

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Soldier Bar, Idaho	Accident Number:	SEA03LA113
Date & Time:	June 17, 2003, 09:30 Local	Registration:	N7372Q
Aircraft:	Cessna 206	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Injuries: 2 None		
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Instructional		

Analysis

After a smooth landing and rollout, the pilot noticed the attitude of the airplane changing as the nose pitched down. Subsequently, the nose gear collapsed and the aircraft slid to a stop in an upright position. The aircraft sustained substantial damage to the fuselage structure where the nose gear drag link connects to the casting. There was also damage to the lower front cowling and the propeller blades as a result of impacting the runway surface. The nose gear yoke and nose gear strut assemblies were sent to the NTSB Materials Laboratory Division for examination. The examination revealed that the nose gear failed in overstress, consistent with the nose gear yoke moving to the aft and to the right relative to the nose gear strut. It was reported that incorrect nose gear yoke attachment bolts and nuts were installed incorrectly and that one of the bolts was fractured, consistent with overstress in shear. It was also reported that a wedge-shaped spacer was not installed between the nose gear strut and the nose gear yoke, which would affect the loading of the four yoke attachment bolts. Also noted was the presence of various cracks around the attachment bolt through holes. The fracture surfaces were consistent with fatigue.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The overload failure of the nose landing gear assembly during the landing roll, due to an improper maintenance installation. A factor was the rough/uneven terrain condition.

Findings

Occurrence #1: GEAR COLLAPSED Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings

1. (C) LANDING GEAR, NOSE GEAR ASSEMBLY - OVERLOAD

2. (C) MAINTENANCE, INSTALLATION - IMPROPER - OTHER MAINTENANCE PERSONNEL

3. (F) TERRAIN CONDITION - ROUGH/UNEVEN

Factual Information

On June 17, 2003, approximately 0930 mountain daylight time, a Cessna 206 single-engine airplane, N7372Q, sustained substantial damage after the nose gear collapsed during landing roll at the Soldier Bar United States Forest Service Airstrip, located 45 nautical miles west of Salmon, Idaho. The airplane was registered to Wilderness Aircraft II LLC, of McCall, Idaho, and operated by McCall Aviation, of McCall, Idaho. The commercial pilot and another company pilot, who was undergoing training, were not injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed for the 14 CFR Part 91 company instructional flight, and a flight plan was not filed. The flight departed the McCall Municipal Airport at 0900.

In a telephone interview with the NTSB investigator-in-charge, the pilot reported that after a smooth landing and during the landing rollout, he noticed the attitude of the airplane changing as the nose of the aircraft pitched down and his view of the horizon changed. The pilot stated that he then realized that the nose gear had collapsed, and subsequently the airplane slid to a stop in an upright position. There was no post-crash fire and both pilots exited the airplane without injury. The pilot reported the occurrence to the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA). After repairs were made and an FAA ferry permit was issued, the aircraft was flown back to the company's base of operations in McCall without incident.

An FAA inspector, who traveled to the company's headquarters, reported that the airplane had sustained substantial damage to the fuselage structure where the nose landing gear drag link connects to a casting. There was also damage to the lower front cowling and the propeller blades as a result of impacting the runway surface.

The nose gear yoke and nose gear strut assemblies were sent to the NTSB Materials Laboratory Division, Washington, D.C., for examination (see Attachment #1). A Senior Metallurgist reported that multiple fractures were observed in the nose gear linkage pieces, each consistent with overstress fracture. The four nose gear yoke attachment bolts were assembled with the threaded end down and with two spacers under the head. The Cessna 206 parts catalog specifies that the bolts of a correctly assembled nose gear are installed with the threaded end up with one washer under the head. It was also noted that the Cessna catalog specifies AN5-17A bolts for the forward two bolts and AN5-21A bolts for the aft two bolts for the heavy duty nose gear. The three bolts which were intact were consistent with the AN5-17 bolt, and none consistent with the AN5-21 bolt. It was observed that one of the attachment bolts was fractured, consistent with overstress fracture in shear. It was reported that a nut thread remnant observed on one of the yoke attachment bolts had a microstructure of ferrite and pearlite consistent with low-carbon steel. According to the Cessna 206 parts catalog, the nut is specified as a NAS679A5 nut, a corrosion-resistant steel. Wear marks were observed on the upper side of the nose gear yoke, which corresponded to the lower surface of the nose strut. The Cessna 206 parts catalog specifies that a correctly assembled nose gear has a

wedge-shaped spacer with a rectangular footprint located between the lower end of the nose strut and the upper surface of the nose yoke. No evidence of a wear mark corresponding to this shape was found on the upper side of the yoke. It was further noted that cracks were observed in the nose gear yoke around the forward attachment bolt through holes. On the lower surface of the left forward hole, a crack was observed at the forward side of the hole. On the lower surface of the right forward hole, four cracks were observed at the forward side of the hole, and a crack was observed at the aft side of the hole. At the upper surface of the left forward hole, one crack was observed at the forward side of the hole and one crack was observed at the aft side of the hole. One of the cracks in the nose gear yoke around the right forward attachment bolt through hole was gaped open. The fracture surfaces were consistent with fatigue.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	36,Male	
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left	
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:		
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes	
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No	
Medical Certification:	Class 2 Valid Medicalno Last FAA Medical Exam: May 29, 2003 waivers/lim.			
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	June 6, 2003	
Flight Time:	1900 hours (Total, all aircraft), 500 hours (Total, this make and model), 1750 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 30 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 14 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)			

Check pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial; Flight instructor	Age:	48,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Single-engine sea; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane single-engine	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 Valid Medicalno waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	March 12, 2003
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	July 25, 2002
Flight Time:	12000 hours (Total, all aircraft), 7400 hours (Total, this make and model), 11730 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 95 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 50 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Cessna	Registration:	N7372Q
Model/Series:	206	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	U20602186
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	May 15, 2003 Continuous airworthiness	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3800 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	48 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	8791.4 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	TSIO-520GCM
Registered Owner:	Wilderness Aircraft II LLC	Rated Power:	310 Horsepower
Operator:	McCall Aviation	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	M2LA

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/ None	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:		Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:		Temperature/Dew Point:	18°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	McCall, ID (MKL)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Soldier Bar, ID (85U)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	09:00 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:	Soldier Bar USFS 85U	Runway Surface Type:	Dirt
Airport Elevation:	4190 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry;Rough
Runway Used:	07	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	1650 ft / 15 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	45.099723,-114.80194

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Little, Thomas
Additional Participating Persons:	Terry Bateman; Federal Aviation Administration; Boise, ID
Original Publish Date:	June 30, 2004
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=57288

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available <u>here</u>.