

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	Roanoke, Virginia	Accident Number:	NYC02LA021
Date & Time:	November 3, 2001, 12:45 Local	Registration:	N5207Z
Aircraft:	Piper PA-22-108	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

While on departure climb, and less than 1,000 feet above the ground, the pilot moved the fuel selector from the left (main) fuel tank to the right (aux) fuel tank. The engine quit, and the pilot reported he did not have time to focus on the engine out, but only time for the forced landing. The airplane struck a detached garage, and came to rest inverted near a residence. The index plate for the fuel selector was found improperly secured, and obscured the tank index position marks. The pilot reported that it was turbulent when he changed tanks and could not verifying the position of the fuel tank selector or feel its detent. The right tank was placarded use in level flight only.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The failure of the pilot ensure the proper position of the fuel selector which resulted in fuel starvation. Factors were the improper placement of the fuel selector valve tank index, and the improper in-flight decision of the pilot to change tanks in accordance with the owner's manual.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER Phase of Operation: CLIMB - TO CRUISE

Findings 1. (F) MAINTENANCE - IMPROPER - OTHER MAINTENANCE PERSONNEL 2. (F) PROCEDURES/DIRECTIVES - NOT FOLLOWED - PILOT IN COMMAND 3. (C) FUEL TANK SELECTOR POSITION - NOT VERIFIED - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING Phase of Operation: DESCENT - EMERGENCY

Occurrence #3: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT Phase of Operation: DESCENT - EMERGENCY

Findings 4. OBJECT - BUILDING(NONRESIDENTIAL)

Factual Information

On November 3, 2001, about 1245 eastern standard time, a Piper PA-22-108, N5207Z, was substantially damaged, when it made a forced landing about 4 miles east-northeast of Roanoke Regional Airport, Roanoke, Virginia. The certificated private pilot and passenger were not injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed for the personal flight. No flight plan had been filed for the flight that was conducted under 14 CFR Part 91.

According to the pilot, the airplane was equipped with two fuel tanks, one in each wing, which had a capacity of 18 gallons each. The left fuel tank was designated the main fuel tank, and the right fuel tank was designated as the auxiliary fuel tank.

The pilot had departed from New London Airport, Forest, Virginia, with full tanks, and flew to Roanoke on the left fuel tank. The takeoff from Roanoke for the return flight to New London was also conducted on the left tank. However, while climbing, and less than 1,000 feet above the ground, the pilot switched to the right fuel tank. Within 2 minutes, the engine lost power. The pilot described the power loss as smooth, with no sputtering, backfiring, or hesitation. The pilot further stated that he did not have time to focus on the power loss, as he was losing altitude, and he needed to set up for a forced landing. He reported that he did not return the fuel selector to the left tank. The airplane struck the edge of a detached garage with the wing, then the ground behind a residence, and came to rest inverted.

According to an inspector from the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA), the airplane was still inverted when he examined it. The fuel tanks had been drained due to leaks from the fuel caps. The fuel selector was on the right fuel tank. The carburetor was separated from the engine and had impact damage. The main fuel strainer was absent of debris.

The airplane was subsequently moved to a nearby airport for further examination. In a followup investigation of the airplane the FAA inspector wrote:

"...A review of the Piper Cold (PA 22) owners handbook, section II FUEL SYSTEM, states the AUX tank must be used in LEVEL FLIGHT ONLY...Engine rotation was checked with all ignition systems, engine drive systems, exhaust system, intake system, oil system, and fuel delivery checking normal. The fuel selector outer position ring...was noted as not secure and tank position was difficult to check, or verify. The outer ring has previously been incorrectly attached to the aircraft upholstery with out benefit of the correct location of a backing plate...to positively secure the outer position ring to the aircraft. Each detent of the selector valve...however could be felt but the selector pointer handle obscures the tank position index mark...and the pilot stated he was in turbulence when he switched tanks could not verify or feel the correct detent. He felt it was possible he overran slightly the intended tank selection. A slight overrun was introduced and fuel supply to the engine was blocked as a result."

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	55,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medical–w/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	March 7, 2001
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	October 7, 2000
Flight Time:	267 hours (Total, all aircraft), 216 hours (Total, this make and model), 215 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 13 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Piper	Registration:	N5207Z
Model/Series:	PA-22-108	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	22-8877
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	2
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	November 1, 2001 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	1650 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	3 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2888 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	0-235-C1B
Registered Owner:	On file	Rated Power:	108 Horsepower
Operator:	On file	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	ROA,1176 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	4 Nautical Miles
Observation Facility, Elevation.	ROA, IT 70 IT HISI	Distance from Accident Site.	4 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	12:54 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	250°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Few / 12000 ft AGL	Visibility	10 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	12 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	290°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.23 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	23°C / 6°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipita	ation	
Departure Point:	Roanoke, VA (ROA)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	New London, VA (W90)	Type of Clearance:	VFR flight following
Departure Time:	12:40 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class D

Airport Information

Airport:	Roanoke Regional ROA	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	1176 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:		IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	Forced landing

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	37.352779,-79.93

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	HANCOCK, ROBERT
Additional Participating Persons:	Edward Hall; Federal Aviation Administration; Richmond, VA
Original Publish Date:	June 18, 2002
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>
Note:	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=53710

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available <u>here</u>.