

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location: Douglas, Wyoming Accident Number: DEN04LA107

Date & Time: July 20, 2004, 16:00 Local Registration: N7736K

Aircraft: Cessna P210N Aircraft Damage: Substantial

Defining Event: 4 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

Analysis

According to the pilot, while in cruise flight at 22,000 feet msl, the engine "guit." The pilot stated that the propeller continued to "windmill," and at that time he noted approximately 50 gallons of fuel remaining. The pilot's attempts to restart the engine were unsuccessful. He declared an emergency and was diverted to a nearby airport. On final approach to runway 28, the airplane's left main landing gear struck a fence post. The airplane landed approximately 200 feet short of the runway threshold and its left main landing gear collapsed. The airplane veered left of the runway centerline and came to a stop in the grass. The impact buckled the left wing tip and left horizontal stabilizer. An examination of the engine revealed a 7/8-inch by 3/8-inch hole in the top of the crankcase, just forward of the number 1 cylinder. Further examination revealed the engine crankshaft was fractured at the number 2 rod journal. The crankshaft exhibited thermal discoloration and impact marks at the number 2, 3, 4, and 5 rod journals. Rotational scoring and thermal discoloration was observed on the crankshaft's number 2 main bearing. The number 2 bearing was fragmented and fretting was observed on the crankcase halves at the number 2 bearing through bolts. The engine maintenance records indicated on November 17, 2003, at 2,845.0 hours, during the airplane's most recent 100-hour inspection, the number 2 cylinder was replaced. At the time of the accident, the total time was 3,083.0 hours.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

the failure of the engine's crankshaft due to the rotation of the engine's number two bearing, which resulted in the oil starvation of the crankshaft's number 2 main journal. Contributing factors include the engine's improper maintenance, and the in-flight collision with a fence post during a forced landing.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER(TOTAL) - MECH FAILURE/MALF

Phase of Operation: CRUISE

Findings

1. (F) MAINTENANCE - IMPROPER - OTHER PERSON

2. (F) ENGINE ASSEMBLY, BEARING - SHIFTED

3. (F) FLUID, OIL - STARVATION

4. (C) ENGINE ASSEMBLY, CRANKSHAFT - FAILURE

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING

Phase of Operation: DESCENT - EMERGENCY

Occurrence #3: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY LANDING

Findings

5. (F) OBJECT - FENCE POST

Occurrence #4: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY LANDING

Findings

6. TERRAIN CONDITION - OPEN FIELD

7. TERRAIN CONDITION - GRASS

Page 2 of 6 DEN04LA107

Factual Information

On July 20 2004, at 1600 mountain daylight time, a Cessna P210N, N7736K, operated by a commercial pilot, was substantially damaged during a forced landing at Converse County Airport (DGW), Douglas, Wyoming. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The personal cross-country flight was being conducted under the provisions of Title 14 CFR Part 91 on an instrument flight rules (IFR) flight plan. The pilot and three passengers were not injured. The flight to Provo, Utah, originated at Rapid City, South Dakota, approximately 1400.

According to the pilot, while in cruise flight at 22,000 feet msl, the engine "quit." The pilot stated that the propeller continued to "windmill," and at that time he noted approximately 50 gallons of fuel remaining. The pilot's attempts to restart the engine were unsuccessful. He declared an emergency and was diverted to Douglas. He broke out of the clouds at approximately 14,000 feet agl. On final approach to runway 28, the airplane's left main landing gear struck a fence post and the airplane impacted terrain approximately 200 feet short of the runway threshold. The airplane drifted to the left of the runway centerline and came to a stop in the grass. The impact collapsed the airplane's left main landing gear assembly, and buckled the left wing tip and left horizontal stabilizer.

On February 14, 2005, the engine was examined at Teledyne Continental Motors, Inc., in Mobile, Alabama. The examination revealed a 7/8-inch by 3/8-inch hole in the top of the crankcase, just forward of the number 1 cylinder. Further examination revealed that the number 2, 3, 4, 5, and 6 piston rods were fractured. The engine crankshaft was fractured at the number 2 rod journal. The crankshaft exhibited thermal discoloration and impact marks at the number 2, 3, 4, and 5 rod journals. Rotational scoring and thermal discoloration was observed on each main bearing. The crankshaft's number 2 main bearing was fragmented. Fretting was observed on the crankcase halves at the number 2 bearing through bolts. Fretting was also observed on the number 3 and 4 bearing through bolts.

According to the airplane's engine maintenance records, on May 31, 2000, at an airframe total time of 2,380.0 hours, a top overhaul was completed on all 6 cylinders. On November 17, 2003, at 2,845.0 hours, during the airplane's most recent 100-hour inspection, the engine's number 2 cylinder was replaced. At the time of the accident, the total airframe time was 3,083.0 hours.

Page 3 of 6 DEN04LA107

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	55,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medicalno waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	June 21, 2004
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	June 14, 2004
Flight Time:	1114 hours (Total, all aircraft), 281 hours (Total, this make and model), 1030 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 74 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 33 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 5 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Cessna	Registration:	N7736K
Model/Series:	P210N	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	P21000420
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	November 17, 2003 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	4000 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	238 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	3083 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed	Engine Model/Series:	TSI0520-P6B
Registered Owner:	Randy C. Brooks	Rated Power:	310 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Page 4 of 6 DEN04LA107

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KDGW,4929 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	15:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 75 ft AGL	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 110 ft AGL	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	6 knots / 0 knots	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	330°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.06 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	23°C / 17°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Rapid City , SD (RAP)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	Provo, UT (PVU)	Type of Clearance:	IFR
Departure Time:	14:00 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class E

Airport Information

Airport:	Converse County Airport DGW	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	4929 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	28	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	6750 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Forced landing

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	3 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	4 None	Latitude, Longitude:	42.749061,-105.390792(est)

Page 5 of 6 DEN04LA107

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Bowling, David
Additional Participating Persons:	Mike Maglione; Federal Aviation Administration; Casper , CO
Original Publish Date:	July 7, 2005
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=59693
Persons: Original Publish Date: Last Revision Date: Investigation Class: Note:	July 7, 2005 Class

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 6 of 6 DEN04LA107