



# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

Location: Broomfield, Colorado Accident Number: DEN01LA119

Date & Time: July 1, 2001, 11:25 Local Registration: N2129Q

Aircraft: Cessna 177RG Aircraft Damage: Substantial

**Defining Event:** 2 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

### **Analysis**

During cruise flight, the pilot heard a loud "pop" and noticed the landing GEAR UP light was no longer illuminated and would not illuminate when he pushed the PUSH TO TEST button. When he tested the GEAR DOWN light, it illuminated. He slowed the airplane and cycled the landing gear, but to no avail. He then checked and reset the landing gear circuit breaker. He cycled the landing gear both electrically and manually. He was able to lock the nose landing gear by pulling a 2-g maneuver, but the main landing gear remained retracted. The pilot then landed with the nose gear extended and the main gears retracted. He was able to maintain a wings level attitude until the aircraft came to a stop approximately 250 feet down the runway. The aircraft then leaned onto its right stabilizer, crushing some spars and ribs. Post-accident examination revealed the hydraulic nose landing gear UP hose had failed.

### **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: failure of the nose landing gear hydraulic UP hose, which resulted in a wheels-up landing.

### **Findings**

Occurrence #1: AIRFRAME/COMPONENT/SYSTEM FAILURE/MALFUNCTION

Phase of Operation: CRUISE - NORMAL

Findings

1. (C) HYDRAULIC SYSTEM, LINE - BURST

#### 2. REMEDIAL ACTION - NOT SUCCESSFUL - PILOT IN COMMAND

------

Occurrence #2: WHEELS UP LANDING Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Page 2 of 7 DEN01LA119

#### **Factual Information**

On July 1, 2001, at 1125 mountain daylight time, a Cessna 177RG, N2129Q, owned and operated by the pilot, was substantially damaged during a wheels-up landing at the Broomfield-Jefferson County (Jeffco) Airport, Broomfield, Colorado. The private pilot and his passenger were not injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed, and a VFR flight plan had been filed for the personal flight being conducted under Title 14 CFR Part 91. The flight originated from Erie, Colorado, approximately 0830.

In his accident report, the pilot said approximately 30 minutes into the flight, he heard a loud "pop" or "bang" from the front of the aircraft. The aircraft's airspeed then dropped from a cruise speed of 155 mph to approximately 135 mph. The pilot then noticed the landing GEAR UP light was no longer illuminated. The GEAR UP light did not illuminate when he pushed the PUSH TO TEST button. When he tested the GEAR DOWN light, it illuminated. He slowed the airplane and cycled the landing gear, but to no avail. He then checked and reset the landing gear circuit breaker. He cycled the landing gear both electrically and manually. He then contacted Denver Flight Service Station for assistance and was directed to the Broomfield-Jefferson County (Jeffco) Airport for an emergency gear up landing. The pilot made a low pass and control tower personnel confirmed the landing gear was partially extended. He then proceeded to the Stanley Lake area, near Jeffco, to attempt to lower the landing gear. He said he made a dive with a 2-G pull-up. The maneuver successfully locked the nose landing gear, but the main landing gear remained retracted. The pilot returned to Jeffco and made another low pass for control tower personnel to confirm the position of the landing gear. He then landed with the nose gear extended and the main gears retracted. He said he was able to maintain a wings level attitude until the aircraft came to a stop approximately 250 feet down runway 29 Left. The aircraft then leaned onto its right stabilizer. The right stabilizer received damage to its tip, and the spars and ribs were bent. There was also damage to a tie down bolt and mounting plate.

Postaccident examination revealed the nose landing gear hydraulic UP hose had separated at the fitting, allowing the hydraulic fluid supply to be depleted. Airworthiness Directive (A.D.) 97-01-13, applicable to the Cessna 177RG, effective February 3, 1997, requires the replacing of any "Cessna P/N S51-10 [hose] that has a diagonal or spiral pattern external reinforcement wrap with a Cessna P/N S51-10 hose that has a criss-cross pattern external wrap. . .in accordance with the ACCOMPLISHMENT INSTRUCTIONS of Service Bulletin (SB) SEB96-15, dated October 18, 1996." According to the service bulletin, "some S51-10 type hoses shipped . . between March 28, 1995, and June 28, 1996, may have been improperly manufactured. Installed hoses that were improperly manufactured may deteriorate and eventually result in delamination on the inner tube from the external wrap (and) may result in a hydraulic system . . . malfunction . . . "

Page 3 of 7 DEN01LA119

A review of the aircraft's maintenance records revealed only two entries pertaining to the hydraulic hoses. The first, dated January 9, 1991, noted, "Tach 2611 . . . Serviced hydraulic power pack - see AD list in #1 book, replace 1 nose gear retract cyl(inder) hose - checked OK." The second, dated February 1, 1992, read, "Tach 2644 . . . Replace hydraulic hose P/N 2178-4-0134A to nose gear (re)tract cylinders . . . " Since these maintenance entries predated SEB96-15 and AD 97-01-13, the replacement hoses were not taken from the lot suspected of having been improperly manufactured. However, according to the "Airworthiness Directive Compliance Record," AD 97-01-13 had been complied with during the annual inspections of January 2, 1999, and February 4, 2000.

While repairs were being made to the airplane, it was noted that the mechanics were referring to Cessna SEB92-8, dated April 17, 1992. The service bulletin stated that "certain S2178-4 series (blue) hydraulic hose assemblies should be replaced." No reason was given. Replacement hoses were designated S2888-4 series (black). The failed nose landing gear hydraulic UP hose was a blue- colored hose. According to the Cessna Aircraft Company, both SEB92-8 and SEB96-15 are still in effect, and the latter has not superceded the former.

#### **Pilot Information**

| Certificate:              | Private  | Age:                              | 53,Male        |
|---------------------------|--|-----------------------------------|----------------|
| Airplane Rating(s):       | Single-engine land   | Seat Occupied:                    | Left           |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None   | Restraint Used:                   |                |
| Instrument Rating(s):     | None   | Second Pilot Present:             | No             |
| Instructor Rating(s):     | None   | Toxicology Performed:             | No             |
| Medical Certification:    | Class 3 Valid Medicalw/<br>waivers/lim   | Last FAA Medical Exam:            | May 23, 2000   |
| Occupational Pilot:       | No   | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | April 21, 2000 |
| Flight Time:              | 529 hours (Total, all aircraft), 460 hours (Total, this make and model), 448 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 41 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 20 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft) |                                   |                |

Page 4 of 7 DEN01LA119

## **Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information**

| Aircraft Make:                | Cessna                         | Registration:                     | N2129Q          |
|-------------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Model/Series:                 | 177RG                          | Aircraft Category:                | Airplane        |
| Year of Manufacture:          |                                | Amateur Built:                    |                 |
| Airworthiness Certificate:    | Normal                         | Serial Number:                    | 177RG0529       |
| Landing Gear Type:            | Retractable - Tricycle         | Seats:                            | 4               |
| Date/Type of Last Inspection: | March 5, 2001 Annual           | Certified Max Gross Wt.:          | 2800 lbs        |
| Time Since Last Inspection:   | 40 Hrs                         | Engines:                          | 1 Reciprocating |
| Airframe Total Time:          | 3152 Hrs as of last inspection | Engine Manufacturer:              | Lycoming        |
| ELT:                          | Installed, not activated       | Engine Model/Series:              | I0-360-A1B6D    |
| Registered Owner:             | Larry L. Earnshaw              | Rated Power:                      | 200 Horsepower  |
| Operator:                     |                                | Operating Certificate(s)<br>Held: | None            |
|                               |                                |                                   |                 |

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site:     | Visual (VMC)                 | Condition of Light:                  | Day         |
|----------------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------|
| Observation Facility, Elevation: | KBJC,5670 ft msl             | Distance from Accident Site:         |             |
| Observation Time:                | 10:45 Local                  | Direction from Accident Site:        |             |
| <b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>   | Scattered / 6000 ft AGL      | Visibility                           | 60 miles    |
| Lowest Ceiling:                  | None                         | Visibility (RVR):                    |             |
| Wind Speed/Gusts:                | 8 knots /                    | Turbulence Type<br>Forecast/Actual:  | /           |
| Wind Direction:                  | 360°                         | Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual: | /           |
| Altimeter Setting:               | 30.19 inches Hg              | Temperature/Dew Point:               | 28°C / 13°C |
| Precipitation and Obscuration:   | No Obscuration; No Precipita | ation                                |             |
| Departure Point:                 | Erie, CO (48V)               | Type of Flight Plan Filed:           | VFR         |
| Destination:                     | Wahoo, NE (AHQ )             | Type of Clearance:                   | VFR         |
| Departure Time:                  | 08:30 Local                  | Type of Airspace:                    |             |
|                                  |                              |                                      |             |

Page 5 of 7 DEN01LA119

## **Airport Information**

| Airport:             | Broomfield-Jefferson County BJC | Runway Surface Type:             | Asphalt   |
|----------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------------|-----------|
| Airport Elevation:   | 5670 ft msl                     | <b>Runway Surface Condition:</b> | Dry       |
| Runway Used:         | 29L                             | IFR Approach:                    | None      |
| Runway Length/Width: | 7004 ft / 75 ft                 | VFR Approach/Landing:            | Full stop |

## Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries:         | 1 None | Aircraft Damage:        | Substantial               |
|------------------------|--------|-------------------------|---------------------------|
| Passenger<br>Injuries: | 1 None | Aircraft Fire:          | None                      |
| Ground Injuries:       | N/A    | Aircraft Explosion:     | None                      |
| Total Injuries:        | 2 None | Latitude,<br>Longitude: | 39.889495,-105.10997(est) |

Page 6 of 7 DEN01LA119

#### **Administrative Information**

| Investigator In Charge (IIC):     | Scott, Arnold  |
|-----------------------------------|--|
| Additional Participating Persons: | David F Gonzales; FAA Flight Standards District Office; Denver, CO |
| Original Publish Date:            | October 23, 2001   |
| Last Revision Date:               |  |
| Investigation Class:              | <u>Class</u>   |
| Note:                             | The NTSB traveled to the scene of this accident.                   |
| Investigation Docket:             | https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=52609                       |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 7 of 7 DEN01LA119