



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	St. Augustine, Florida	Accident Number:	MIA07CA010
Date & Time:	October 22, 2006, 19:55 Local	Registration:	N200MW
Aircraft:	Beech A36	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The private certificated pilot was landing at night on a lighted runway. The airplane landed short of the paved runway, and collided with a dirt bank, collapsing both main landing gear. The pilot noted in his written report to the NTSB that the runway he elected to land on did not have a visual approach slope indicator (VASI), and was adjacent to the unlighted intercoastal waterway. He also stated that he added engine power during the final approach, but the "aircraft did not respond as anticipated.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's misjudged distance/altitude during landing, which resulted in an undershoot and on ground collision with a dirt bank.

Findings

Occurrence #1: UNDERSHOOT
Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

Findings
1. DISTANCE/ALTITUDE - MISJUDGED - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #2: ON GROUND/WATER ENCOUNTER WITH TERRAIN/WATER
Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings

2. TERRAIN CONDITION - DIRT BANK/RISING EMBANKMENT

Occurrence #3: MAIN GEAR COLLAPSED

Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

Findings

3. LANDING GEAR,MAIN GEAR - OVERLOAD

Factual Information

On October 22, 2006, about 1958 eastern daylight time, a Beech A36, N200MW, registered to Sky King, Inc., experienced collapse of both main landing gears during the landing flare/touchdown at St. Augustine Airport, St. Augustine, Florida. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time and an instrument flight rules (IFR) flight plan was filed for the 14 CFR Part 91 personal flight from Savannah/Hilton Head International Airport, Savannah, Georgia, to St. Augustine Airport. The airplane was substantially damaged and the private-rated pilot and one passenger were not injured. The flight originated about 1845, from Savannah/Hilton Head International Airport.

The pilot stated that after takeoff, the flight proceeded to the destination airport where the automated terminal information service (ATIS) indicated the wind was from 270 degrees at 4 knots. He "elected" to land on runway 24, but landed on grass short of the runway causing the left main landing gear to collapse. The airplane veered to the left causing collapse of the right main landing gear; the airplane came to rest upright on grass off the left side of the runway. He and the passenger evacuated the airplane after it came to rest. The pilot further stated that runway 24 does not have visual approach slope indicator (VASI) lights, and the approach to the runway is made over an intercoastal waterway without lights for normal visual references. He also stated that he added power on final approach, but the aircraft did not respond as anticipated.

Review of NTSB "Pilot/Operator Aircraft Accident//Incident Report" form signed and submitted by the pilot indicates he answered "left main collapsed", to the question "Was there a Mechanical/Malfunction Failure?" With respect to the report which asks for a description of damage to the airplane and other property, he reported, "Left gear strut came thru wing breaking rear spar."

According to the FAA inspector-in-charge, the airplane was landed at an embankment approximately 150 feet short of runway 24, causing both main landing gears to collapse. The nose landing gear remained extended.

A review of the airport revealed runway 24 is not equipped with precision approach path indicator (PAPI) lights, nor VASI lights as indicated by the pilot.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	65, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Single-engine sea	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	December 1, 2004
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	April 1, 2006
Flight Time:	2681 hours (Total, all aircraft), 1895 hours (Total, this make and model), 2401 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 13 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 8 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 3 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N200MW
Model/Series:	A36	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Utility	Serial Number:	E-1063
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	February 1, 2006 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3600 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	70 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	4400 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed	Engine Model/Series:	IO-550B
Registered Owner:	Sky King, Inc.	Rated Power:	300 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Night
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KSGJ,10 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:	19:58 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	3 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	270°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29.9 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	29°C / 19°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Savannah, GA (KSAV)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	St. Augustine, FL (KSGJ)	Type of Clearance:	IFR
Departure Time:	18:45 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	St. Augustine Airport KSGJ	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	10 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	24	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	2701 ft / 60 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop;Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Monville, Timothy
Additional Participating Persons:	Mike Cichanowski; FAA Flight Standards District Office; Orlando, FL
Original Publish Date:	March 26, 2007
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=64755

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).