Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Crownpoint, New Mexico	**Accident Number:**	FTW02LA031
Date & Time:	November 7, 2001, 16:00 Local	**Registration:**	N1099A
Aircraft:	Raytheon A36	**Aircraft Damage:**	Substantial
Defining Event:		**Injuries:**	1 Serious, 1 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Instructional		

Analysis

The private pilot, who was occupying the left seat, was on an instrument cross-country training flight, accompanied by another private pilot, who occupied the right seat as a safety pilot. As the flight progressed, the left seat pilot complained of feeling ill, telling the safety pilot that he didn't think he could make it to the destination airport and needed a "restroom break." Both pilots then agreed to land at an airport along the route of flight. The left seat pilot relinquished control of the aircraft to the right seat safety pilot. The safety pilot then over flew the runway and determined the wind to be very light . During the landing flare, the airplane began to bank to the left, and when the airplane was no longer over the runway, a go-around was initiated. Power was added and flaps were retracted from 30 degrees to 0 degrees. The airplane failed to climb, subsequently impacting a fence and some poles, coming to rest approximately 200 yards left of the runway. The safety pilot had no experience landing the airplane from the right seat. According to the airplane's pilot operating handbook, when executing a go around, the flaps should not be retracted until all obstables are cleared.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The safety pilot's failure to maintain directional control during the landing. Contributing factors were the safety pilot's lack of experience flying from the right seat and the improper retraction of the flaps during the attempted go-around.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF CONTROL - IN FLIGHT
Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

Findings
1. (C) DIRECTIONAL CONTROL - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND
2. (F) LACK OF EXPERIENCE - PILOT IN COMMAND
3. GO-AROUND - ATTEMPTED - PILOT IN COMMAND
4. (F) RAISING OF FLAPS - PREMATURE - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #2: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT
Phase of Operation: GO-AROUND (VFR)

Findings
5. (F) FLAPS - IMPROPER USE OF - PILOT IN COMMAND
6. OBJECT - FENCE
7. OBJECT - POLE

Factual Information

On November 7, 2001, at 1600 mountain standard time, a Raytheon A36 single-engine airplane, N1099A, was substantially damaged when it impacted a fence, poles, and terrain during an attempted landing at the Crownpoint Airport, Crownpoint, New Mexico. The airplane was registered to and operated by Mesa Pilot Development, Inc., of Farmington, New Mexico. The private pilot seated in the left seat was not injured, and the private pilot seated in the right seat, who was acting as a safety pilot, sustained serious injuries. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed and a visual flight rules (VFR) flight plan was filed for the 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91 instructional flight. The cross-country instrument training flight departed from the Roswell Airport, Roswell, New Mexico, at 1500, with a destination of Farmington, New Mexico.

In a telephone interview with an NTSB investigator, the left seat pilot reported that while en route on the return flight to Farmington, he began to feel ill and informed his safety pilot that he wished to divert and land at the Crownpoint Airport for a "restroom break." He then relinquished control of the aircraft to the safety pilot after both pilots agreed to land at the Crownpoint Airport. The safety pilot overflew the airport and determined the wind to be very light from the north. The safety pilot then entered a left downwind for runway 36. During the landing flare, the aircraft encountered an "uncommanded left bank." When the left seat pilot observed that they were off to the left side of the runway, he yelled to the safety pilot to "go around, go around," at which point power was added and the "flaps were retracted from the 30 degree position to the 10 degree position." As a positive rate of climb was not evident and ground contact imminent, the left seat pilot closed the throttle and pulled the yoke back. The aircraft then impacted terrain, subsequently hitting a fence and poles prior to coming to rest approximately 200 yards west of runway 36.

At 1553, the Grant-Milan Automated Surface Observing System (ASOS), located 37 nm SSW from Crownpoint, reported the wind from the northwest at 3 to 5 knots. At 1553, the Gallup ASOS, located 32 nm WSW from Crownpoint, reported the wind from 280 degrees at 3 knots. An east-west mountain ridge line separates both Gallup and Grants-Milan from Crownpoint.

Examination of the airplane by the chief pilot of the flight school revealed that the left wing tip was "slightly" damaged, the nose landing gear was separated, the right main landing gear had collapsed, and all three propeller blades were bent aft. Additionally, the forward right wing root area sustained structural damage, and an 8-inch indentation to the wing leading edge was located approximately 4 feet outboard of the right wing root. The chief pilot also reported that he found the flaps to be in the fully retracted (zero degree) position. According to the Beechcraft Bonanza A-36 Pilot Operating Handbook, Section IV, Normal Procedures, the balked landing procedure specifies that an airspeed of 80 knots be maintained until clear of obstacles, trim the airplane to normal climbing airspeed, then select Flaps Up (zero degrees).

According to the FAA inspector, who responded to the accident site, flight control continuity was confirmed. The propeller, throttle, and mixture controls were verified to be operational.

According to the Pilot/Operator Aircraft Accident Report, the right seat safety pilot had accumulated 223 hours total flying time, of which 126 hours were as pilot-in-command in the Beechcraft A36. The left seat pilot had accumulated 201 hours total flying time, with 121 hours as pilot-in-command in the Beechcraft A36.

In a telephone interview with an NTSB investigator, the assistant chief pilot of the flight school reported that pilot trainees are not trained to fly the aircraft from the right seat.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	**Age:**	40,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	**Seat Occupied:**	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	**Restraint Used:**	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	**Second Pilot Present:**	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	**Toxicology Performed:**	No
Medical Certification:	Valid Medical--no waivers/lim.	**Last FAA Medical Exam:**	December 22, 2000
Occupational Pilot:		**Last Flight Review or Equivalent:**	May 5, 2001
Flight Time:	200 hours (Total, all aircraft), 200 hours (Total, this make and model), 141 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 45 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 6 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Co-pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	**Age:**	26,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	**Seat Occupied:**	
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	Helicopter	**Restraint Used:**	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	**Second Pilot Present:**	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	**Toxicology Performed:**	No
Medical Certification:	Valid Medical--no waivers/lim.	**Last FAA Medical Exam:**	October 4, 2000
Occupational Pilot:		**Last Flight Review or Equivalent:**	May 4, 2001
Flight Time:	223 hours (Total, all aircraft), 163 hours (Total, this make and model), 148 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 36 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 16 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Raytheon	**Registration:**	N1099A
Model/Series:	A36	**Aircraft Category:**	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		**Amateur Built:**	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Utility	**Serial Number:**	E-3088
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	**Seats:**	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	November 6, 2001 Continuous airworthiness	**Certified Max Gross Wt.:**	3650 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	2.4 Hrs	**Engines:**	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	5220.7 Hrs at time of accident	**Engine Manufacturer:**	Continental
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	**Engine Model/Series:**	IO-550-B
Registered Owner:	Mesa Pilot Development, Inc.	**Rated Power:**	300 Horsepower
Operator:		**Operating Certificate(s) Held:**	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	**Condition of Light:**	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		**Distance from Accident Site:**	
Observation Time:		**Direction from Accident Site:**	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Unknown	**Visibility**	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 7000 ft AGL	**Visibility (RVR):**	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	5 knots / 0 knots	**Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:**	/
Wind Direction:	300°	**Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:**	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.11 inches Hg	**Temperature/Dew Point:**	13°C / 0°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Roswell, NM (ROS)	**Type of Flight Plan Filed:**	Company VFR
Destination:	Farmington, NM (FMN)	**Type of Clearance:**	VFR
Departure Time:	15:00 Local	**Type of Airspace:**	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:	Crownpoint Airport OE8	**Runway Surface Type:**	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	6696 ft msl	**Runway Surface Condition:**	Dry
Runway Used:	36	**IFR Approach:**	None
Runway Length/Width:	5820 ft / 60 ft	**VFR Approach/Landing:**	Traffic pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 None	**Aircraft Damage:**	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		**Aircraft Fire:**	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	**Aircraft Explosion:**	None
Total Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 None	**Latitude, Longitude:**	35.717498,-108.201385

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Charnon, Nicole
Additional Participating Persons:	Kearnes Branham; Federal Aviation Administration; Albuquerque, NM
Original Publish Date:	July 2, 2002
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=53736