note:                                | This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB. |
| Investigation Docket:                | https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=66972  |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available here.