

# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

Location: OXNARD, California Accident Number: LAX01LA154

Date & Time: April 22, 2001, 15:42 Local Registration: N75343

Aircraft: Piper PA-22-135 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

**Defining Event:** 2 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

### **Analysis**

The airplane made an off field forced landing following a loss of engine power during climb out from a touch-and-go landing. The pilot had practiced touch-and-go landings for over an hour and experienced no difficulties with the airplane. After a break, he completed another preflight inspection and practiced more landings. As the airplane climbed through 200 feet on the fourth takeoff, the engine made a clunking noise and stopped producing power. He steered the airplane to an open field and landed on soft dirt, but the airplane dug in and damaged the wings, stabilizer, landing gear, and propeller. The engine had accumulated about 1,860 hours since it had been manufactured in 1953, and the factory had no record of it returning since that time. The engine had accumulated about 910 hours since a field overhaul in 1960, and about 255 hours since a "top overhaul" in 1970, when the exhaust valves were replaced. All cylinders were undamaged except cylinder No. 3, which exhibited extensive mechanical damage. The exhaust valve for cylinder No. 3 fractured and separated where the valve stem transitions to the valve head. The fracture surfaces on the valve pieces were obliterated by the mechanical damage. The piston face exhibited mechanical damage over most of its surface, which contained two holes. The corresponding push rod was slightly bent, but there was no evidence of the valve sticking.

### **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The fracture and separation of the number 3 cylinder exhaust valve head resulting in a loss of engine power and a forced landing. A factor in the accident was the soft field where the forced landing occurred.

### **Findings**

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER(TOTAL) - MECH FAILURE/MALF

Phase of Operation: TAKEOFF - INITIAL CLIMB

#### **Findings**

1. (C) ENGINE ASSEMBLY, VALVE, EXHAUST - FRACTURED 2. (C) ENGINE ASSEMBLY, VALVE, EXHAUST - SEPARATION

------

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING Phase of Operation: LANDING

#### **Findings**

3. (F) TERRAIN CONDITION - SOFT

4. SOFT FIELD LANDING/PROCEDURE - ATTEMPTED - PILOT IN COMMAND

Page 2 of 6 LAX01LA154

#### **Factual Information**

On April 22, 2001, at 1542 hours Pacific daylight time, a Piper PA-22-135, N75343, made an off field forced landing following a loss of engine power during climb out from Oxnard, California. The owner was operating the airplane under the provisions of 14 CFR Part 91. The private pilot and one passenger were not injured; the airplane sustained substantial damage. The personal, local flight departed Oxnard about 1515. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed, and no flight plan had been filed.

The pilot submitted a written statement. He filled the airplane with fuel and completed a preflight inspection. He practiced touch-and-go landings for over an hour and experienced no difficulties with the airplane. After a break, he completed another preflight inspection and practiced more landings. As the airplane climbed through 200 feet on the fourth takeoff, the engine made a clunking noise and stopped producing power. He steered the airplane to an open field and landed on soft dirt. The airplane dug into the soft dirt and sustained damage to the wings, stabilizer, landing gear, and propeller.

The engine was an 0-290-D2, serial number 6571-21. An engine logbook entry on April 11, 1960, recorded a field overhaul at a tachometer time of 951 hours. An entry on August 1, 1970, recorded a "top overhaul" at a tachometer time of 1,603 hours, and noted that the exhaust valves were replaced. The tachometer read 1,861.57 at the time of the accident.

Textron Lycoming was a party to the investigation. An investigator from Lycoming examined the engine under the supervision of a Safety Board investigator. According to archived Lycoming records, the engine had been manufactured on November 9, 1953, and they had no record of it returning to the factory since that time.

The investigator removed the top spark plugs and examined the cylinders with a lighted bore scope. All cylinders were undamaged except cylinder No. 3, which exhibited extensive mechanical damage. The investigator removed this cylinder.

The exhaust valve for cylinder No. 3 fractured and separated where the valve stem transitions to the valve head. The fracture surfaces on the valve pieces were obliterated by the mechanical damage. The piston face exhibited mechanical damage over most of its surface, which contained two holes. The investigator observed that the corresponding push rod was slightly bent, but he did not observe evidence of the valve sticking. The valve stem measured approximately 13/32 inches, which met original factory specifications.

Page 3 of 6 LAX01LA154

### **Pilot Information**

Certificate:	Private	Age:	50,Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medicalw/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	January 14, 2000
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	May 19, 2000
Flight Time:	1020 hours (Total, all aircraft), 300 hours (Total, this make and model), 1020 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 45 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

## **Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information**

Aircraft Make:	Dinor	Designation	N75343
Aircraft Make.	Piper	Registration:	N/5343
Model/Series:	PA-22-135	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	1927
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	June 30, 2000 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	1950 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	30 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	1861 Hrs at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	0-290-D2
Registered Owner:	STEVAN BATINIC	Rated Power:	135 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Page 4 of 6 LAX01LA154

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	OXR,43 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	1 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	15:22 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	60°
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Clear	Visibility	9 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	10 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	260°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.2 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	15°C / 10°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipita	ation	
Departure Point:	OXNARD, CA (OXR)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:		Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	15:15 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class D

## **Airport Information**

Airport:	OXNARD OXR	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	43 ft msl	<b>Runway Surface Condition:</b>	Dry
Runway Used:	25	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	5950 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Touch and go

## Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	34.189579,-119.170974(est)

Page 5 of 6 LAX01LA154

#### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC): Plagens, Howard

Additional Participating Persons: SAM BELKNAP; Federal Aviation Administration; Van Nuys, CA MARK PLATT; Textron Lycoming; Van Nuys, CA

Original Publish Date: November 28, 2001

Last Revision Date:
Investigation Class: Class

Note: The NTSB traveled to the scene of this accident.

Investigation Docket: https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=52111

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 6 of 6 LAX01LA154