

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location: Joplin, Missouri Accident Number: CHI04LA098

Date & Time: April 3, 2004, 10:34 Local Registration: N5223K

Aircraft: Navion B Aircraft Damage: Substantial

Defining Event: 1 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

Analysis

The airplane sustained substantial damage during a forced landing after a loss of engine power. The pilot reported the airplane had about 54 gallons of fuel on board. He reported the flight normally took one hour and twenty minutes to complete. During the VFR approach for landing, the engine suddenly quit. The pilot performed the emergency procedure checklist for engine restart but without success. He established a 85 mph glide airspeed and executed a forced landing to a highway. He reported that he "held the aircraft 6 or 8 feet above the highway until the aircraft could no longer fly." The airplane contacted the highway wings level but the nose gear collapsed, and then the left and right main gear collapsed. The right wing impacted a road sign and the left wing was sheared off at the wing root when it struck two steel posts. The pilot exited the airplane. He reported smelling fuel and that fuel was "running out of the right tip tank." The inspection of the engine revealed that all cylinders exhibited thumb compression, and spark was verified from both magnetos to all ignition leads. All spark plugs were in good condition. Fuel was found in the supply line to the engine driven fuel pump. The engine driven fuel pump was disassembled and proper operation was verified.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The loss of engine power for undetermined reasons. The posts, unsuitable terrain and signs were factors to the accident.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER

Phase of Operation: APPROACH

Findings

1. (C) REASON FOR OCCURRENCE UNDETERMINED

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

Occurrence #3: ON GROUND/WATER COLLISION WITH OBJECT

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

Findings

2. (C) UNSUITABLE TERRAIN OR TAKEOFF/LANDING/TAXI AREA - ENCOUNTERED

3. (F) OBJECT - SIGN

4. (F) OBJECT - POLE

Page 2 of 7 CHI04LA098

Page 3 of 7 CHI04LA098

Factual Information

On April 3, 2004, at 1034 central standard time, a Navion B, N5223K, sustained substantial damage during a forced landing near Joplin, Missouri, after a loss of engine power. The pilot was not injured. The 14 CFR Part 91 personal flight departed Lonoke, Arkansas, and was en route to Joplin Regional Airport (JLN), Joplin, Missouri. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. No flight plan was filed.

The pilot reported that he conducted a preflight of the airplane around 0830. The pilot reported that he had fueled the airplane with 33.6 gallons. The airplane's main tanks were topped off and had 20 gallons in each tank, and the tip tanks had about 7 - 8 gallons in each tank. He reported the flight normally took one hour and twenty minutes to complete.

He reported that he departed and climbed to 6,500 feet mean sea level (msl) for cruise flight. He reduced engine power to 2,250 RPM, set 20 inches of manifold pressure, and leaned the fuel mixture to 100 degrees rich of peak exhaust gas temperature (EGT). He reported the fuel consumption was 13.1 gallons per hour. He reported that when he was 25 miles from JLN, the main fuel tank gauge indicated 25 gallons of fuel remaining, and the engine analyzer indicated about 18 gallons of fuel had been used.

The pilot reported that when he was five miles from JLN, he was told he was number two for landing behind a corporate jet. The pilot reported that he stopped his descent at 2,800 feet msl and made a left turn to the west for spacing and maintained 100 mph indicated airspeed. After less than a minute the pilot made a right turn back to the airport. The pilot reported, "Shortly after that, the engine suddenly quit."

The pilot reported that he performed the emergency procedure checklist for engine restart but without success. He established a 85 mph glide airspeed and executed a forced landing to a highway. He lowered the landing gear and pumped the emergency hydraulic hand pump handle, and the gear locked down with three green gear light indications. He reported he maneuvered the airplane in order to avoid automobiles that were on the highway. He turned off the battery and ignition switches and lowered the wing flaps with the emergency hydraulic hand pump.

He reported that he "held the aircraft 6 or 8 feet above the highway until the aircraft could no longer fly." The airplane contacted the highway wings level but the nose gear collapsed, and then the left and right main gear collapsed. The right wing impacted a road sign and the right wingtip separated from the wing. The left wing was sheared off at the wing root when it struck two steel posts. The pilot exited the airplane. He reported smelling fuel and that fuel was "running out of the right tip tank."

Page 4 of 7 CHI04LA098

A Federal Aviation Administration airworthiness inspector examined the airplane. He reported that all cylinders exhibited thumb compression, and spark was verified from both magnetos to all ignition leads. He reported that all spark plugs were in good condition. Fuel was found in the supply line to the engine driven fuel pump. The engine driven fuel pump was disassembled and proper operation was verified.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	61,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medicalw/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	January 24, 2003
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	August 11, 2003
Flight Time:	4904 hours (Total, all aircraft), 190 hours (Total, this make and model), 4100 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 75 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 20 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Navion	Registration:	N5223K
Model/Series:	В	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	NAV 4-2123B
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	July 1, 2003 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3100 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	90 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	4654 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-250-BA12B
Registered Owner:	Peter Farmer	Rated Power:	285 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Page 5 of 7 CHI04LA098

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	JLN,981 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:	09:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	12 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	10°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.15 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	17°C / 2°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Lonoke, AR	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Joplin, MO (JLN)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	09:10 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class D

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	37.151668,-94.498054

Page 6 of 7 CHI04LA098

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC): Silliman, James

Additional Participating Persons:

Original Publish Date: September 1, 2004

Last Revision Date:

Investigation Class: Class

Note:

Investigation Docket: https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=59054

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 7 of 7 CHI04LA098