

# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

Location: N. Myrtle Beach, South Carolina Accident Number: ATL04LA123

Date & Time: May 30, 2004, 12:10 Local Registration: N361Z

Aircraft: Cessna 310 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

**Defining Event:** 1 Fatal, 3 Minor

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

## **Analysis**

The pilot stated approximately four miles from the runway, the right engine began to sputter. He stated that he attempted to restart it, and the right engine briefly produced power and then sputtered again. The pilot stated that he feathered the right propeller and "continued the approach single engine." The pilot stated that "as the approach progressed, [he] realized that [the airplane] could not maintain the glide slope... or clear a tree line ahead." The pilot stated that he committed to ditching the airplane in the waterway to the right, so he retracted the landing gear, and the airplane touched down tail low. The airplane ditched in the intracoastal waterway two miles short of runway 23 and sank in 12-20 feet of water. The post-accident examination of the airplane revealed the airframe was intact. Fuel system continuity was established from the tip tanks to the fuel strainer, and the fuel strainer and the fuel pump were intact and free of debris. When water was displaced from the engine, fuel system, and magnetos, both engines started and produced power at idle and high RPM settings. No anomalies were observed during the engine run. The pilot of a flight in the airplane on the previous day stated that upon returning to DeKalb-Peachtree Airport, there were about 58-60 gallons of fuel on board the airplane. He further stated that the airplane was not refueled that evening or prior to the accident flight on May 30, 2004. According to the 1955 Cessna 310 owner's manual, the main fuel wingtip fuel tanks have a capacity of 102 gallons, of which 100 gallons are usable fuel and two gallons are unusable.

## **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's inadequate preflight/planning and his in-flight decision which resulted in the loss of power in one engine due to fuel starvation.

### **Findings**

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER

Phase of Operation: APPROACH - FAF/OUTER MARKER TO THRESHOLD (IFR)

#### **Findings**

1. 1 ENGINE

2. (C) PREFLIGHT PLANNING/PREPARATION - INADEQUATE - PILOT IN COMMAND

3. (C) IN-FLIGHT PLANNING/DECISION - INADEQUATE - PILOT IN COMMAND

4. FLUID, FUEL - STARVATION

-----

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING

Phase of Operation: DESCENT - EMERGENCY

-----

Occurrence #3: DITCHING

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

**Findings** 

5. TERRAIN CONDITION - WATER

Page 2 of 8 ATL04LA123

### **Factual Information**

#### HISTORY OF FLIGHT

On May 30, 2004 at 1210 eastern daylight time, a Cessna 310, N361Z, registered to and operated by Atlanta Flight Time, LLC, ditched in the Intracoastal Waterway two miles short of runway 23 at Grand Strand Airport/North Myrtle Beach, South Carolina. The personal flight was conducted under Title 14 CFR Part 91, and instrument flight rules (IFR). Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident and an IFR flight plan was on file. The commercial pilot and two passengers sustained minor injuries and one pilot-rated passenger egressed the airplane, but was subsequently recovered from the waterway 48 hours later. The airplane sustained substantial damage. The flight originated at DeKalb-Peachtree Airport, Chamblee, Georgia, on May 30, 2004, at 1020.

On May 30, 2004, at 0940, the pilot of N361Z telephoned the Macon Automated Flight Service Station and requested to file an instrument flight plan from DeKalb-Peachtree Airport in Chamblee, Georgia, to Grand Strand Airport in North Myrtle Beach, South Carolina. The pilot was given a standard preflight weather briefing, and after which he filed an instrument flight plan.

The pilot stated that during the preflight planning and inspection of the airplane, he estimated 80 gallons of fuel to be on board by visual inspection of the fuel tanks as well as referencing to the fuel gauges in the cockpit. He stated that he calculated fuel burn to be approximately 12 gallons per hour, per engine, or 24 gallons per hour total including a margin of error. The pilot stated that the airplane's weight and balance for the flight was calculated and found to be within operating limitations. He further stated that no mechanical abnormalities were noted during the preflight inspection of the airplane or during the before takeoff run-up.

At 1010, the pilot radioed DeKalb-Peachtree Airport ground control and requested an instrument flight clearance to Grand Strand Airport, and taxi instructions for takeoff from the north ramp. The ground controller issued the pilot the instrument clearance as requested and cleared the flight to taxi to runway 20L for the instrument departure. The pilot acknowledged the instrument clearance and taxi instructions. At 1024: 24, the pilot established radio contact with Atlanta Departure Control after takeoff from runway 21.

The pilot stated that the take-off, climb to 9000 feet, and the enroute portions of the flight were uneventful. At 1202:04, Myrtle Beach East Radar reported that the flight was 7 miles from the initial approach fix for the ILS Runway 23 approach. The pilot stated that upon entering the North Myrtle Beach terminal area, he was given an approach clearance for the ILS Runway 23 approach and the pilot was instructed to maintain 2000 feet. At 1202:56, the pilot acknowledged the approach clearance and was also instructed to contact Grand Strand

Page 3 of 8 ATL04LA123

Tower. No further radio communication was recorded between the flight and the air traffic control system.

According to the pilot when the flight was approximately four miles from the runway, the right engine began to sputter. The pilot stated that he attempted to restart the right engine, and it briefly produced power and then sputtered again. The pilot stated that he feathered the right propeller and "continued the approach single engine." The pilot also stated that "as the approach progressed, [he] realized that [the airplane] could not maintain the glide slope... or clear a tree line ahead." The pilot stated that he was then committed to ditching the airplane in the nearby waterway. So, the pilot retracted the landing gear, and the airplane touched down tail low in the water. The pilot and the three passengers were able to egress from the airplane through the right door into the water. A nearby boat came to the aid of one passenger and attempted to help the deceased passenger. The pilot and other passengers were able to swim to shore. The airplane sank in 12-20 feet of water.

At 1211:05, Grand Strand Tower informed North Myrtle Beach East Radar that a Cessna had gone down in the intracoastal waterway, and an emergency crew was enroute to the accident site.

#### PERSONNEL INFORMATION

The pilot was issued a commercial certificate on July 5, 2002, with ratings for airplane multiengine land and instrument airplane. He held a valid second-class medical certificate issued March 31, 2004, with the restrictions "must wear corrective lenses." A review of the pilot logbooks revealed the pilot's total flight time of 405 hours, of which 143 hours were in a multiengine aircraft and 68 hours were in the Cessna 310.

#### AIRCRAFT INFORMATION

A review of the aircraft and engine logbooks revealed that the annual inspection was completed on August 6, 2003.

A review of records on file with Air Tuskegee, Tuskegee, Alabama, revealed the airplane was refueled on May 29, 2004 with 40 gallons of 100-low lead aviation fuel. The pilot-in-command of that flight stated that upon returning to DeKalb-Peachtree Airport, there were about 58-60 gallons of fuel on board the airplane. He further stated that the airplane was not refueled that evening or prior to the accident flight on May 30, 2004.

According to the 1955 Cessna 310 owner's manual, the main wingtip fuel tanks have a capacity of 102 gallons, of which 100 gallons are usable fuel and two gallons are unusable. It states the cruise fuel consumption, with lean mixture at gross weight ranges from 22 total gallons to 25 total gallons of fuel per hour. Climb fuel consumption to 9,000 feet, with full power at gross weight is between 6 gallons and 7 gallons of fuel.

Page 4 of 8 ATL04LA123

The owner's manual designates 93 miles per hour (mph) as the single engine minimum control speed. It further states that during a single-engine landing, when the airspeed is below 93 mph, the airplane is committed to land.

#### METEOROLOGICAL INFORMATION

At 1210, the North Myrtle Beach/Grand Strand Airport weather reporting facility reported the winds variable at 10 knots, eight statute miles of visibility, broken cloud layers at 1,500 feet and 2,000 feet, temperature of 26 degrees Celsius and dew point of 24 degrees Celsius.

#### WRECKAGE AND IMPACT INFORMATION

The airplane was ditched in the intracoastal waterway two miles short of runway 23. The post-accident examination of the airplane revealed the airframe was intact. Both propellers were bent aft on both blades. The underside of the fuselage and nose had some buckling and tearing of the skin. Flight control continuity was established from the cockpit flight controls to all flight control surfaces. The cockpit throttle controls were set to idle. The left propeller control was set to high rpm; the right propeller control was set to low rpm. The left mixture control was set at full rich; the mixture control was set at idle cut-off. Engine control continuity was established from the cockpit power to controls to all engine power controls. The fuel selectors were set to the corresponding fuel tanks.

Examination of both engines revealed suction and compression in all cylinders, full valve action, and internal components were intact and rotated freely. Magneto ignition sparks on both magnetos in each engine were observed. Fuel system continuity was established from the tip tanks to the fuel strainer, and the fuel strainer and the fuel pump were intact and free of debris. When water was displaced from the engine assemblies, fuel systems, and magnetos, both engines started and produced power at idle and high RPM settings. No anomalies were observed during the functional engine checks.

Further examination of the propeller and assemblies revealed both propellers were able to cycle "normally" through entire pitch ranges. There was a large amount of oil present in both propeller cylinders, indicitive of neither propeller being in feather during the accident. Blade damage suggested that both propellers were operating with low or no power and that the left propeller had more rotational energy than the right propeller. No mechanical malfunction was observed of either of the propeller assemblies.

### MEDICAL INFORMATION

The Horry County Coroner's Office, Conway, South Carolina, conducted a postmortem examination of the passenger on June 1, 2004. The reported cause of death was as "asphyxia due to drowning."

#### ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

Page 5 of 8 ATL04LA123

The Cessna 310 owner's manual checklist for 'Engine Failure During Flight' is comprised of 15 steps. Steps 9, 10, and 11 are as follows:

- (9) If cause of [engine] failure was not determined, put mixture in "IDLE CUT-OFF."
- (10) Feather inoperative propeller.
- (11) Secure dead engine by turning boost pump, fuel selector valve, and ignition switches "OFF."

### **Pilot Information**

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	34,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 Valid Medicalw/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	March 31, 2004
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	July 5, 2002
Flight Time:	403 hours (Total, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

## **Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information**

Aircraft Make:	Cessna	Registration:	N361Z
Model/Series:	310	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	35157
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	August 6, 2003 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	4600 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	2 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	5663 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	0-470 M
Registered Owner:	Atlanta Flight Time, LLC	Rated Power:	240 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Page 6 of 8 ATL04LA123

# Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KCRE,32 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	3 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	12:10 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	50°
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>		Visibility	8 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 1500 ft AGL	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	6 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:		Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29.98 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	26°C / 24°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Chamblee, GA (KPDK)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	N. Myrtle Beach, SC (KCRE)	Type of Clearance:	IFR
Departure Time:	10:20 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class D

# **Airport Information**

Airport:	N. Myrtle Beach/Grand Strand KCRE	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	32 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Unknown
Runway Used:	23	IFR Approach:	ILS
Runway Length/Width:	5996 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Forced landing

# Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Minor	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 Fatal, 2 Minor	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Fatal, 3 Minor	Latitude, Longitude:	33.811668,-78.723892

Page 7 of 8 ATL04LA123

#### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC): Powell, Phillip  Additional Participating Persons: Marlene Van Buren; Columbia FSDO  Original Publish Date: July 7, 2005  Last Revision Date: Investigation Class: Class  Note: https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=59438		
Persons:  Original Publish Date: July 7, 2005  Last Revision Date:  Investigation Class: Class  Note:	Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Powell, Phillip
Last Revision Date:  Investigation Class: Class  Note:		Marlene Van Buren; Columbia FSDO
Investigation Class: Class Note:	Original Publish Date:	July 7, 2005
Note:	Last Revision Date:	
	Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Investigation Docket: <a href="https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=59438">https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=59438</a>	Note:	
	Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=59438

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 8 of 8 ATL04LA123