



Aviation Investigation Final Report

Location:	CARTHAGE, New York	Accident Number:	NYC00LA197
Date & Time:	July 12, 2000, 17:10 Local	Registration:	N58741
Aircraft:	Fairchild M-62C	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 Minor
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General aviation - Personal		

Analysis

Prior to departure, the pilot was briefed by the airport owner about either departing into the wind, with a tree line at the end of the runway, or departing downwind, with no obstacles beyond the end of the runway. The pilot elected to depart into the wind. The pilot reported the airplane became airborne on the runway, but it could not climb over the trees at the departure end of the runway. The pilot then turned toward a low area in the tree line, struck some trees, and came to rest beyond the trees, in a parking lot between two buildings. Witnesses reported that the grass on the runway was at least 3 inches high, and possibly higher.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the pilot's improper decision to depart with obstacles ahead which exceeded the climb capability of the airplane. Factors were the grass runway, and trees at the departure end of the runway.

Findings

Occurrence #1: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT
Phase of Operation: TAKEOFF - INITIAL CLIMB

Findings

1. (F) AIRPORT FACILITIES, RUNWAY/LANDING AREA CONDITION - GRASS
2. (C) PREFLIGHT PLANNING/PREPARATION - IMPROPER - PILOT IN COMMAND

Occurrence #2: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT
Phase of Operation: TAKEOFF - INITIAL CLIMB

Findings

3. (F) OBJECT - TREE(S)

Factual Information

On July 12, 2000, about 1710 Eastern Daylight Time, a Fairchild M-62C (PT-23), N58741, was substantially damaged while departing a private, non-designated airport in Carthage, New York. The certificated private pilot received serious injuries, and the pilot rated passenger received minor injuries. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed for the personal flight. No flight plan had been filed for the flight that was conducted under 14 CFR Part 91.

According to the pilot, he had landed earlier in the day at the airport. The airplane was serviced and he offered a ride to the passenger, which was accepted.

The pilot reported the takeoff was initiated with him sitting in the rear cockpit, and the passenger in the forward cockpit. Trees, about 50 feet high were located on the departure end of the runway. The pilot reported that after the airplane became airborne, there was insufficient room to accelerate to the optimum climb speed of 80 mph, and climb above the trees. The pilot then aimed the airplane for a low spot in the trees. The airplane struck trees, and came to rest in a parking lot between two buildings beyond the trees. Both wings and the engine separated from the fuselage.

The pilot reported that he had operated out of the airport several times with a Cessna 172 with no problems. When asked about the grass, he reported he thought it was about 4 to 5 inches long. The pilot reported the winds were from 270 degrees to 290 degrees at 4 to 5 knots.

The owner of the airport was the passenger. He reported the east/west turf runway was about 2,600 feet long and 300 feet wide. He thought the grass was about 3 inches high. Trees about 50 feet high were located on the west-end of the runway. Due to the trees, most flights land to the west toward the trees, and depart to the east, even with a tailwind, because there are no obstacles to clear. He said he mentioned this to the pilot who elected to depart to the west, over the trees. He reported the winds were from the northwest at 5 knots. The passenger also reported that when he saw they would not clear the trees, he also placed his hands on the flight controls along with the pilot.

Both pilots reported a wind of about 5 knots from the northwest. The closest weather reporting was Wheeler-Sack AAF, Fort Drum, New York, located 7 nautical miles northwest of the departure airport. At 1655, they reported winds from 020 degrees at 8 knots.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	41, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine land	Seat Occupied:	Rear
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medical-w/ waivers/lim	Last FAA Medical Exam:	June 22, 1999
Occupational Pilot:	UNK	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	348 hours (Total, all aircraft), 38 hours (Total, this make and model), 311 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 38 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 38 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Fairchild	Registration:	N58741
Model/Series:	M-62C M-62C	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	247621
Landing Gear Type:	Tailwheel	Seats:	2
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	June 1, 2000 Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2670 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	50 Hrs	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2388 Hrs	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	W6TO-6A
Registered Owner:	JOHN S. ALEXANDER	Rated Power:	220 Horsepower
Operator:		Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None
Operator Does Business As:		Operator Designator Code:	

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual (VMC)	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:		Distance from Accident Site:	
Observation Time:		Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Visibility	
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	5 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	320°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	(NONE)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:		Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	17:10 Local	Type of Airspace:	Class G

Airport Information

Airport:	CARTHAGE NONE	Runway Surface Type:	Grass/turf
Airport Elevation:	750 ft msl	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	27	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	2600 ft / 300 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	None

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 Minor	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:		Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 Minor	Latitude, Longitude:	43.980854,-75.600433(est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Hancock, Robert
Additional Participating Persons:	MIKE MAHAN; ALBANY , NY
Original Publish Date:	March 2, 2001
Last Revision Date:	
Investigation Class:	Class
Note:	The NTSB traveled to the scene of this accident.
Investigation Docket:	https://data.nts.gov/Docket?ProjectID=49686

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB) is an independent federal agency charged by Congress with investigating every civil aviation accident in the United States and significant events in other modes of transportation—railroad, transit, highway, marine, pipeline, and commercial space. We determine the probable causes of the accidents and events we investigate, and issue safety recommendations aimed at preventing future occurrences. In addition, we conduct transportation safety research studies and offer information and other assistance to family members and survivors for each accident or event we investigate. We also serve as the appellate authority for enforcement actions involving aviation and mariner certificates issued by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and US Coast Guard, and we adjudicate appeals of civil penalty actions taken by the FAA.

The NTSB does not assign fault or blame for an accident or incident; rather, as specified by NTSB regulation, “accident/incident investigations are fact-finding proceedings with no formal issues and no adverse parties ... and are not conducted for the purpose of determining the rights or liabilities of any person” (Title 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* section 831.4). Assignment of fault or legal liability is not relevant to the NTSB’s statutory mission to improve transportation safety by investigating accidents and incidents and issuing safety recommendations. In addition, statutory language prohibits the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report (Title 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b)). A factual report that may be admissible under 49 *United States Code* section 1154(b) is available [here](#).