



# Aviation Investigation Final Report

---

<b>Location:</b>	Farmington, New Mexico	<b>Accident Number:</b>	DEN07LA049
<b>Date &amp; Time:</b>	January 12, 2007, 12:15 Local	<b>Registration:</b>	N8183E
<b>Aircraft:</b>	Beech A36	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Defining Event:</b>		<b>Injuries:</b>	3 None
<b>Flight Conducted Under:</b>	Part 91: General aviation - Instructional		

---

## Analysis

The pilot-rated dual student and flight instructor were on final approach to land after a practice instrument approach. The dual student was flying, and, according to statements by the flight instructor and student, he initiated the landing flare too high above the runway and allowed the nose of the airplane to get too high. The instructor told him to lower the nose, and then assisted him in lowering it slightly. As the student continued the approach and reduced engine power, the airspeed deteriorated until the stall warning horn came on. Prior to touchdown, a gust of wind raised the left wing, and the right wing struck the runway. The flight instructor took control and landed the airplane. In the NTSB Pilot/Operator Aircraft Accident/Incident Report submitted by the instructor and the student, the section titled, Recommendation (How could this accident been prevented?), contained, in part, the following statement: "This mishap was primarily a function of the student flaring high...and running out of airspeed, causing a stall. The high flare was compounded by the gusty crosswind conditions and not taking timely, positive action to go around"

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot-rated dual student's failure to maintain sufficient airspeed during the landing approach to avoid a stall. Also causal was the flight instructor's failure to provide adequate supervision. Factors associated with the accident are an inadvertent stall, and wind gusts.

## Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF CONTROL - IN FLIGHT

Phase of Operation: APPROACH - VFR PATTERN - FINAL APPROACH

### Findings

1. (C) AIRSPEED(VS) - NOT MAINTAINED - DUAL STUDENT
2. (F) STALL - INADVERTENT - DUAL STUDENT
3. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - GUSTS
4. (C) SUPERVISION - INADEQUATE - PILOT IN COMMAND(CFI)

-----

Occurrence #2: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER

Phase of Operation: DESCENT - UNCONTROLLED

### Findings

5. TERRAIN CONDITION - RUNWAY

## Factual Information

On January 12, 2007, approximately 1215 mountain standard time, a Beech A36, N8183E, piloted by a private pilot, was substantially damaged when the right wing struck the ground during landing at Four Corners Regional Airport (FMN), Farmington, New Mexico. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The instructional flight was being conducted under the provisions of Title 14 CFR Part 91 without a flight plan. The pilot, flight instructor, and passenger on board the airplane were not injured. The local flight originated from Farmington, New Mexico, approximately 1050 mountain standard time.

The following is based on the operator's accident report, statements the pilot gave to the operator, and FAA telephone notes taken during interviews with the pilots: The pilot had made three practice ILS approaches to runway 25. He then circled to land on runway 23 and elected to use 12 degrees of flaps and an approach speed of 85 knots. As the airplane crossed the runway threshold, about 20 feet above the runway, the pilot thought he was too low and raised the nose. The instructor told him to put the nose down, and then he "gently" pushed the nose down. The pilot then reduced power. When the airplane was about 10 feet above the runway, the pilot pulled nose up again and the stall warning horn sounded. The instructor said a gust of wind lifted the left wing and the right wing struck the runway. The instructor took control and landed the airplane.

### Pilot Information

<b>Certificate:</b>	Commercial; Flight instructor	<b>Age:</b>	29, Male
<b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	<b>Seat Occupied:</b>	Right
<b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Restraint Used:</b>	
<b>Instrument Rating(s):</b>	Airplane	<b>Second Pilot Present:</b>	Yes
<b>Instructor Rating(s):</b>	Airplane multi-engine; Airplane single-engine; Instrument airplane	<b>Toxicology Performed:</b>	No
<b>Medical Certification:</b>	Class 1 With waivers/limitations	<b>Last FAA Medical Exam:</b>	October 1, 2006
<b>Occupational Pilot:</b>	Yes	<b>Last Flight Review or Equivalent:</b>	October 1, 2006
<b>Flight Time:</b>	1129 hours (Total, all aircraft), 665 hours (Total, this make and model), 1022 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 259 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 25 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 6 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

## Pilot Information

<b>Certificate:</b>	Private	<b>Age:</b>	24, Male
<b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>	Single-engine land	<b>Seat Occupied:</b>	Left
<b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Restraint Used:</b>	
<b>Instrument Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Second Pilot Present:</b>	Yes
<b>Instructor Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Toxicology Performed:</b>	No
<b>Medical Certification:</b>	Class 1 With waivers/limitations	<b>Last FAA Medical Exam:</b>	February 1, 2006
<b>Occupational Pilot:</b>	Yes	<b>Last Flight Review or Equivalent:</b>	December 1, 2006
<b>Flight Time:</b>	161 hours (Total, all aircraft), 147 hours (Total, this make and model), 108 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 58 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 3 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

<b>Aircraft Make:</b>	Beech	<b>Registration:</b>	N8183E
<b>Model/Series:</b>	A36	<b>Aircraft Category:</b>	Airplane
<b>Year of Manufacture:</b>		<b>Amateur Built:</b>	
<b>Airworthiness Certificate:</b>	Utility	<b>Serial Number:</b>	E-2612
<b>Landing Gear Type:</b>	Retractable - Tricycle	<b>Seats:</b>	6
<b>Date/Type of Last Inspection:</b>	January 1, 2007 Continuous airworthiness	<b>Certified Max Gross Wt.:</b>	3650 lbs
<b>Time Since Last Inspection:</b>		<b>Engines:</b>	1 Reciprocating
<b>Airframe Total Time:</b>	10149 Hrs as of last inspection	<b>Engine Manufacturer:</b>	Continental
<b>ELT:</b>	Installed, not activated	<b>Engine Model/Series:</b>	IO-550-B
<b>Registered Owner:</b>	Mesa Pilot Development, Inc.	<b>Rated Power:</b>	300 Horsepower
<b>Operator:</b>		<b>Operating Certificate(s) Held:</b>	None

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

<b>Conditions at Accident Site:</b>	Visual (VMC)	<b>Condition of Light:</b>	Day
<b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b>	FMN,5506 ft msl	<b>Distance from Accident Site:</b>	
<b>Observation Time:</b>	11:53 Local	<b>Direction from Accident Site:</b>	
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>		<b>Visibility</b>	10 miles
<b>Lowest Ceiling:</b>	Broken / 5500 ft AGL	<b>Visibility (RVR):</b>	
<b>Wind Speed/Gusts:</b>	16 knots / 22 knots	<b>Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Wind Direction:</b>	180°	<b>Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Altimeter Setting:</b>	29.75 inches Hg	<b>Temperature/Dew Point:</b>	11°C / -2°C
<b>Precipitation and Obscuration:</b>	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
<b>Departure Point:</b>	Farmington, NM (FMN )	<b>Type of Flight Plan Filed:</b>	None
<b>Destination:</b>	Farmington, NM (FMN )	<b>Type of Clearance:</b>	None
<b>Departure Time:</b>	10:50 Local	<b>Type of Airspace:</b>	

## Airport Information

<b>Airport:</b>	Four Corners Regional FMN	<b>Runway Surface Type:</b>	Asphalt
<b>Airport Elevation:</b>	5505 ft msl	<b>Runway Surface Condition:</b>	Dry
<b>Runway Used:</b>	23	<b>IFR Approach:</b>	Circling;ILS
<b>Runway Length/Width:</b>	6500 ft / 150 ft	<b>VFR Approach/Landing:</b>	Full stop

## Wreckage and Impact Information

<b>Crew Injuries:</b>	2 None	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Passenger Injuries:</b>	1 None	<b>Aircraft Fire:</b>	None
<b>Ground Injuries:</b>	N/A	<b>Aircraft Explosion:</b>	None
<b>Total Injuries:</b>	3 None	<b>Latitude, Longitude:</b>	36.747222,-108.233329

## Administrative Information

<b>Investigator In Charge (IIC):</b>	Scott, Arnold
<b>Additional Participating Persons:</b>	Aaron L Robinson; FAA Flight Standards District Office; Albuquerque, NM
<b>Original Publish Date:</b>	March 26, 2007
<b>Last Revision Date:</b>	
<b>Investigation Class:</b>	<a href="#">Class</a>
<b>Note:</b>	
<b>Investigation Docket:</b>	<a href="https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=65157">https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=65157</a>

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).