



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Pontiac, Michigan	Accident Number:	CHI06CA274
Date & Time:	September 29, 2006, 14:30 Local	Registration:	N1949W
Aircraft:	Beech B19	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The airplane porpoised during landing, which resulted in the collapse of the nose landing gear. The pilot stated that he noticed the airplane was "higher than normal and a little fast" during final approach and to correct he "added full flaps slowing down to the right speed, but noticed a faster descent rate." The pilot reported that he increased engine power to arrest the descent, but during the landing flare the airplane's nose "dropped and hit the runway first and ballooned the aircraft back into the air quite abruptly." The pilot stated that he "immediately applied full power for a go around ... the aircraft turned slightly to the right because of a slight crosswind, and there was not enough altitude to nose down and raise the flaps at the same time." The pilot reported that the airplane's nose "sharply dropped and hit the nose gear on the runway for a second time and broke off, hitting the prop and stopping the engine." The pilot stated that the airplane impacted a taxiway sign before coming to a stop. The pilot reported that the accident could have been prevented if he had initiated a go-around after noticing the airplane was not on a stabilized final approach.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's failure to perform a go-around when he noticed the airplane was not on a stabilized final approach. Contributing factors to the accident were the hard landing, the subsequent pilot-induced oscillation (porpoise) which resulted in the collapse of the nose landing gear, and the taxiway sign.

Findings

Occurrence #1: HARD LANDING

Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

Findings

1. (C) FLARE - IMPROPER - PILOT IN COMMAND
2. (C) GO-AROUND - NOT PERFORMED - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #2: NOSE GEAR COLLAPSED

Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

Findings

3. (F) PORPOISE/PILOT-INDUCED OSCILLATION - INADVERTENT - PILOT IN COMMAND
4. ABORTED LANDING - ATTEMPTED - PILOT IN COMMAND
5. (F) LANDING GEAR, NOSE GEAR ASSEMBLY - COLLAPSED

Occurrence #3: ON GROUND/WATER COLLISION WITH OBJECT

Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

Findings

6. (F) OBJECT - SIGN

Factual Information

The airplane porpoised during landing, which resulted in the collapse of the nose landing gear. The pilot stated that he noticed the airplane was "higher than normal and a little fast" during final approach and to correct he "added full flaps slowing down to the right speed, but noticed a faster descent rate." The pilot reported that he increased engine power to arrest the descent, but during the landing flare the airplane's nose "dropped and hit the runway first and ballooned the aircraft back into the air quite abruptly." The pilot stated that he "immediately applied full power for a go around ... the aircraft turned slightly to the right because of a slight crosswind, and there was not enough altitude to nose down and raise the flaps at the same time." The pilot reported that the airplane's nose "sharply dropped and hit the nose gear on the runway for a second time and broke off, hitting the prop and stopping the engine." The pilot stated that the airplane impacted a taxiway sign before coming to a stop. The pilot reported that the accident could have been prevented if he had initiated a go-around after noticing the airplane was not on a stabilized final approach.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	50, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 With waivers/limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	September 1, 2006
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	November 1, 2005
Flight Time:	331 hours (Total, all aircraft), 218 hours (Total, this make and model), 250 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 6 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 6 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N1949W
Model/Series:	B19	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	MB-610
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	August 1, 2006 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2150 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	3648 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	O-320
Registered Owner:	On file	Rated Power:	150 Horsepower
Operator:	On file	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	PTK,980 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	14:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	0°
Lowest Cloud Condition:		Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 5000 ft AGL	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	7 knots / None	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	240°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29.89 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	13°C / 2°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Alpena, MI (APN)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Pontiac, MI (PTK)	Type of Clearance:	VFR
Departure Time:	12:15 Local	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	Oakland County Intl. Airport PTK	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	980 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	27R	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	5000 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop;Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	43.665554,-83.42028

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Fox, Andrew
Additional Participating Persons:	Steven A Hanes; Federal Aviation Administration - Detroit FSDO; Detroit, MI
Original Publish Date:	December 28, 2006
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=64709

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).