

# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

| Location:               | Houston, Texas                       | Accident Number:     | FTW01LA077  |
|-------------------------|--------------------------------------|----------------------|-------------|
| Date & Time:            | March 13, 2001, 11:45 Local          | <b>Registration:</b> | N93504      |
| Aircraft:               | Ercoupe 415-C                        | Aircraft Damage:     | Substantial |
| Defining Event:         |                                      | Injuries:            | 1 Serious   |
| Flight Conducted Under: | Part 91: General aviation - Personal |                      |             |

### Analysis

The pilot was executing touch-and-go landings when he misjudged the turn from the downwind leg to the base leg, which resulted in a premature descent. The pilot stated that he should have executed a go-around; however, he elected to continue toward the runway. Subsequently, the airplane's altitude on the final approach leg was low and the left wing contacted trees. The airplane then entered an uncontrolled descent and impacted the ground.

### **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the pilot's failure to execute a go-around after becoming low on a visual approach.

**Findings** 

Occurrence #1: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER Phase of Operation: APPROACH - VFR PATTERN - FINAL APPROACH

Findings

- 1. (C) ALTITUDE LOW PILOT IN COMMAND
- 2. (C) GO-AROUND NOT PERFORMED PILOT IN COMMAND
- 3. OBJECT TREE(S)
- 4. TERRAIN CONDITION GROUND

### **Factual Information**

On March 13, 2001, at 1145 central standard time, an Ercoupe 415-C airplane, N93504, was substantially damaged when it impacted trees and terrain during final approach to the Clover Field Airport, Houston, Texas. The private pilot, who was the registered owner and operator of the airplane, sustained serious injuries. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed, and a flight plan was not filed for the 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91 personal flight. The local flight originated from the Clover Field Airport at 1130.

According to the pilot, he was executing touch-and-go landings to runway 14R. He reported that he misjudged the turn from the downwind leg to the base leg, which resulted in a premature descent. He stated that he should have executed a go-around; however, he elected to continue toward the runway. Subsequently, the airplane's altitude on the final approach leg was low and the left wing contacted trees. The airplane then entered a descent and impacted the ground.

Witnesses verified that the airplane was executing touch-and-go landings to runway 14R. One witness reported that he observed the airplane on final approach and it "looked different" than it had on previous approaches. They observed the airplane "bank steeply to the left" and, subsequently, impact the ground.

According to FAA inspectors, who examined the airplane at the accident site, both wings were bent aft. The right wing's skin separated from the leading edge aft, which exposed the main wing spar. They added that the fuselage, empennage, and tail structure sustained structural damage.

| T not information         |  |                                   |                  |
|---------------------------|--|-----------------------------------|------------------|
| Certificate:              | Private  | Age:                              | 71,Male          |
| Airplane Rating(s):       | Single-engine land   | Seat Occupied:                    | Left             |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None   | Restraint Used:                   |                  |
| Instrument Rating(s):     | None   | Second Pilot Present:             | No               |
| Instructor Rating(s):     | None   | Toxicology Performed:             | No               |
| Medical Certification:    | Class 3 Valid Medicalw/<br>waivers/lim   | Last FAA Medical Exam:            | August 30, 1999  |
| Occupational Pilot:       | No   | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | January 24, 2001 |
| Flight Time:              | 450 hours (Total, all aircraft), 250 hours (Total, this make and model), 430 hours (Pilot In<br>Command, all aircraft) |                                   |                  |

#### **Pilot Information**

### Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

| Aircraft Make:                   | Ercoupe   | Registration:                     | N93504          |
|----------------------------------|---|-----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Model/Series:                    | 415-C   | Aircraft Category:                | Airplane        |
| Year of Manufacture:             |   | Amateur Built:                    |                 |
| Airworthiness Certificate:       | Normal  | Serial Number:                    | 815             |
| Landing Gear Type:               | Tricycle  | Seats:                            | 2               |
| Date/Type of Last<br>Inspection: | December 11, 2000 Annual                                  | Certified Max Gross Wt.:          | 1400 lbs        |
| Time Since Last Inspection:      |   | Engines:                          | 1 Reciprocating |
| Airframe Total Time:             |   | Engine Manufacturer:              | Continental     |
| ELT:                             | Installed, activated, did not aid<br>in locating accident | Engine Model/Series:              | C-85-12F        |
| Registered Owner:                | Jerry W. Jourdan  | Rated Power:                      | 85 Horsepower   |
| Operator:                        |   | Operating Certificate(s)<br>Held: | None            |
| Operator Does Business As:       | N/A   | Operator Designator Code:         |                 |

### Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site:     | Visual (VMC)                     | Condition of Light:                     | Day              |
|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|---|------------------|
| Observation Facility, Elevation: | LVJ,43 ft msl                    | Distance from Accident Site:            |                  |
| Observation Time:                | 11:53 Local                      | Direction from Accident Site:           |                  |
| Lowest Cloud Condition:          | Clear                            | Visibility                              | 10 miles         |
| Lowest Ceiling:                  | None                             | Visibility (RVR):                       |                  |
| Wind Speed/Gusts:                | 8 knots /                        | Turbulence Type<br>Forecast/Actual:     | /                |
| Wind Direction:                  | 60°                              | Turbulence Severity<br>Forecast/Actual: | /                |
| Altimeter Setting:               | 30.04 inches Hg                  | Temperature/Dew Point:                  | 22°C / 9°C       |
| Precipitation and Obscuration:   | No Obscuration; No Precipitation |   |                  |
| Departure Point:                 | Houston, TX (LVJ )               | Type of Flight Plan Filed:              | None             |
| Destination:                     | (LVJ )                           | Type of Clearance:                      | Traffic advisory |
| Departure Time:                  | 11:30 Local                      | Type of Airspace:                       | Class E          |

### **Airport Information**

| Airport:             | Clover Field LVJ | Runway Surface Type:      | Asphalt                         |
|----------------------|------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Airport Elevation:   | 43 ft msl        | Runway Surface Condition: | Dry                             |
| Runway Used:         | 14R              | IFR Approach:             | Unknown                         |
| Runway Length/Width: | 4302 ft / 70 ft  | VFR Approach/Landing:     | Touch and go;Traffic<br>pattern |

## Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries:         | 1 Serious | Aircraft Damage:        | Substantial              |
|------------------------|-----------|-------------------------|--------------------------|
| Passenger<br>Injuries: |           | Aircraft Fire:          | None                     |
| Ground Injuries:       | N/A       | Aircraft Explosion:     | None                     |
| Total Injuries:        | 1 Serious | Latitude,<br>Longitude: | 29.609762,-95.11943(est) |

#### **Administrative Information**

| Investigator In Charge (IIC):        | Ragogna, Jason  |
|--------------------------------------|---|
| Additional Participating<br>Persons: | James D Moore; Federal Aviation Administration; Houston, TX |
| Original Publish Date:               | July 30, 2001   |
| Last Revision Date:                  |   |
| Investigation Class:                 | <u>Class</u>  |
| Note:                                | The NTSB traveled to the scene of this accident.            |
| Investigation Docket:                | https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=51903                |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available <u>here</u>.