



# Aviation Investigation Final Report

---

|                                |                                      |                         |            |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------|------------|
| <b>Location:</b>               | Manitowoc, Wisconsin                 | <b>Accident Number:</b> | CHI04LA083 |
| <b>Date &amp; Time:</b>        | February 19, 2004, 14:40 Local       | <b>Registration:</b>    | N4351V     |
| <b>Aircraft:</b>               | Cessna 195                           | <b>Aircraft Damage:</b> | Minor      |
| <b>Defining Event:</b>         |                                      | <b>Injuries:</b>        | 3 None     |
| <b>Flight Conducted Under:</b> | Part 91: General aviation - Personal |                         |            |

---

## Analysis

A Cessna 195 sustained minor damage and a Cessna 177RG sustained substantial damage during an on-ground collision. The Cessna 195 had landed and was taxiing to the ramp when the accident occurred. The Cessna 177RG was parked near a taxiway intersection conducting an engine run-up when it was hit by the Cessna 195. The Cessna 195 pilot stated that he was making "small" S-turns as he taxied in an effort to clear a blind spot forward and to the right of his tail wheeled aircraft. The Cessna 195 pilot reported that he was preparing to make a "sweeping left turn" at the taxiway intersection when his aircraft struck the Cessna 177RG. The flight instructor applicant and Federal Aviation Administration inspector in the Cessna 177RG reported that when they realized a collision was imminent, they applied full power in an attempt to move the aircraft out of the way. However, as their airplane left the taxiway pavement the nose landing gear became stuck in a snow bank. The Cessna 195's propeller subsequently struck the Cessna 177RG's right wing, tearing off approximately three feet of the wing.

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The Cessna 195 pilot's failure to maintain clearance from the Cessna 177RG while taxiing to the ramp after landing. A contributing factor was the restricted forward visibility (blind spot) of the Cessna 195 due to the engine cowling. An additional factor was the Cessna 177RG positioned at the runway hold short line.

## Findings

---

Occurrence #1: COLLISION BETWEEN AIRCRAFT (OTHER THAN MIDAIR)  
Phase of Operation: TAXI - FROM LANDING

### Findings

1. (C) CLEARANCE - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND
2. (F) VISUAL LOOKOUT - RESTRICTED - PILOT IN COMMAND
3. (F) OBJECT - AIRCRAFT PARKED/STANDING

## Factual Information

On February 19, 2004, at 1440 central standard time, a Cessna 195, N4351V, operated by a private pilot, sustained minor damage, and a Cessna 177RG, N7751V, operated by a commercial pilot, sustained substantial damage, during an on-ground collision at the Manitowoc County Airport (MTW), Manitowoc, Wisconsin. Both flights were operating under 14 CFR Part 91 without flight plans. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at time of the accident. The pilots in each airplane reported no injuries.

The Cessna 195 pilot reported that he had landed and was taxiing to the ramp when the collision occurred. He stated he began making a series of "small" S-turns to clear his blind spot as he taxied. He crossed runway 17/35 intending to turn south at the taxiway intersection en route to the ramp. He stated: "I approached the intersection and was preparing to 'set-up' to make a large 'sweeping' left turn by first turning slightly to the right." He entered the intersection and began the slight turn to the right when "things started to happen." The propeller impacted the right wing of the Cessna 177RG, which was doing a run-up prior to departure on runway 07. As the impact continued, the Cessna 195's tail swung around and came to rest west of the Cessna 177RG.

The pilot of the Cessna 177RG was beginning his Flight Instructor practical test with a Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) inspector on-board at the time of the accident. He reported that they taxied to runway 07 and stopped at the hold short line to complete a run-up. He stated they observed the Cessna 195 doing S-turns as it came down the taxiway. He reported that as the Cessna 195 approached their position the airplane turned directly at them. They applied full power in an attempt to prevent a collision. However, the nose gear hit a snow bank and the airplane came to a stop. The Cessna 195 collided with the Cessna 177RG's right wing.

The FAA inspector aboard the Cessna 177RG stated that they taxied north from the ramp towards the intersection at the approach end of runway 07. They entered the intersection north of the parallel taxiway and turned the airplane into the wind for an engine run-up. They reportedly saw the Cessna 195 "down range" on the taxiway performing S-turns. She stated that during the run-up, "I glanced up and saw the Cessna 195 S turning once to the right once to the left and then back right, picking up speed and aiming straight for us in the intersection." When it was apparent that the Cessna 195 was not going to stop, she stated that she applied maximum power, released the brakes and attempted to jump the snow mound ahead of them to avoid the collision. The airplane moved approximately 10 feet forward when the nose wheel became buried into the snow bank. The inspector reported that the Cessna 195's propeller collided with the Cessna 177RG "ripping through approximately 3 feet of the right wing."

The pilot of the Cessna 195 reported there were no mechanical failures or malfunctions prior to the collision.

## Pilot Information

|                                  |  |  |                  |
|----------------------------------|--|--|------------------|
| <b>Certificate:</b>              | Private  | <b>Age:</b>                              | 48, Male         |
| <b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>       | Single-engine land   | <b>Seat Occupied:</b>                    | Left             |
| <b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b> | None   | <b>Restraint Used:</b>                   |                  |
| <b>Instrument Rating(s):</b>     | None   | <b>Second Pilot Present:</b>             | No               |
| <b>Instructor Rating(s):</b>     | None   | <b>Toxicology Performed:</b>             | No               |
| <b>Medical Certification:</b>    | Class 3 Valid Medical-w/<br>waivers/lim  | <b>Last FAA Medical Exam:</b>            | January 27, 2004 |
| <b>Occupational Pilot:</b>       | Yes  | <b>Last Flight Review or Equivalent:</b> | January 11, 2004 |
| <b>Flight Time:</b>              | 1285 hours (Total, all aircraft), 20 hours (Total, this make and model), 35 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft) |  |                  |

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

|                                      |                                |                                       |                 |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------|-----------------|
| <b>Aircraft Make:</b>                | Cessna                         | <b>Registration:</b>                  | N4351V          |
| <b>Model/Series:</b>                 | 195                            | <b>Aircraft Category:</b>             | Airplane        |
| <b>Year of Manufacture:</b>          |                                | <b>Amateur Built:</b>                 |                 |
| <b>Airworthiness Certificate:</b>    | Normal                         | <b>Serial Number:</b>                 | 7260            |
| <b>Landing Gear Type:</b>            | Tailwheel                      | <b>Seats:</b>                         | 5               |
| <b>Date/Type of Last Inspection:</b> | May 30, 2003 Annual            | <b>Certified Max Gross Wt.:</b>       | 3350 lbs        |
| <b>Time Since Last Inspection:</b>   | 19.5 Hrs                       | <b>Engines:</b>                       | 1 Reciprocating |
| <b>Airframe Total Time:</b>          | 2819.3 Hrs at time of accident | <b>Engine Manufacturer:</b>           | Jacobs          |
| <b>ELT:</b>                          | Installed, not activated       | <b>Engine Model/Series:</b>           | R 755-A2        |
| <b>Registered Owner:</b>             | Lynn A Vandevort               | <b>Rated Power:</b>                   | 300 Horsepower  |
| <b>Operator:</b>                     |                                | <b>Operating Certificate(s) Held:</b> | None            |

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

|   |                                  |   |                  |
|---|----------------------------------|---|------------------|
| <b>Conditions at Accident Site:</b>     | Visual (VMC)                     | <b>Condition of Light:</b>                  | Day              |
| <b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b> | MTW,651 ft msl                   | <b>Distance from Accident Site:</b>         | 0 Nautical Miles |
| <b>Observation Time:</b>                | 14:35 Local                      | <b>Direction from Accident Site:</b>        |                  |
| <b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>          | Clear                            | <b>Visibility</b>                           | 5 miles          |
| <b>Lowest Ceiling:</b>                  |                                  | <b>Visibility (RVR):</b>                    |                  |
| <b>Wind Speed/Gusts:</b>                | 7 knots / 0 knots                | <b>Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:</b>     | /                |
| <b>Wind Direction:</b>                  | 300°                             | <b>Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:</b> | /                |
| <b>Altimeter Setting:</b>               | 29.92 inches Hg                  | <b>Temperature/Dew Point:</b>               | -1°C / -3°C      |
| <b>Precipitation and Obscuration:</b>   | No Obscuration; No Precipitation |   |                  |
| <b>Departure Point:</b>                 | Manitowoc, WI (MTW )             | <b>Type of Flight Plan Filed:</b>           | None             |
| <b>Destination:</b>                     |                                  | <b>Type of Clearance:</b>                   | None             |
| <b>Departure Time:</b>                  | 14:30 Local                      | <b>Type of Airspace:</b>                    | Class G          |

## Airport Information

|                             |                      |                                  |         |
|-----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------------------|---------|
| <b>Airport:</b>             | MANITOWOC COUNTY MTW | <b>Runway Surface Type:</b>      | Asphalt |
| <b>Airport Elevation:</b>   | 651 ft msl           | <b>Runway Surface Condition:</b> | Dry     |
| <b>Runway Used:</b>         | 7                    | <b>IFR Approach:</b>             | None    |
| <b>Runway Length/Width:</b> | 3343 ft / 100 ft     | <b>VFR Approach/Landing:</b>     | None    |

## Wreckage and Impact Information

|                            |        |                             |                      |
|----------------------------|--------|-----------------------------|----------------------|
| <b>Crew Injuries:</b>      | 3 None | <b>Aircraft Damage:</b>     | Minor                |
| <b>Passenger Injuries:</b> |        | <b>Aircraft Fire:</b>       | None                 |
| <b>Ground Injuries:</b>    | N/A    | <b>Aircraft Explosion:</b>  | None                 |
| <b>Total Injuries:</b>     | 3 None | <b>Latitude, Longitude:</b> | 44.128612,-87.680557 |

## Administrative Information

|  |   |
|--|---|
| <b>Investigator In Charge (IIC):</b>     | Sorensen, Timothy   |
| <b>Additional Participating Persons:</b> | Chester Cybulski; Federal Aviation Administration; West Chicago, IL                                   |
| <b>Original Publish Date:</b>            | September 1, 2004   |
| <b>Last Revision Date:</b>               |   |
| <b>Investigation Class:</b>              | <a href="#">Class</a>   |
| <b>Note:</b>                             |   |
| <b>Investigation Docket:</b>             | <a href="https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=58852">https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=58852</a> |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).