

# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

**Location:** Greenville, South Carolina **Accident Number:** ATL04LA092

Date & Time: April 8, 2004, 14:41 Local Registration: N527ST

Aircraft: Cessna 140 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

**Defining Event:** 1 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

### **Analysis**

The pilot was cleared to land and went through his approach check with everything normal. The airplane crossed over the landing threshold and settled onto the runway in a three point landing attitude. During the landing roll, the pilot felt the left wing start to dip and the airplane vibrating. The airplane turned approximately 20-degrees to the right, the left front side struck the runway and the airplane came to a stop. The pilot had completed a series of touch and go landings, and during the accident landing, the leaf spring landing gear assembly broke. Examination revealed that the leaf spring gear strut fracture stemmed from an area of fatigue cracking that initiated at the upper forward side of the inboard hole for the step attachment bolts. Given the observed corrosion in the bolt hole, it was determined that the fatigue originated from corrosion pitting. For fatigue to initiate at the upper side of the spring strut, the upper side must have been placed in tension. According to the aircraft maintenance logbook for the 1946 built airplane, the leaf spring gear assembly and the total airframe time was 3,375 hours.

## **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: Fatique failure of the leaf spring gear strut.

#### **Findings**

Occurrence #1: GEAR COLLAPSED Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings
1. (C) LANDING GEAR, MAIN GEAR SPRING - FATIGUE

Page 2 of 6 ATL04LA092

#### **Factual Information**

On April 8, 2004, at 1441 eastern daylight time, a Cessna 140, N527ST, registered to and operated by a private pilot, main landing gear collapsed during landing on runway 19 at Greenville Downtown Airport, Greenville, South Carolina. The personal flight operated under the provisions of Title 14 CFR Part 91. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time and no flight plan was filed. The airplane was substantially damaged and the private pilot received no injuries. The flight departed Oconee County Regional Airport, Clemson, South Carolina, on April 8, 2004 at 1315.

During the personal flight, the pilot made initial contact with the Greenville Downtown Airport tower six miles from the airport and was given instructions to enter the right downwind for runway 19. The pilot was cleared to land and went through his approach checklist with everything normal. The airplane crossed over the landing threshold and settled onto the runway in a three point landing attitude. During landing roll, the pilot felt the left wing start to dip and the airplane vibrating. The airplane turned approximately 20-degrees to the right, the left front side struck the runway and the airplane came to a stop.

The pilot had completed a series of touch and go landings, and during the accident landing, the leaf spring gear assembly broke. The fracture faces were removed and preserved for further examination. Further examination revealed that the leaf spring gear strut fracture stemmed from an area of fatigue cracking that initiated at the upper forward side of the inboard hole for the step attachment bolts. Given the observed corrosion in the bolt hole, it was determined that the fatigue originated from corrosion pitting. For fatigue to initiate at the upper side of the spring strut, the upper side must have been placed in tension. According the the aircraft maintenance logbook for the 1946 built airplane, the leaf spring gear assembly and the total airframe time was 3,375 hours.

Page 3 of 6 ATL04LA092

#### **Pilot Information**

Certificate:	Private	Age:	43,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medicalno waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	May 23, 2002
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	May 23, 2002
Flight Time:	530 hours (Total, all aircraft), 109 hours (Total, this make and model), 429 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft)		

## **Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information**

Aircraft Make:	Cessna	Registration:	N527ST
All Clait Make.	Cessila	Registration.	NJ2731
Model/Series:	140	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	8527
Landing Gear Type:	Tailwheel	Seats:	2
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	June 9, 2003 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	1450 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	116 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	3375 Hrs as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Not installed	Engine Model/Series:	C-85-12F
Registered Owner:	Edward M Spinelli	Rated Power:	85 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Page 4 of 6 ATL04LA092

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KGMU,1048 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	14:53 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	0°
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Few / 4700 ft AGL	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:		Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	7 knots / 0 knots	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	230°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29.67 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	19°C / 11°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	Clemson, SC (CEU)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Greenville, SC (GMU)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	14:40 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class C

## **Airport Information**

Airport:	Greenville Downtown Airport KGMU	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	1048 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	19	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	5400 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Traffic pattern

# Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	34.847778,-82.349998

Page 5 of 6 ATL04LA092

#### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC): Powell, Phillip

Additional Participating Persons: Charlie Henderson; Columbia FSDO-13

Original Publish Date: April 28, 2005

Last Revision Date: Investigation Class: Class

Note: Investigation Docket: https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=59042

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 6 of 6 ATL04LA092