



# Aviation Investigation Final Report

<b>Location:</b>	Greeley, Colorado	<b>Accident Number:</b>	DEN01LA089
<b>Date &amp; Time:</b>	April 25, 2001, 10:00 Local	<b>Registration:</b>	N666TC
<b>Aircraft:</b>	Cessna 140A	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Defining Event:</b>		<b>Injuries:</b>	1 None
<b>Flight Conducted Under:</b>	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

## Analysis

The pilot made a conventional, full-stall landing. Upon touch down, the right main landing gear failed. The airplane skidded to a halt, buckling the fuselage and landing gear box, and damaging the wing spar. Metallurgical examination disclosed cracks had initiated in one of two holes used to attach the step assembly to the landing gear spring. Chevron (or beach) marks on the fractured surface pointed back to the crack initiation site, and were consistent with fatigue cracking. The adjacent area was characterized by dimples, indicating the final breakage was due to a ductile fracture under overload.

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: total failure of the right main landing gear spring due to fatigue.

### Findings

Occurrence #1: AIRFRAME/COMPONENT/SYSTEM FAILURE/MALFUNCTION

Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

#### Findings

1. (C) LANDING GEAR,MAIN GEAR SPRING - FAILURE,TOTAL
2. (C) LANDING GEAR,MAIN GEAR SPRING - FATIGUE

## Factual Information

On April 25, 2001, approximately 1000 mountain daylight time, a Cessna 140A, N666TC, was substantially damaged when the right main landing gear failed during landing at the Greeley-Weld County Airport, Greeley, Colorado. The recreational pilot, the sole occupant aboard, was not injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed, and no flight plan had been filed for the personal flight being conducted under Title 14 CFR Part 91. The flight originated at Hudson, Colorado, approximately 0915.

The following is based on a telephone interview with the pilot and the accident report he later submitted. The purpose of the flight was to practice pattern work accuracy and takeoffs and landings. The pilot made two low approaches to the runway at Greeley. On the third approach, he decided to make a landing. A full stall conventional landing was made. The right main landing gear broke on touch down and the airplane skidded to a halt. The fuselage and landing gear box were buckled, and the wing spar was damaged.

Both fractured ends of the main landing gear were cut away and sent to the Cessna Aircraft Company's Material and Process (M&P) Engineering Department, where they were metallurgically examined. The following is based on Cessna's M&P report:

The landing gear was made of 6150M steel, and microstructure examination disclosed it had a hardness and tensile strength that met Cessna's engineering specifications. Decarburization, approximately 0.015 inches in depth, was noted near the top surface of the landing gear. There was also deformation and roughening on the inside surface, consistent with shot-peening, also required by engineering specifications. Two holes, 3/16" in diameter, and two bolts and nuts were used to attach the step assembly to the landing gear spring. The bolts were not damaged. Florescent magnetic particle inspection revealed cracks had initiated at the top end of the lower hole. No cracking was observed at the inside end of the hole. The M&P report concluded that the landing gear spring cracked through the upper hole. Chevron (or beach) marks on the fractured surface pointed back to the crack initiation site, and were consistent with fatigue cracking. The fracture features were similar to quasi-cleavage, and faint crack arrest lines were observed. The fatigue region was very small, approximately 0.075 inches in depth. The adjacent area was characterized by dimples, indicating the final breakage was due to a ductile fracture under overload.

## Pilot Information

<b>Certificate:</b>	Recreational	<b>Age:</b>	64, Male
<b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>	Single-engine land	<b>Seat Occupied:</b>	Left
<b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Restraint Used:</b>	
<b>Instrument Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Second Pilot Present:</b>	No
<b>Instructor Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Toxicology Performed:</b>	No
<b>Medical Certification:</b>	Class 3 Valid Medical-w/ waivers/lim	<b>Last FAA Medical Exam:</b>	January 17, 2001
<b>Occupational Pilot:</b>	No	<b>Last Flight Review or Equivalent:</b>	February 1, 2001
<b>Flight Time:</b>	131 hours (Total, all aircraft), 67 hours (Total, this make and model), 30 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 21 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 11 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 3 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

<b>Aircraft Make:</b>	Cessna	<b>Registration:</b>	N666TC
<b>Model/Series:</b>	140A	<b>Aircraft Category:</b>	Airplane
<b>Year of Manufacture:</b>		<b>Amateur Built:</b>	
<b>Airworthiness Certificate:</b>	Normal	<b>Serial Number:</b>	15399
<b>Landing Gear Type:</b>	Tailwheel	<b>Seats:</b>	2
<b>Date/Type of Last Inspection:</b>	June 15, 2000 Annual	<b>Certified Max Gross Wt.:</b>	1500 lbs
<b>Time Since Last Inspection:</b>	56 Hrs	<b>Engines:</b>	1 Reciprocating
<b>Airframe Total Time:</b>	8243 Hrs at time of accident	<b>Engine Manufacturer:</b>	Continental
<b>ELT:</b>	Installed, not activated	<b>Engine Model/Series:</b>	C-90-12F
<b>Registered Owner:</b>	Gregory W. Lair	<b>Rated Power:</b>	90 Horsepower
<b>Operator:</b>	George Lair	<b>Operating Certificate(s) Held:</b>	None

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

<b>Conditions at Accident Site:</b>	Visual (VMC)	<b>Condition of Light:</b>	Day
<b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b>	GXY,4658 ft msl	<b>Distance from Accident Site:</b>	
<b>Observation Time:</b>	09:55 Local	<b>Direction from Accident Site:</b>	
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Clear	<b>Visibility</b>	10 miles
<b>Lowest Ceiling:</b>	None	<b>Visibility (RVR):</b>	
<b>Wind Speed/Gusts:</b>	0 knots / 0 knots	<b>Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Wind Direction:</b>	0°	<b>Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Altimeter Setting:</b>	30.31 inches Hg	<b>Temperature/Dew Point:</b>	10°C / 6°C
<b>Precipitation and Obscuration:</b>	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
<b>Departure Point:</b>	Hudson, CO (18V )	<b>Type of Flight Plan Filed:</b>	None
<b>Destination:</b>	Greeley, CO (GXY )	<b>Type of Clearance:</b>	None
<b>Departure Time:</b>	09:15 Local	<b>Type of Airspace:</b>	Class E

## Airport Information

<b>Airport:</b>	Greeley-Weld County GXY	<b>Runway Surface Type:</b>	Asphalt
<b>Airport Elevation:</b>	4658 ft msl	<b>Runway Surface Condition:</b>	Dry
<b>Runway Used:</b>	09	<b>IFR Approach:</b>	None
<b>Runway Length/Width:</b>	6200 ft / 100 ft	<b>VFR Approach/Landing:</b>	Full stop;Traffic pattern

## Wreckage and Impact Information

<b>Crew Injuries:</b>	1 None	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Passenger Injuries:</b>		<b>Aircraft Fire:</b>	None
<b>Ground Injuries:</b>	N/A	<b>Aircraft Explosion:</b>	None
<b>Total Injuries:</b>	1 None	<b>Latitude, Longitude:</b>	40.44057,-104.669219(est)

## Administrative Information

<b>Investigator In Charge (IIC):</b>	Scott, Arnold
<b>Additional Participating Persons:</b>	Thomas A Sciacca; FAA Flight Standards District Office; Denver, CO
<b>Original Publish Date:</b>	February 20, 2002
<b>Last Revision Date:</b>	
<b>Investigation Class:</b>	<a href="#">Class</a>
<b>Note:</b>	The NTSB traveled to the scene of this accident.
<b>Investigation Docket:</b>	<a href="https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=52127">https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=52127</a>

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).