

Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location: GULFPORT, Mississippi **Accident Number:** MIA00LA272

Date & Time: September 26, 2000, 19:00 Local Registration: N9713R

Aircraft: Beech 95-55 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

Defining Event: 2 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Instructional

Analysis

The flight had completed an ILS approach to runway 36, with a simulated engine out, but did not touch down. The airplane was on final approach when both engines lost power. The CFI said as we turned onto left downwind for runway 36, '...I set zero thrust with the [left] throttle and prop control. About mid field the right engine began to lose power. I turned on both boost pumps and pushed both props and throttles forward. The left engine surged a couple of times but could not produce power. The right engine did not respond...we turned towards the airport...I switched to aux on the fuel tanks and tried to restart to no avail...switched back to mains to no avail. At this time we were about 400 feet agl and realized we would not make the airport. We turned north to land on highway 49...shortly after touchdown the right wing tip hit a light post. We spun around and came to a stop....' Inspection of the wreckage revealed sufficient fuel. Investigators verified flight control continuity, continuity of the fuel system in all positions, the boost pumps worked, and the vents were clear. Both engines were removed from the airplane to facility test runs of the engines, both engines ran, and no discrepancies were found.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: a loss of power on both engines, during a simulated engine out approach, resulting in a forced landing and the subsequent on ground impact with a pole.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER

Phase of Operation: APPROACH - VFR PATTERN - FINAL APPROACH

Findings

1. 2 ENGINES - UNDETERMINED

2. (C) AIRCRAFT CONTROL - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

Occurrence #3: ON GROUND/WATER COLLISION WITH OBJECT

Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

Findings

3. OBJECT - POLE

Page 2 of 7 MIA00LA272

Factual Information

On September 26, 2000, about 1900 central daylight time, a Beech 95-55, N9713R, owned by a private individual, impacted with a pole during a forced landing near Gulfport, Mississippi. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time, and no flight plan was filed for the 14 CFR Part 91 training flight. The airplane was substantially damaged. The airline transport-rated/certified flight instructor (CFI) pilot and private-rated dual student pilot reported no injuries. The flight had departed at 1800.

The flight had completed an ILS approach to runway 32, and a simulated engine out, but did not touch down. According to the CFI's statement, "...at 2,000 feet we were level and waiting for vectors to intercept the localizer; we completed the before landing checklist and switched back to main tanks. All indications were normal. Upon localizer intercept I pulled the left throttle to idle. My student made the proper adjustments...I then set zero thrust setting for left engine. Upon missed approach, I returned use of the left engine to my student. We were climbing...and [I] told ATC we would like to make a visual approach to a full stop...as we turned onto left downwind for [runway] 36, I again pulled the left throttle to idle...my student reacted correctly...I set zero thrust with the throttle and prop control. About mid field the right engine began to lose power. I turned on both boost pumps and pushed both props and throttles forward. The left engine surged a couple of times but could not produce power. The right engine did not respond. I immediately told my student to turn towards the airport while I evaluated the situation. I switched to aux on the fuel tanks and tried to restart to no avail. I then switched back to mains to no avail. At this time we were about 400 feet agl and realized we would not make the airport. We turned north to land on highway 49...shortly after touchdown the right wing tip hit a light post. We spun around and came to a stop...."

Inspection of the wreckage revealed that there was 22 gallons of fuel found in the left main tank, and 20 gallons of fuel in the right main tank. The fuel selector for the left engine was found selected to main tank. The fuel selector for the right engine was found selected to the main tank.

According to the FAA inspector's statement, "...we verified that there was flight control continuity...continuity of the fuel system in all positions...the boost pumps worked, [and the vents were clear...the following items were noted...the right intake manifold had a hole the size of a quarter...not caused by impact...the stops on the right fuel selector did not perform their intended function...the mixture control was warn and loose on the left engine...plugs on left engine were dark with soot."

Both engines were removed from the airplane and taken to Continental Motor's facilities, Mobile, Alabama, to facility test runs of the engine. Both engines were run under the supervision of the FAA for the NTSB, on October 4-5, 2000.

Page 3 of 7 MIA00LA272

The FAA report reference the engine runs revealed that, "...both engines ran...[the CFI] had asked the question, 'what would happen if an engine is at idle and the boost pump was turned on?" We confirmed that the left engine's rpm would be significantly reduced with the boost pumps on and the engine at idle...the right engine ran with the hole in the intake manifold throughout the range of the engine. We could not simulate the effect of the pressure differences around the engine during flight since there was not a cowling on the engine. The effect of the hole in the manifold could not be determined conclusively. We could not duplicate the effects, if any, the constant speed propeller might have in flight...I was present for the...examination of the right...and left...engines...I have read the report from Teledyne Continental Motors [TCM]...I concur with the finding that are contained in the report. (See the TCM and FAA inspector's report, attachments to this report).

According to the air traffic control (ATC) transcript of voice recordings, the flight was cleared to land at 1901:27.

At 1901:56, the local control (LC) called the pilot of N9713R, and said, "...you appeared to have lined up with the old closed runway sir that is not runway three six break off to the right." The pilot answered, "...we have an emergency we lost pitch and power...." The flight was then cleared to land on any runway.

At 1902:16, the LC asked, "...are you going to be able to make the airport," and the pilot answered, "negative."

Between 1902:24, and 1902:30, the pilot's microphone was open and the following was transmitted, "...Cheryl your airplane...pull the power back pull the power back...pull the power back...(unintelligible)."

The airplane and engines were released to Mr. Thomas Cook, Insurance Adjuster, representing the owner's insurance company, on October 6, 2000.

Page 4 of 7 MIA00LA272

Pilot Information

| Certificate: | Airline transport; Flight instructor | Age: | 31,Female |
|---------------------------|---|-----------------------------------|--------------|
| Airplane Rating(s): | Single-engine land; Multi-engine land | Seat Occupied: | Right |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None | Restraint Used: | |
| Instrument Rating(s): | Airplane | Second Pilot Present: | Yes |
| Instructor Rating(s): | Airplane multi-engine; Airplane single-engine; Instrument airplane | Toxicology Performed: | No |
| Medical Certification: | Class 1 Valid Medicalno waivers/lim. | Last FAA Medical Exam: | May 30, 2000 |
| Occupational Pilot: | Yes | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | |
| Flight Time: | 3900 hours (Total, all aircraft), 105 hours (Total, this make and model), 3525 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 260 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 85 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 8 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft) | | |

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

| Aircraft Make: | Beech | Registration: | N9713R |
|-------------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------|
| Model/Series: | 95-55 95-55 | Aircraft Category: | Airplane |
| Year of Manufacture: | | Amateur Built: | |
| Airworthiness Certificate: | Normal | Serial Number: | TC-17 |
| Landing Gear Type: | Retractable - Tricycle | Seats: | 5 |
| Date/Type of Last Inspection: | July 30, 2000 Annual | Certified Max Gross Wt.: | 5300 lbs |
| Time Since Last Inspection: | 8 Hrs | Engines: | 2 Reciprocating |
| Airframe Total Time: | 2770 Hrs | Engine Manufacturer: | Continental |
| ELT: | Installed, not activated | Engine Model/Series: | IO-470L |
| Registered Owner: | MICHAEL P. COURSEY | Rated Power: | 260 Horsepower |
| Operator: | | Operating Certificate(s) Held: | None |
| Operator Does Business As: | | Operator Designator Code: | |
| | | | |

Page 5 of 7 MIA00LA272

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site: | Visual (VMC) | Condition of Light: | Day |
|----------------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------------------------|------------------|
| Observation Facility, Elevation: | GPT ,28 ft msl | Distance from Accident Site: | 1 Nautical Miles |
| Observation Time: | 19:10 Local | Direction from Accident Site: | 360° |
| Lowest Cloud Condition: | Clear | Visibility | 10 miles |
| Lowest Ceiling: | None | Visibility (RVR): | |
| Wind Speed/Gusts: | 10 knots / | Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual: | / |
| Wind Direction: | 10° | Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual: | / |
| Altimeter Setting: | 30 inches Hg | Temperature/Dew Point: | 18°C / 11°C |
| Precipitation and Obscuration: | No Obscuration; No Precipita | ation | |
| Departure Point: | | Type of Flight Plan Filed: | None |
| Destination: | | Type of Clearance: | None |
| Departure Time: | 18:00 Local | Type of Airspace: | |

Airport Information

| Airport: | GULFPORT-BILOXI REGIONAL GPT | Runway Surface Type: | Asphalt |
|----------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------------|
| Airport Elevation: | 28 ft msl | Runway Surface Condition: | Dry |
| Runway Used: | 36 | IFR Approach: | Visual |
| Runway Length/Width: | 4950 ft / 150 ft | VFR Approach/Landing: | Forced landing;Full stop |

Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries: | 2 None | Aircraft Damage: | Substantial |
|------------------------|--------|-------------------------|--------------------------|
| Passenger Injuries: | | Aircraft Fire: | None |
| Ground Injuries: | N/A | Aircraft Explosion: | None |
| Total Injuries: | 2 None | Latitude, Longitude: | 30.38022,-89.100509(est) |

Page 6 of 7 MIA00LA272

Administrative Information

| Investigator In Charge (IIC): | Yurman, Alan | |
|-----------------------------------|--|--|
| Additional Participating Persons: | DOUGLAS SMYLEY; JACKSON , MS | |
| Original Publish Date: | May 8, 2001 | |
| Last Revision Date: | | |
| Investigation Class: | <u>Class</u> | |
| Note: | The NTSB traveled to the scene of this accident. | |
| Investigation Docket: | https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=50350 | |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 7 of 7 MIA00LA272