

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location: Columbia, Tennessee Accident Number: ATL04CA136

Date & Time: June 20, 2004, 09:40 Local Registration: N1435L

Aircraft: Beech A23 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

Defining Event: 1 Serious

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

Analysis

The pilot established an approach to land on runway 23 with full flaps, he landed just past the threshold. The pilot stated he had landed with too much airspeed and retracted his flaps to help with his braking. He then decided that he did not have enough runway left to make a full stop landing and applied full power in an attempt to make a go-around. The pilot reports that the airplane cleared the end of the runway with a slight climb and collided with the trees on the departure end of the runway. The pilot did not report a mechanical problem with the airplane during the flight. The pilot reported in the recommendation section of the pilot report that "the decision to go around should have been made earlier and flaps should have been re-lowered to assist in lift."

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's failure to maintain clearance from trees during climb and the pilot's failure to execute a go-around before completing the approach to land.

Findings

Occurrence #1: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT Phase of Operation: TAKEOFF - INITIAL CLIMB

Findings

- 1. OBJECT TREE(S)
- 2. (C) CLEARANCE NOT MAINTAINED PILOT IN COMMAND
- 3. (C) REMEDIAL ACTION NOT PERFORMED PILOT IN COMMAND 4. (C) GO-AROUND NOT PERFORMED PILOT IN COMMAND

Page 2 of 6 ATL04CA136

Factual Information

On June 20, 2004, at approximately 0940 central daylight time, a Beech A23, N1435L, registered to and operated by the private pilot, collided with trees during an attempted takeoff from Hunter field in Columbia, Tennessee. The personal flight operated under the provisions of Title 14 CFR Part 91 with no flight plan filed. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The private pilot received minor injuries and the airplane sustained substantial damage. The flight departed Maury County Airport Nashville, Tennessee, at 0900.

The pilot made a touch and go landing followed by a full stop at John A. Baker Field, Hohenwald, TN (0M3). The pilot departed John A. Baker Field and decided to make a full-stop landing at Hunter Field. The pilot established an approach to land on runway 23 with full flaps, he landed just past the threshold. The pilot stated he had landed with too much airspeed and retracted his flaps to help with his braking. He then decided that he did not have enough runway left to make a full stop landing and applied full power in an attempt to make a go-around. The pilot reports that the airplane cleared the end of the runway with a slight climb and collided with the trees on the departure end of the runway.

According to a witness, the pilot was "landing but had misjudged the landing field and ran out of runway, so he took off again but failed to gain altitude and drifted sideways into trees."

The pilot did not report a mechanical problem with the airplane during the flight. The pilot reported in the recommendation section of the pilot report that " the decision to go around should have been made earlier and flaps should have been re-lowered to assist in lift."

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	52,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):		Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3	Last FAA Medical Exam:	June 27, 2003
Occupational Pilot:	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:		
Flight Time:	159 hours (Total, all aircraft), 33 hours (Total, this make and model), 100 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

Page 3 of 6 ATL04CA136

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N1435L
Model/Series:	A23	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	M-830
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:		Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2350 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:		Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:		Engine Model/Series:	10-346
Registered Owner:	Charles Gaines	Rated Power:	
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	BNA	Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:	09:43 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 17000 ft AGL	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Unknown	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	3 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:		Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.12 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	23°C / 16°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	COLUMBIA/MOUNT , TN (06TC)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	Unknown
Destination:	Maury County , TN (MRC)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:		Type of Airspace:	Class G

Page 4 of 6 ATL04CA136

Airport Information

Airport:	Hunter Field PVT	Runway Surface Type:	Grass/turf
Airport Elevation:	950 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Wet
Runway Used:	23	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	2000 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Touch and go

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Serious	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Serious	Latitude, Longitude:	35.697223,-86.956947

Page 5 of 6 ATL04CA136

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Powell, Phillip
Additional Participating Persons:	
Original Publish Date:	September 29, 2004
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=59544

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 6 of 6 ATL04CA136