

# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

| Location:               | Venice, Florida                      | Accident Number:     | MIA01LA137  |
|-------------------------|--------------------------------------|----------------------|-------------|
| Date & Time:            | April 27, 2001, 18:45 Local          | <b>Registration:</b> | N876BB      |
| Aircraft:               | Piper PA-34-200                      | Aircraft Damage:     | Substantial |
| Defining Event:         |                                      | Injuries:            | 3 None      |
| Flight Conducted Under: | Part 91: General aviation - Personal |                      |             |

# Analysis

The pilot stated that the airplane touched down at 80 knots on runway 31 just south of the intersection of runway 04/22, and the brakes were not effective when he initially applied them. He pumped the brakes with no effect for several pumping actions; they then became effective. He then applied the brakes heavily but the airplane rolled off the end of runway 31, collapsing the right main landing gear. He also stated that the airplane was too far down the runway to consider performing a go-around, and there were no discrepancies with the brakes or parking brake while taxiing or during the engine run-up before takeoff, respectively. Postaccident examination of the runway by an FAA inspector revealed approximately 250 feet of skid marks from both main landing gear tires at the departure end of the runway. The skid marks continued for an additional 50 feet off the runway. Examination of the airplane revealed that the left main landing gear tire had a flat spot, and the right main landing gear tire was blown and flat spotted.

# **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The failure of the pilot to attain the proper touchdown point resulting in a long landing and subsequent collapse of the right main landing gear. Also, failure of the pilot to perform a goaround following a long landing.

#### Findings

Occurrence #1: MAIN GEAR COLLAPSED Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings

- 1. (C) PROPER TOUCHDOWN POINT NOT ATTAINED PILOT IN COMMAND
- 2. (C) GO-AROUND NOT PERFORMED PILOT IN COMMAND

## **Factual Information**

On April 27, 2001, about 1845 eastern daylight time, a Piper PA-34-200, N876BB, registered to and operated by Manray Express Freight Systems, Inc., experienced collapse of the right main landing gear during the landing roll at the Venice Municipal Airport, Venice, Florida. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time and a visual flight rules (VFR) flight plan was filed for the 14 CFR Part 91 personal flight. The airplane was substantially damaged and there were no injuries to the private-rated pilot or two passengers. The flight originated about 1 hour earlier from the Opa-Locka Airport, Opa-Locka, Florida.

The pilot stated that the airplane touched down at 80 knots on runway 31 just south of the intersection of runway 04/22, and the brakes were not effective when he initially applied them. He pumped the brakes with no effect for several pumping actions; they then became effective. He then applied the brakes heavily but the airplane rolled off the end of runway 31, collapsing the right main landing gear. He also stated that the airplane was too far down the runway to consider performing a go-around, and there were no discrepancies with the brakes or parking brake while taxiing or during the engine run-up before takeoff, respectively.

Postaccident examination of the runway by an FAA inspector revealed approximately 250 feet of skid marks from both main landing gear tires at the departure end of the runway. The skid marks continued for an additional 50 feet off the runway. Examination of the airplane revealed that the left main landing gear tire had a flat spot, and the right main landing gear tire was blown and flat spotted. A copy of the FAA inspector statement is an attachment to this report.

#### **Pilot Information**

| The the the               |  |                                   |                  |
|---------------------------|--|-----------------------------------|------------------|
| Certificate:              | Private  | Age:                              | 39,Male          |
| Airplane Rating(s):       | Single-engine land; Multi-engine<br>land                               | Seat Occupied:                    | Left             |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None   | Restraint Used:                   |                  |
| Instrument Rating(s):     | Airplane   | Second Pilot Present:             | No               |
| Instructor Rating(s):     | None   | Toxicology Performed:             | No               |
| Medical Certification:    | Class 3 Valid Medicalno<br>waivers/lim.                                | Last FAA Medical Exam:            | December 1, 1999 |
| Occupational Pilot:       | UNK  | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | August 17, 1999  |
| Flight Time:              | 800 hours (Total, all aircraft), 80 hours (Total, this make and model) |                                   |                  |

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

| Aircraft Make:                   | Piper                  | Registration:                     | N876BB          |
|----------------------------------|------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Model/Series:                    | PA-34-200              | Aircraft Category:                | Airplane        |
| Year of Manufacture:             |                        | Amateur Built:                    |                 |
| Airworthiness Certificate:       | Normal                 | Serial Number:                    | 34-7350248      |
| Landing Gear Type:               | Retractable - Tricycle | Seats:                            |                 |
| Date/Type of Last<br>Inspection: | Unknown                | Certified Max Gross Wt.:          |                 |
| Time Since Last Inspection:      |                        | Engines:                          | 2 Reciprocating |
| Airframe Total Time:             |                        | Engine Manufacturer:              | Lycoming        |
| ELT:                             |                        | Engine Model/Series:              | IO-360-         |
| Registered Owner:                | Robert E. Hammer       | Rated Power:                      |                 |
| Operator:                        |                        | Operating Certificate(s)<br>Held: | None            |
|                                  |                        |                                   |                 |

# Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site:            | Visual (VMC)                 | Condition of Light:                     | Day               |
|---|------------------------------|---|-------------------|
| <b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b> | KSRQ,27 ft msl               | Distance from Accident Site:            | 20 Nautical Miles |
| Observation Time:                       | 18:53 Local                  | Direction from Accident Site:           | 345°              |
| Lowest Cloud Condition:                 | Scattered / 8000 ft AGL      | Visibility                              | 10 miles          |
| Lowest Ceiling:                         | None                         | Visibility (RVR):                       |                   |
| Wind Speed/Gusts:                       | 6 knots /                    | Turbulence Type<br>Forecast/Actual:     | /                 |
| Wind Direction:                         | 60°                          | Turbulence Severity<br>Forecast/Actual: | /                 |
| Altimeter Setting:                      | 30.05 inches Hg              | Temperature/Dew Point:                  | 27°C / 9°C        |
| Precipitation and Obscuration:          | No Obscuration; No Precipita | ation                                   |                   |
| Departure Point:                        | Opa-Locka, FL (KOPF)         | Type of Flight Plan Filed:              | VFR               |
| Destination:                            | Venice, FL (KVNC)            | Type of Clearance:                      | VFR               |
| Departure Time:                         | 17:45 Local                  | Type of Airspace:                       | Class G           |

## **Airport Information**

| Airport:             | Venice Municipal VNC | Runway Surface Type:             | Asphalt                   |
|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------------------|---------------------------|
| Airport Elevation:   | 18 ft msl            | <b>Runway Surface Condition:</b> | Dry                       |
| Runway Used:         | 31                   | IFR Approach:                    | Unknown                   |
| Runway Length/Width: | 4999 ft / 150 ft     | VFR Approach/Landing:            | Full stop;Traffic pattern |

# Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries:         | 1 None | Aircraft Damage:        | Substantial          |
|------------------------|--------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| Passenger<br>Injuries: | 2 None | Aircraft Fire:          | None                 |
| Ground Injuries:       | N/A    | Aircraft Explosion:     | None                 |
| Total Injuries:        | 3 None | Latitude,<br>Longitude: | 27.071666,-82.440277 |

#### Administrative Information

| Investigator In Charge (IIC):        | Monville, Timothy                                |
|--------------------------------------|--|
| Additional Participating<br>Persons: | Kenneth M Perroz; FAA; Tampa, FL                 |
| Original Publish Date:               | September 27, 2001                               |
| Last Revision Date:                  |  |
| Investigation Class:                 | <u>Class</u>                                     |
| Note:                                | The NTSB traveled to the scene of this accident. |
| Investigation Docket:                | https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=52173     |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available <u>here</u>.