



# **Aviation Investigation Final Report**

Location: WEST MILFORD, New Jersey Accident Number: NYC00LA218

Date & Time: August 6, 2000, 11:30 Local Registration: N58TZ

Aircraft: Beech BE-58 Aircraft Damage: Substantial

**Defining Event:** 2 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General aviation - Personal

### **Analysis**

After completing a practice VOR approach, the pilot circled to land. The airplane landed on centerline, with the nose cocked 40 to 45 degrees to the left. The left main landing gear tire blew, and the airplane veered off the left side of the runway, and into a parked airplane.

### **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's failure to maintain directional control during the landing flare and touchdown, which resulted in a blown tire, and a continued loss of directional control during the landing roll.

#### **Findings**

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF CONTROL - ON GROUND/WATER Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

#### Findings

1. (C) DIRECTIONAL CONTROL - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND

2. LANDING GEAR, TIRE - RUPTURED

Occurrence #2: LOSS OF CONTROL - ON GROUND/WATER

Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

#### **Findings**

3. DIRECTIONAL CONTROL - NOT POSSIBLE

-----

Occurrence #3: ON GROUND/WATER COLLISION WITH OBJECT Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

Findings
4. OBJECT - AIRCRAFT PARKED/STANDING

Page 2 of 6 NYC00LA218

#### **Factual Information**

On August 6, 2000, about 1130 Eastern Daylight Time, a Beech BE-58, N58TZ, was substantially damaged during a landing at Greenwood Lake Airport (4N1), West Milford, New Jersey. The certificated private pilot and the commercial pilot were not injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. No flight plan had been filed for the flight, between Essex County Airport (CDW), Caldwell, New Jersey, and West Milford. The personal flight was conducted under 14 CFR Part 91.

The private pilot stated that she was in the left seat, and the commercial pilot was in the right seat, acting as a safety observer. The private pilot flew a full, practice VOR RWY 6 approach to the airport. Since the active runway was Runway 24 at the time, she broke off the approach close to the field, and flew a left, visual pattern. On final approach, the airplane was "on glideslope, lined up with the centerline, and my airspeed at blue line. On short final, the air became 'squirrely'," so she used rudder pedals to maintain centerline. As the airplane crossed the runway threshold, the pilot reduced power to idle. "The landing appeared a little hard," and unknown to the pilot at the time, the airplane's left main tire had blown. The pilot attempted to keep the airplane on the runway, but it veered off the left side, and struck a Cessna 182RG which was tied down in a parking space.

According to a witness who was in his airplane at the hold short line at the time, the accident airplane made "s-turns" on the final approach Runway 24. "About 60 feet from the numbers, the aircraft pitched up, in what appeared to be an effort to flare the aircraft, estimated at 9 feet above the ground." The airplane then hit the ground on a 40- to 45-degree angle to the centerline, "so hard that it raised the dirt from the runway." The airplane bounced, and then landed with the left wheel on the grass and the right wheel on the runway. It veered to the left, and came to rest against a parked airplane.

The private pilot stated that she had about 404 hours of total flight time, with 28 hours in make and model. The commercial pilot-safety observer had about 556 hours of total flight time, with about 64 hours in make and model. The airplane was not equipped with right seat brakes.

Winds, recorded at an airport approximately 40 nautical miles to the south, about 15 minutes after the accident, were from 220 degrees true, at 8 knots.

Page 3 of 6 NYC00LA218

### **Pilot Information**

Certificate:	Private	Age:	43,Female
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land; Multi-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medicalno waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	February 15, 2000
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	404 hours (Total, all aircraft), 28 hours (Total, this make and model), 226 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 19 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 3 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

## **Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information**

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N58TZ
Model/Series:	BE-58 BE-58	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	TH-1758
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	March 3, 2000 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	5500 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	93 Hrs	Engines:	2 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	670 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-550
Registered Owner:	SHARON L. SINGER	Rated Power:	300 Horsepower
Operator:	OQR AVIATION	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Page 4 of 6 NYC00LA218

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	MMU ,187 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	40 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	11:45 Local	Direction from Accident Site:	200°
<b>Lowest Cloud Condition:</b>	Unknown	Visibility	7 miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 15000 ft AGL	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	8 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	220°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	24°C / 18°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipita	ation	
Departure Point:	CALDWELL , NJ (CDW)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	(4N1)	Type of Clearance:	
Departure Time:	11:00 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

## **Airport Information**

Airport:	GREENWOOD LAKE AIRPORT 4N1	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	791 ft msl	<b>Runway Surface Condition:</b>	Dry
Runway Used:	24	IFR Approach:	Circling;Practice;VOR
Runway Length/Width:	4000 ft / 60 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full stop;Traffic pattern

## Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	

Page 5 of 6 NYC00LA218

#### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Cox, Paul	
Additional Participating Persons:	ANTHONY A ACOSTA; TETERBORO , NJ	
Original Publish Date:	March 9, 2001	
Last Revision Date:		
Investigation Class:	<u>Class</u>	
Note:	The NTSB traveled to the scene of this accident.	
Investigation Docket:	https://data.ntsb.gov/Docket?ProjectID=49903	

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, "accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person" (Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB's statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 United States Code section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 United States Code section 1154(b) is available here.

Page 6 of 6 NYC00LA218