



# Aviation Investigation Final Report

<b>Location:</b>	HUNTINGBURG, Indiana	<b>Accident Number:</b>	CHI01LA050
<b>Date &amp; Time:</b>	December 18, 2000, 18:15 Local	<b>Registration:</b>	N4558S
<b>Aircraft:</b>	Beech 58	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Defining Event:</b>		<b>Injuries:</b>	3 None
<b>Flight Conducted Under:</b>	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

## Analysis

The airplane landed 15 feet short of runway 09 following a go-around from an instrument approach. The pilot initiated a go-around when a snowplow entered the runway. The pilot reported that he made two position reports on the UNICOM frequency. The first report was 30 miles or 15 minutes from the airport and the second was 1 to 1-1/2 miles during the final approach. The driver of the snowplow reported only hearing the 15-minute call and heard a second transmission while the airplane was flying over him. The pilot stated that the airplane 'mushed' when power was reduced in an attempt to land on the 'numbers'. The pilot had the trailing edge flaps retracted. The pilot also stated that the windshield deice was working while en route but was not functioning during the approach. Approximately 1/2 of the windshield was contaminated by ice. A notice to airman indicated that braking action was poor with 0.25 inches of snow.

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The proper touchdown point not obtained/maintained by the pilot. Factors were the snow covered runway, the ice contaminated windshield, and the airport snow removal performed by the driver of the vehicle.

## Findings

Occurrence #1: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER  
Phase of Operation: APPROACH - FAF/OUTER MARKER TO THRESHOLD (IFR)

#### Findings

1. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - SNOW
2. (C) PROPER TOUCHDOWN POINT - NOT OBTAINED/MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND
3. (F) WINDOW, FLIGHT COMPARTMENT WINDOW/WINDSHIELD - CONTAMINATION
4. (F) AIRPORT SNOW REMOVAL - PERFORMED - DRIVER OF VEHICLE

## Factual Information

On December 18, 2000, at 1815 eastern standard time, a Beech 58, N4558S, piloted by a commercial pilot, landed short of runway 09 (5,000 feet by 75 feet, snow/grooved asphalt) at the Huntingburg Airport (HNB), Huntingburg, Indiana. Night instrument meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The 14 CFR Part 91 personal flight was operating on an instrument flight rules flight plan. The pilot, two passengers and dog received no injuries. The flight departed from the Page Field Airport, Fort Myers, Florida, at 1325, en route to HNB.

The pilot reported the following in a written statement:

"The flight was a normal IFR flight. VFR through Georgia. Mid Tenn. instrument flight. Started picking up light rime. Talked with flight watch. Got update weather - some light rime. Asked for lower. Got above freezing. Boots [and] deice equipment working fine. Upon descending picked up more ice - boots, props fine. Windshield froze up right side. Alcohol windshield worked on pilot side - did not take off right window. [Talked] with Evansville [approach] told to expect VOR 9 Huntingburg. Talked with Huntingburg told them we were about 15 [minutes] out. Flew VOR 9 [approach] to Huntingburg. Broke out over Holland [Indiana]. Had the airport [at] 5 miles clear [and] cold [at] 1500 feet. Started picking up a little precip. No problem. Up on arr airport I was about 1 1/2 started to call in. Saw movement on taxiway. At 1/2 mile out tractor with snow plow pulled out on [runway] - I started a missed [approach] t/w Evansville [approach] told them I could do a go around. (Circle to land). At about 12-1300 feet pick up more ice on windshield. I still had good vision. But [finding] the alcohol bottles would not work. I set up on final. Had the runway made and decreased power and touched down 15 feet short of center line. Wheels landed on wet ground [and] caught the edge of runway. Mains broke off. Flew down the runway landed. Skid down [runway] and off the side. Shut [aircraft] down - everyone exited their door. No injuries."

"There are several things I could have done..."

1. I could have stayed in Florida...
2. I could have gone to Evansville with a tower and ILS.
3. When the tractor pulled out I should have done a full missed approach, and not let myself get rushed, with the windshield and vision.
4. I should have carried more power instead of trying to land for a long roll out. I was trying to use as much runway for the roll out as ...the braking action was only fair.
5. This was my decision and it was not the best decision. ..."

The pilot reported that ice had accumulated on the windshield of the airplane when the airplane's windshield deice system stopped functioning during approach to the airport. He stated that the windshield's viewable area was 1/3, maybe 1/2, of the windshield. He stated that the airplane "mushed" on his second landing attempt when he decreased power so as to

land on the "numbers". He stated that he was landing with the flaps retracted at an approach speed of 110 knots and did not go below "blue line".

HNB was served by four nonprecision instrument approaches, which include the VOR runway 9 approach. Runway 09 was equipped with a precision approach path indicator, medium intensity runway edge lights and runway end identifier lights. The UNICOM frequency was the common traffic advisory frequency for the airport.

The Airman Information Manual states under, Unicom Communications Procedures, "(d) Report approximately 10 miles from the airport, reporting altitude, and state your aircraft type, aircraft identification, location relative to the airport, state whether landing or overflight, and request wind information and runway in use. (e) Report on downwind, base, and final approach."

The driver of the snowplow stated that he made a "swipe" on the runway when he heard a "15-minute call" from an aircraft. At this point, he was at the end of the runway when he pulled onto the taxiway. The driver stated that he did not hear any additional radio transmissions while holding short of the runway. He contacted the terminal to confirm that there were no additional radio transmissions prior to his taxiing onto the runway. Personnel within the terminal reported that they had not heard any additional radio transmissions. He stated that prior to taxiing onto the runway, he did not see any traffic when he "glanced", but did not "look", for traffic on approach for runway 09. He did not make any radio transmissions when he taxied onto the runway. While on the runway, he heard an aircraft fly overhead and a radio transmission saying, "get that thing off the runway".

According to the airport manager, all the vehicles are equipped with two-way radios and lights. The strobe lights on the snowplow were on during plowing.

At 1540 a notices to airman (NOTAM) was issued for 1/4 inch snow and poor braking action. At 1831 a second NOTAM was issued for closure of the airport.

## Pilot Information

<b>Certificate:</b>	Commercial	<b>Age:</b>	56, Male
<b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>	Multi-engine land	<b>Seat Occupied:</b>	Left
<b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Restraint Used:</b>	
<b>Instrument Rating(s):</b>	Airplane	<b>Second Pilot Present:</b>	Yes
<b>Instructor Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Toxicology Performed:</b>	No
<b>Medical Certification:</b>	Class 2 Valid Medical-w/ waivers/lim	<b>Last FAA Medical Exam:</b>	August 30, 2000
<b>Occupational Pilot:</b>	UNK	<b>Last Flight Review or Equivalent:</b>	
<b>Flight Time:</b>	1084 hours (Total, all aircraft), 29 hours (Total, this make and model), 824 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft)		

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

<b>Aircraft Make:</b>	Beech	<b>Registration:</b>	N4558S
<b>Model/Series:</b>	58 58	<b>Aircraft Category:</b>	Airplane
<b>Year of Manufacture:</b>		<b>Amateur Built:</b>	
<b>Airworthiness Certificate:</b>	Normal	<b>Serial Number:</b>	TH-680
<b>Landing Gear Type:</b>	Retractable - Tricycle	<b>Seats:</b>	6
<b>Date/Type of Last Inspection:</b>	September 18, 2000 Annual	<b>Certified Max Gross Wt.:</b>	5424 lbs
<b>Time Since Last Inspection:</b>	20 Hrs	<b>Engines:</b>	2 Reciprocating
<b>Airframe Total Time:</b>	3521 Hrs	<b>Engine Manufacturer:</b>	Continental
<b>ELT:</b>	Installed	<b>Engine Model/Series:</b>	IO-520-C7B
<b>Registered Owner:</b>	FREDRICK L. SOUDERS	<b>Rated Power:</b>	285 Horsepower
<b>Operator:</b>		<b>Operating Certificate(s) Held:</b>	None
<b>Operator Does Business As:</b>		<b>Operator Designator Code:</b>	

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

<b>Conditions at Accident Site:</b>	Instrument (IMC)	<b>Condition of Light:</b>	Night/dark
<b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b>	HNB ,529 ft msl	<b>Distance from Accident Site:</b>	
<b>Observation Time:</b>	18:15 Local	<b>Direction from Accident Site:</b>	
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Clear	<b>Visibility</b>	
<b>Lowest Ceiling:</b>	Overcast / 1400 ft AGL	<b>Visibility (RVR):</b>	
<b>Wind Speed/Gusts:</b>	12 knots /	<b>Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Wind Direction:</b>	190°	<b>Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:</b>	/
<b>Altimeter Setting:</b>	29 inches Hg	<b>Temperature/Dew Point:</b>	-3°C / -3°C
<b>Precipitation and Obscuration:</b>			
<b>Departure Point:</b>	FORT MEYERS , FL (FMY )	<b>Type of Flight Plan Filed:</b>	IFR
<b>Destination:</b>	(HNB )	<b>Type of Clearance:</b>	IFR
<b>Departure Time:</b>	13:25 Local	<b>Type of Airspace:</b>	Class G

## Airport Information

<b>Airport:</b>	HUNTINGBURG HNB	<b>Runway Surface Type:</b>	Asphalt
<b>Airport Elevation:</b>	529 ft msl	<b>Runway Surface Condition:</b>	Snow
<b>Runway Used:</b>	9	<b>IFR Approach:</b>	VOR/DME
<b>Runway Length/Width:</b>	5000 ft / 75 ft	<b>VFR Approach/Landing:</b>	Full stop;Go around;Traffic pattern

## Wreckage and Impact Information

<b>Crew Injuries:</b>	1 None	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Passenger Injuries:</b>	2 None	<b>Aircraft Fire:</b>	None
<b>Ground Injuries:</b>	N/A	<b>Aircraft Explosion:</b>	None
<b>Total Injuries:</b>	3 None	<b>Latitude, Longitude:</b>	38.290275,-86.94947(est)

## Administrative Information

<b>Investigator In Charge (IIC):</b>	Gallo, Mitchell
<b>Additional Participating Persons:</b>	GEORGE M BALLARD; INDIANAPOLIS , IN
<b>Original Publish Date:</b>	November 6, 2001
<b>Last Revision Date:</b>	
<b>Investigation Class:</b>	<a href="#">Class</a>
<b>Note:</b>	The NTSB traveled to the scene of this accident.
<b>Investigation Docket:</b>	<a href="https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=50845">https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=50845</a>

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).